## 107TH CONGRESS 2D SESSION

# S. 2793

To improve patient access to health care services and provide improved medical care by reducing the excessive burden the liability system places on the health care delivery system.

# IN THE SENATE OF THE UNITED STATES

July 25, 2002

Mr. Ensign introduced the following bill; which was read twice and referred to the Committee on the Judiciary

# A BILL

To improve patient access to health care services and provide improved medical care by reducing the excessive burden the liability system places on the health care delivery system.

- 1 Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representa-
- 2 tives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,
- 3 SECTION 1. SHORT TITLE.
- 4 This Act may be cited as the "Help Efficient, Acces-
- 5 sible, Low Cost, Timely Health Care (HEALTH) Act of
- 6 2002".
- 7 SEC. 2. FINDINGS AND PURPOSE.
- 8 (a) FINDINGS.—

- (1) Effect on health care access and costs.—Congress finds that our current civil justice system is adversely affecting patient access to health care services, better patient care, and cost-efficient health care, in that the health care liability system is a costly and ineffective mechanism for resolving claims of health care liability and compensating injured patients, and is a deterrent to the sharing of information among health care professionals which impedes efforts to improve patient safety and quality of care.
  - (2) Effect on interstate commerce.—
    Congress finds that the health care and insurance industries are industries affecting interstate commerce and the health care liability litigation systems existing throughout the United States are activities that affect interstate commerce by contributing to the high costs of health care and premiums for health care liability insurance purchased by health care system providers.
  - (3) Effect on federal spending.—Congress finds that the health care liability litigation systems existing throughout the United States have a significant effect on the amount, distribution, and use of Federal funds because of—

1	(A) the large number of individuals who
2	receive health care benefits under programs op-
3	erated or financed by the Federal Government;
4	(B) the large number of individuals who
5	benefit because of the exclusion from Federal
6	taxes of the amounts spent to provide them
7	with health insurance benefits; and
8	(C) the large number of health care pro-
9	viders who provide items or services for which
10	the Federal Government makes payments.
11	(b) Purpose.—It is the purpose of this Act to imple-
12	ment reasonable, comprehensive, and effective health care
13	liability reforms designed to—
14	(1) improve the availability of health care serv-
15	ices in cases in which health care liability actions
16	have been shown to be a factor in the decreased
17	availability of services;
18	(2) reduce the incidence of "defensive medi-
19	cine" and lower the cost of health care liability in-
20	surance, all of which contribute to the escalation of
21	health care costs;
22	(3) ensure that persons with meritorious health
23	care injury claims receive fair and adequate com-
24	pensation, including reasonable noneconomic dam-
25	ages;

- 1 (4) improve the fairness and cost-effectiveness 2 of our current health care liability system to resolve 3 disputes over, and provide compensation for, health 4 care liability by reducing uncertainty in the amount 5 of compensation provided to injured individuals; and
- (5) provide an increased sharing of information
   in the health care system which will reduce unin tended injury and improve patient care.

#### 9 SEC. 3. ENCOURAGING SPEEDY RESOLUTION OF CLAIMS.

10 A health care lawsuit may be commenced no later than 3 years after the date of injury or 1 year after the 11 12 claimant discovers, or through the use of reasonable diligence should have discovered, the injury, whichever occurs first. In no event shall the time for commencement of a 14 health care lawsuit exceed 3 years, except that in the case of an alleged injury sustained by a minor before the age 16 of 6, a health care lawsuit may be commenced by or on behalf of the minor until the later of 3 years from the 18 19 date of injury, or the date on which the minor attains the 20 age of 8.

#### 21 SEC. 4. COMPENSATING PATIENT INJURY.

- 22 (a) Unlimited Amount of Damages for Actual
- 23 Economic Losses in Health Care Lawsuits.—In any
- 24 health care lawsuit, the full amount of a claimant's eco-
- 25 nomic loss may be fully recovered without limitation.

- 1 (b) Additional Noneconomic Damages.—In any
- 2 health care lawsuit, the amount of noneconomic damages
- 3 recovered may be as much as \$250,000, regardless of the
- 4 number of parties against whom the action is brought or
- 5 the number of separate claims or actions brought with re-
- 6 spect to the same occurrence.
- 7 (c) No Discount of Award for Noneconomic
- 8 Damages.—In any health care lawsuit, an award for fu-
- 9 ture noneconomic damages shall not be discounted to
- 10 present value. The jury shall not be informed about the
- 11 maximum award for noneconomic damages. An award for
- 12 noneconomic damages in excess of \$250,000 shall be re-
- 13 duced either before the entry of judgment, or by amend-
- 14 ment of the judgment after entry of judgment, and such
- 15 reduction shall be made before accounting for any other
- 16 reduction in damages required by law. If separate awards
- 17 are rendered for past and future noneconomic damages
- 18 and the combined awards exceed \$250,000, the future
- 19 noneconomic damages shall be reduced first.
- 20 (d) Fair Share Rule.—In any health care lawsuit,
- 21 each party shall be liable for that party's several share
- 22 of any damages only and not for the share of any other
- 23 person. Each party shall be liable only for the amount of
- 24 damages allocated to such party in direct proportion to
- 25 such party's percentage of responsibility. A separate judg-

- 1 ment shall be rendered against each such party for the
- 2 amount allocated to such party. For purposes of this sec-
- 3 tion, the trier of fact shall determine the proportion of
- 4 responsibility of each party for the claimant's harm.

#### 5 SEC. 5. MAXIMIZING PATIENT RECOVERY.

- 6 (a) Court Supervision of Share of Damages
- 7 ACTUALLY PAID TO CLAIMANTS.—In any health care law-
- 8 suit, the court shall supervise the arrangements for pay-
- 9 ment of damages to protect against conflicts of interest
- 10 that may have the effect of reducing the amount of dam-
- 11 ages awarded that are actually paid to claimants. In par-
- 12 ticular, in any health care lawsuit in which the attorney
- 13 for a party claims a financial stake in the outcome by vir-
- 14 tue of a contingent fee, the court shall have the power
- 15 to restrict the payment of a claimant's damage recovery
- 16 to such attorney, and to redirect such damages to the
- 17 claimant based upon the interests of justice and principles
- 18 of equity. In no event shall the total of all contingent fees
- 19 for representing all claimants in a health care lawsuit ex-
- 20 ceed the following limits:
- 21 (1) 40 percent of the first \$50,000 recovered by
- the claimant(s).
- 23 (2)  $33\frac{1}{3}$  percent of the next \$50,000 recovered
- by the claimant(s).

- 1 (3) 25 percent of the next \$500,000 recovered 2 by the claimant(s).
- 3 (4) 15 percent of any amount by which the re-4 covery by the claimant(s) is in excess of \$600,000.
- 5 (b) APPLICABILITY.—The limitations in this section
- 6 shall apply whether the recovery is by judgment, settle-
- 7 ment, mediation, arbitration, or any other form of alter-
- 8 native dispute resolution. In a health care lawsuit involv-
- 9 ing a minor or incompetent person, a court retains the
- 10 authority to authorize or approve a fee that is less than
- 11 the maximum permitted under this section.

## 12 SEC. 6. ADDITIONAL HEALTH BENEFITS.

- In any health care lawsuit, any party may introduce
- 14 evidence of collateral source benefits. If a party elects to
- 15 introduce such evidence, any opposing party may intro-
- 16 duce evidence of any amount paid or contributed or rea-
- 17 sonably likely to be paid or contributed in the future by
- 18 or on behalf of the opposing party to secure the right to
- 19 such collateral source benefits. No provider of collateral
- 20 source benefits shall recover any amount against the
- 21 claimant or receive any lien or credit against the claim-
- 22 ant's recovery or be equitably or legally subrogated to the
- 23 right of the claimant in a health care lawsuit. This section
- 24 shall apply to any health care lawsuit that is settled as

- 1 well as a health care lawsuit that is resolved by a fact
- 2 finder.

#### 3 SEC. 7. PUNITIVE DAMAGES.

- 4 (a) In General.—Punitive damages may, if other-5 wise permitted by applicable State or Federal law, be 6 awarded against any person in a health care lawsuit only
- 7 if it is proven by clear and convincing evidence that such
- 8 person acted with malicious intent to injure the claimant,
- 9 or that such person deliberately failed to avoid unneces-
- 10 sary injury that such person knew the claimant was sub-
- 11 stantially certain to suffer. In any health care lawsuit
- 12 where no judgment for compensatory damages is rendered
- 13 against such person, no punitive damages may be awarded
- 14 with respect to the claim in such lawsuit. No demand for
- 15 punitive damages shall be included in a health care lawsuit
- 16 as initially filed. A court may allow a claimant to file an
- 17 amended pleading for punitive damages only upon a mo-
- 18 tion by the claimant and after a finding by the court, upon
- 19 review of supporting and opposing affidavits or after a
- 20 hearing, after weighing the evidence, that the claimant has
- 21 established by a substantial probability that the claimant
- 22 will prevail on the claim for punitive damages. At the re-
- 23 quest of any party in a health care lawsuit, the trier of
- 24 fact shall consider in a separate proceeding—

1	(1) whether punitive damages are to be award-
2	ed and the amount of such award; and
3	(2) the amount of punitive damages following a
4	determination of punitive liability.
5	If a separate proceeding is requested, evidence relevant
6	only to the claim for punitive damages, as determined by
7	applicable State law, shall be inadmissible in any pro-
8	ceeding to determine whether compensatory damages are
9	to be awarded.
10	(b) Determining Amount of Punitive Dam-
11	AGES.—
12	(1) Factors considered.—In determining
13	the amount of punitive damages, the trier of fact
14	shall consider only the following:
15	(A) the severity of the harm caused by the
16	conduct of such party;
17	(B) the duration of the conduct or any
18	concealment of it by such party;
19	(C) the profitability of the conduct to such
20	party;
21	(D) the number of products sold or med-
22	ical procedures rendered for compensation, as
23	the case may be, by such party, of the kind
24	causing the harm complained of by the claim-
25	ant;

1	(E) any criminal penalties imposed on such
2	party, as a result of the conduct complained of
3	by the claimant; and
4	(F) the amount of any civil fines assessed
5	against such party as a result of the conduct
6	complained of by the claimant.
7	(2) MAXIMUM AWARD.—The amount of punitive
8	damages awarded in a health care lawsuit may be up
9	to as much as two times the amount of economic
10	damages awarded or \$250,000, whichever is greater.
11	The jury shall not be informed of this limitation.
12	(c) No Civil Monetary Penalties for Products
13	THAT COMPLY WITH FDA STANDARDS.—
14	(1) In general.—No punitive damages may be
15	awarded against the manufacturer or distributor of
16	a medical product based on a claim that such prod-
17	uct caused the claimant's harm where—
18	(A)(i) such medical product was subject to
19	premarket approval or clearance by the Food
20	and Drug Administration with respect to the
21	safety of the formulation or performance of the
22	aspect of such medical product which caused
23	the claimant's harm or the adequacy of the
24	packaging or labeling of such medical product;
25	and

- (ii) such medical product was so approved
   or cleared; or
  - (B) such medical product is generally recognized among qualified experts as safe and effective pursuant to conditions established by the Food and Drug Administration and applicable Food and Drug Administration regulations, including without limitation those related to packaging and labeling.
    - (2) Liability of health care providers.—A health care provider who prescribes a drug or device (including blood products) approved by the Food and Drug Administration shall not be named as a party to a product liability lawsuit involving such drug or device and shall not be liable to a claimant in a class action lawsuit against the manufacturer, distributor, or product seller of such drug or device.
    - (3) Packaging.—In a health care lawsuit for harm which is alleged to relate to the adequacy of the packaging or labeling of a drug which is required to have tamper-resistant packaging under regulations of the Secretary of Health and Human Services (including labeling regulations related to such packaging), the manufacturer or product seller of

- the drug shall not be held liable for punitive damages unless such packaging or labeling is found by the trier of fact by clear and convincing evidence to be substantially out of compliance with such regulations.
  - (4) EXCEPTION.—Paragraph (1) shall not apply in any health care lawsuit in which—
    - (A) a person, before or after premarket approval or clearance of such medical product, knowingly misrepresented to or withheld from the Food and Drug Administration information that is required to be submitted under the Federal Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act (21 U.S.C. 301 et seq.) or section 351 of the Public Health Service Act (42 U.S.C. 262) that is material and is causally related to the harm which the claimant allegedly suffered; or
    - (B) a person made an illegal payment to an official of the Food and Drug Administration for the purpose of either securing or maintaining approval or clearance of such medical product.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

1	SEC. 8. AUTHORIZATION OF PAYMENT OF FUTURE DAM
2	AGES TO CLAIMANTS IN HEALTH CARE LAW
3	SUITS.
4	(a) In General.—In any health care lawsuit, if an
5	award of future damages, without reduction to present
6	value, equaling or exceeding \$50,000 is made against a
7	party with sufficient insurance or other assets to fund a
8	periodic payment of such a judgment, the court shall, at
9	the request of any party, enter a judgment ordering that
10	the future damages be paid by periodic payments in ac-
11	cordance with the Uniform Periodic Payment of Judg-
12	ments Act promulgated by the National Conference of
13	Commissioners on Uniform State Laws.
14	(b) APPLICABILITY.—This section applies to all ac-
15	tions which have not been first set for trial or retrial be-
16	fore the effective date of this Act.
17	SEC. 9. DEFINITIONS.
18	In this Act:
19	(1) Alternative dispute resolution sys-
20	TEM; ADR.—The term "alternative dispute resolution
21	system" or "ADR" means a system that provides
22	for the resolution of health care lawsuits in a man-
23	ner other than through a civil action brought in a
24	State or Federal court.
25	(2) CLAIMANT.—The term "claimant" means
26	any person who brings a health care lawsuit includ.

- ing a person who asserts or claims a right to legal or equitable contribution, indemnity or subrogation, arising out of a health care liability claim or action, and any person on whose behalf such a claim is asserted or such an action is brought, whether deceased, incompetent, or a minor.
  - (3) Collateral source benefits" means any amount paid or reasonably likely to be paid in the future to or on behalf of the claimant, or any service, product or other benefit provided or reasonably likely to be provided in the future to or on behalf of the claimant, as a result of the injury or wrongful death, pursuant to—
    - (A) any State or Federal health, sickness, income-disability, accident, or workers' compensation law;
    - (B) any health, sickness, income-disability, or accident insurance that provides health benefits or income-disability coverage;
    - (C) any contract or agreement of any group, organization, partnership, or corporation to provide, pay for, or reimburse the cost of medical, hospital, dental, or income disability benefits; and

- 1 (D) any other publicly or privately funded 2 program.
- DAMAGES.—The 3 (4)COMPENSATORY term "compensatory damages" 4 means objectively 5 verifiable monetary losses incurred as a result of the 6 provision of, use of, or payment for (or failure to provide, use, or pay for) health care services or med-7 8 ical products, such as past and future medical ex-9 penses, loss of past and future earnings, cost of ob-10 taining domestic services, loss of employment, and 11 loss of business or employment opportunities, dam-12 ages for physical and emotional pain, suffering, in-13 convenience, physical impairment, mental anguish, 14 disfigurement, loss of enjoyment of life, loss of soci-15 ety and companionship, loss of consortium (other 16 than loss of domestic service), hedonic damages, in-17 jury to reputation, and all other nonpecuniary losses 18 of any kind or nature. The term "compensatory 19 damages" includes economic damages and non-20 economic damages, as such terms are defined in this 21 section.
  - (5) CONTINGENT FEE.—The term "contingent fee" includes all compensation to any person or persons which is payable only if a recovery is effected on behalf of one or more claimants.

23

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- (6) Economic damages.—The term "economic damages" means objectively verifiable monetary losses incurred as a result of the provision of, use of, or payment for (or failure to provide, use, or pay for) health care services or medical products, such as past and future medical expenses, loss of past and future earnings, cost of obtaining domestic services, loss of employment, and loss of business or employment opportunities.
  - (7)HEALTH CARE LAWSUIT.—The term "health care lawsuit" means any health care liability claim concerning the provision of health care goods or services affecting interstate commerce, or any health care liability action concerning the provision of health care goods or services affecting interstate commerce, brought in a State or Federal court or pursuant to an alternative dispute resolution system, against a health care provider, a health care organization, or the manufacturer, distributor, supplier, marketer, promoter, or seller of a medical product, regardless of the theory of liability on which the claim is based, or the number of claimants, plaintiffs, defendants, or other parties, or the number of claims or causes of action, in which the claimant alleges a health care liability claim.

- (8) Health care liability action" means a civil action brought in a State or Federal Court or pursuant to an alternative dispute resolution system, against a health care provider, a health care organization, or the manufacturer, distributor, supplier, marketer, promoter, or seller of a medical product, regardless of the theory of liability on which the claim is based, or the number of plaintiffs, defendants, or other parties, or the number of causes of action, in which the claimant alleges a health care liability claim.
  - (9) Health care liability claim" means a demand by any person, whether or not pursuant to ADR, against a health care provider, health care organization, or the manufacturer, distributor, supplier, marketer, promoter, or seller of a medical product, including, but not limited to, third-party claims, crossclaims, counter-claims, or contribution claims, which are based upon the provision of, use of, or payment for (or the failure to provide, use, or pay for) health care services or medical products, regardless of the theory of liability on which the claim is based, or the

- number of plaintiffs, defendants, or other parties, or the number of causes of action.
  - (10) Health care organization.—The term "health care organization" means any person or entity which is obligated to provide or pay for health benefits under any health plan, including any person or entity acting under a contract or arrangement with a health care organization to provide or administer any health benefit.
    - (11) Health care provider" means any person or entity required by State or Federal laws or regulations to be licensed, registered, or certified to provide health care services, and being either so licensed, registered, or certified, or exempted from such requirement by other statute or regulation.
    - (12) Health care goods or services.—The term "health care goods or services" means any goods or services provided by a health care organization, provider, or by any individual working under the supervision of a health care provider, that relates to the diagnosis, prevention, or treatment of any human disease or impairment, or the assessment of the health of human beings.

- 1 (13) MALICIOUS INTENT TO INJURE.—The
  2 term "malicious intent to injure" means inten3 tionally causing or attempting to cause physical in4 jury other than providing health care goods or serv5 ices.
  - product" means a drug or device intended for humans, and the terms "drug" and "device" have the meanings given such terms in sections 201(g)(1) and 201(h) of the Federal Food, Drug and Cosmetic Act (21 U.S.C. 321), respectively, including any component or raw material used therein, but excluding health care services.
  - (15) Noneconomic damages" means damages for physical and emotional pain, suffering, inconvenience, physical impairment, mental anguish, disfigurement, loss of enjoyment of life, loss of society and companionship, loss of consortium (other than loss of domestic service), hedonic damages, injury to reputation, and all other nonpecuniary losses of any kind or nature.
  - (16) Punitive damages.—The term "punitive damages" means damages awarded, for the purpose of punishment or deterrence, and not solely for com-

- 1 pensatory purposes, against a health care provider,
- 2 health care organization, or a manufacturer, dis-
- 3 tributor, or supplier of a medical product. Punitive
- 4 damages are neither economic nor noneconomic
- 5 damages.
- 6 (17) Recovery.—The term "recovery" means
- 7 the net sum recovered after deducting any disburse-
- 8 ments or costs incurred in connection with prosecu-
- 9 tion or settlement of the claim, including all costs
- paid or advanced by any person. Costs of health care
- incurred by the plaintiff and the attorneys' office
- 12 overhead costs or charges for legal services are not
- deductible disbursements or costs for such purpose.
- 14 (18) STATE.—The term "State" means each of
- the several States, the District of Columbia, the
- 16 Commonwealth of Puerto Rico, the Virgin Islands,
- Guam, American Samoa, the Northern Mariana Is-
- lands, the Trust Territory of the Pacific Islands, and
- any other territory or possession of the United
- States, or any political subdivision thereof.

#### 21 SEC. 10. EFFECT ON OTHER LAWS.

- 22 (a) VACCINE INJURY.—
- 23 (1) To the extent that title XXI of the Public
- Health Service Act establishes a Federal rule of law

1	applicable to a civil action brought for a vaccine-re-
2	lated injury or death—
3	(A) this Act does not affect the application
4	of the rule of law to such an action; and
5	(B) any rule of law prescribed by this Act
6	in conflict with a rule of law of such title XXI
7	shall not apply to such action.
8	(2) If there is an aspect of a civil action
9	brought for a vaccine-related injury or death to
10	which a Federal rule of law under title XXI of the
11	Public Health Service Act does not apply, then this
12	Act or otherwise applicable law (as determined
13	under this Act) will apply to such aspect of such ac-
14	tion.
15	(b) Other Federal Law.—Except as provided in
16	this section, nothing in this Act shall be deemed to affect
17	any defense available to a defendant in a health care law-
18	suit or action under any other provision of Federal law.
19	SEC. 11. STATE FLEXIBILITY AND PROTECTION OF STATES
20	RIGHTS.
21	(a) Health Care Lawsuits.—The provisions gov-
22	erning health care lawsuits set forth in this Act preempt,
23	subject to subsections (b) and (c), State law to the extent
24	that State law prevents the application of any provisions
25	of law established by or under this Act. The provisions

- 1 governing health care lawsuits set forth in this Act super-
- 2 sede chapter 171 of title 28, United States Code, to the
- 3 extent that such chapter—
- 4 (1) provides for a greater amount of damages
- 5 or contingent fees, a longer period in which a health
- 6 care lawsuit may be commenced, or a reduced appli-
- 7 cability or scope of periodic payment of future dam-
- 8 ages, than provided in this Act; or
- 9 (2) prohibits the introduction of evidence re-
- 10 garding collateral source benefits, or mandates or
- 11 permits subrogation or a lien on collateral source
- benefits.
- 13 (b) Protection of States' Rights.—Any issue
- 14 that is not governed by any provision of law established
- 15 by or under this Act (including State standards of neg-
- 16 ligence) shall be governed by otherwise applicable State
- 17 or Federal law. This Act does not preempt or supersede
- 18 any law that imposes greater protections (such as a short-
- 19 er statute of limitations) for health care providers and
- 20 health care organizations from liability, loss, or damages
- 21 than those provided by this Act.
- 22 (c) State Flexibility.—No provision of this Act
- 23 shall be construed to preempt—
- 24 (1) any State statutory limit (whether enacted
- before, on, or after the date of the enactment of this

- Act) on the amount of compensatory or punitive damages (or the total amount of damages) that may be awarded in a health care lawsuit, whether or not such State limit permits the recovery of a specific dollar amount of damages that is greater or lesser than is provided for under this Act, notwithstanding section 4(a); or
- 8 (2) any defense available to a party in a health 9 care lawsuit under any other provision of State or 10 Federal law.

# 11 SEC. 12. APPLICABILITY; EFFECTIVE DATE.

This Act shall apply to any health care lawsuit brought in a Federal or State court, or subject to an alternative dispute resolution system, that is initiated on or after the date of the enactment of this Act, except that any health care lawsuit arising from an injury occurring prior to the date of the enactment of this Act shall be governed by the applicable statute of limitations provisions in effect at the time the injury occurred.

 $\bigcirc$