107TH CONGRESS 2D SESSION

H. R. 4942

To improve patient access to health care services, extend the solvency of the Medicare Trust Fund, and provide improved medical care by reducing the excessive burden the liability system places on the health care delivery system.

IN THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

June 13, 2002

Mr. Weldon of Florida (for himself and Mr. Greenwood) introduced the following bill; which was referred to the Committee on the Judiciary, and in addition to the Committees on Ways and Means and Energy and Commerce, for a period to be subsequently determined by the Speaker, in each case for consideration of such provisions as fall within the jurisdiction of the committee concerned

A BILL

- To improve patient access to health care services, extend the solvency of the Medicare Trust Fund, and provide improved medical care by reducing the excessive burden the liability system places on the health care delivery system.
 - 1 Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representa-
 - 2 tives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,
 - 3 SECTION 1. SHORT TITLE.
 - 4 This Act may be cited as the "Medicare Solvency and
 - 5 Enhanced Benefits Act of 2002".

1 SEC. 2. FINDINGS AND PURPOSE.

(a) Findings.—

- (1) Congress finds that our current civil justice system is adversely affecting patient access to health care services, better patient care, and cost-efficient health care, in that the health care liability system is a costly and ineffective mechanism for resolving claims of health care liability and compensating injured patients, and is a deterrent to the sharing of information among health care professionals which impedes efforts to improve patient safety and quality of care.
- (2) Congress finds that the current health care liability system encourages health care providers to practice defensive medicine to protect themselves from lawsuits. These additional tests and procedures result in additional costs to senior citizens and too often provide little to improve the health of the patient. Their sole purposes in too many instances serves the purpose of protecting against possible lawsuits.
- (3) Congress finds that the current health care liability system encourages health care providers to practice defensive medicine, which results in added costs to the Medicare Trust Fund. Health care providers often order tests to rule out any possible seri-

- ous illness. Often these tests provide little benefit to the patient.
- 4 (4) Congress finds that the current liability system diverts valuable resources away from improved
 patient care and expanded Medicare benefits and instead misdirects them toward tests and procedures
 that do little to improve patient health, but serve
 primarily to protect the health care provider from
 excessive lawsuits.
 - (5) Congress finds that when the State of California enacted medical malpractice reform legislation (MICRA), Medicare benefited in that unnecessary procedures and tests were not ordered.
 - (6) Congress finds that senior citizens spend a larger portion of their income on health care than other age groups, and that it is in the best interest of senior citizens to help lower the cost of health care and make the Medicare Trust Fund more solvent.
- 20 (b) Purpose.—It is the purpose of this Act to imple-21 ment reasonable, comprehensive, and effective health care 22 liability reforms designed to—
- 23 (1) improve the solvency of and extend the life 24 of the Medicare Trust Fund by reducing the costs

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

- associated with defensive medicine and excessive
 malpractice awards;
- (2) improve the availability of health care services in cases in which health care liability actions
 have been shown to be a factor in the decreased
 availability of services;
 - (3) reduce the incidence of "defensive medicine" and lower the cost of health care liability insurance, all of which contribute to the escalation of health care costs;
 - (4) ensure that persons with meritorious health care injury claims receive fair, adequate, and timely compensation, including reasonable noneconomic damages;
 - (5) improve the fairness and cost-effectiveness of our current health care liability system to resolve disputes over, and provide compensation for, health care liability by reducing uncertainty in the amount of compensation provided to injured individuals; and
 - (6) provide an increased sharing of information in the health care system which will reduce unintended injury and improve patient care.

23 SEC. 3. ENCOURAGING SPEEDY RESOLUTION OF CLAIMS.

A medicare-related health care lawsuit may be com-25 menced no later than 3 years after the date of injury or

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

- 1 1 year after the claimant discovers, or through the use
- 2 of reasonable diligence should have discovered, the injury,
- 3 whichever occurs first. In no event shall the time for com-
- 4 mencement of a medicare-related health care lawsuit ex-
- 5 ceed 3 years, except that in the case of an alleged injury
- 6 sustained by a minor before the age of 6, a medicare-re-
- 7 lated health care lawsuit may be commenced by or on be-
- 8 half of the minor until the later of 3 years from the date
- 9 of injury, or the date on which the minor attains the age
- 10 of 8.

11 SEC. 4. COMPENSATING PATIENT INJURY.

- 12 (a) Unlimited Amount of Damages for Actual
- 13 Economic Losses.—In any medicare-related health care
- 14 lawsuit, the full amount of a claimant's economic loss may
- 15 be fully recovered without limitation.
- 16 (b) Additional Noneconomic Damages.—In any
- 17 medicare-related health care lawsuit, the amount of non-
- 18 economic damages recovered by a claimant may be as
- 19 much as \$250,000, regardless of the number of parties
- 20 against whom the action is brought or the number of sepa-
- 21 rate claims or actions brought with respect to the same
- 22 occurrence.
- 23 (c) No Discount of Award for Noneconomic
- 24 Damages.—In any medicare-related health care lawsuit,
- 25 an award for future noneconomic damages shall not be

- 1 discounted to present value. The jury shall not be in-
- 2 formed about the maximum award for noneconomic dam-
- 3 ages. An award for noneconomic damages in excess of
- 4 \$250,000 shall be reduced either before the entry of judg-
- 5 ment, or by amendment of the judgment after entry of
- 6 judgment, and such reduction shall be made before ac-
- 7 counting for any other reduction in damages required by
- 8 law. If separate awards are rendered for past and future
- 9 noneconomic damages and the combined awards exceed
- 10 \$250,000, the future noneconomic damages shall be re-
- 11 duced first.
- 12 (d) Fair Share Rule.—In any medicare-related
- 13 health care lawsuit, each party shall be liable for that par-
- 14 ty's several share of any damages only and not for the
- 15 share of any other person. Each party shall be liable only
- 16 for the amount of damages allocated to such party in di-
- 17 rect proportion to such party's percentage of responsi-
- 18 bility. A separate judgment shall be rendered against each
- 19 such party for the amount allocated to such party. For
- 20 purposes of this section, the trier of fact shall determine
- 21 the proportion of responsibility of each party for the claim-
- 22 ant's harm.
- 23 SEC. 5. MAXIMIZING PATIENT RECOVERY.
- 24 (a) Court Supervision of Share of Damages
- 25 ACTUALLY PAID TO CLAIMANTS.—In any medicare-re-

- 1 lated health care lawsuit, the court shall supervise the ar-
- 2 rangements for payment of damages to protect against
- 3 conflicts of interest that may have the effect of reducing
- 4 the amount of damages awarded that are actually paid
- 5 to claimants. In particular, in any medicare-related health
- 6 care lawsuit in which the attorney for a party claims a
- 7 financial stake in the outcome by virtue of a contingent
- 8 fee, the court shall have the power to restrict the payment
- 9 of a claimant's damage recovery to such attorney, and to
- 10 redirect such damages to the claimant based upon the in-
- 11 terests of justice and principles of equity. In no event shall
- 12 the total of all contingent fees for representing all claim-
- 13 ants in a medicare-related health care lawsuit exceed the
- 14 following limits:
- 15 (1) 40 percent of the first \$50,000 recovered by
- the claimant(s).
- 17 (2) $33\frac{1}{3}$ percent of the next \$50,000 recovered
- by the claimant(s).
- 19 (3) 25 percent of the next \$500,000 recovered
- by the claimant(s).
- 21 (4) 15 percent of any amount by which the re-
- covery by the claimant(s) is in excess of \$600,000.
- (b) APPLICABILITY.—The limitations in this section
- 24 shall apply whether the recovery is by judgment or settle-
- 25 ment, or by mediation, arbitration, or any other form of

- 1 alternative dispute resolution. In a medicare-related health
- 2 care lawsuit involving a minor or incompetent person, a
- 3 court retains the authority to authorize or approve a fee
- 4 that is less than the maximum permitted under this sec-
- 5 tion.
- 6 (c) Definition.—In this section, the term "contin-
- 7 gent fee" includes all compensation to any person or per-
- 8 sons which is payable only if a recovery is effected on be-
- 9 half of one or more claimants.

10 SEC. 6. ADDITIONAL HEALTH BENEFITS.

- 11 (a) In General.—In any medicare-related health
- 12 care lawsuit, any party may introduce evidence of collat-
- 13 eral source benefits. If a party elects to introduce such
- 14 evidence, any opposing party may introduce evidence of
- 15 any amount paid or contributed or reasonably likely to be
- 16 paid or contributed in the future by or on behalf of the
- 17 opposing party to secure the right to such collateral source
- 18 benefits. No provider of collateral source benefits shall re-
- 19 cover any amount against the claimant or receive any lien
- 20 or credit against the claimant's recovery or be equitably
- 21 or legally subrogated to the right of the claimant in a
- 22 medicare-related health care lawsuit. This section shall
- 23 apply to any medicare-related health care lawsuit that is
- 24 settled as well as a medicare-related health care lawsuit
- 25 that is resolved by a fact finder.

- 1 (b) DEFINITION.—In this section, the term "collat-
- 2 eral source benefits" means any amount paid or reason-
- 3 ably likely to be paid in the future to or on behalf of the
- 4 claimant, or any service, product or other benefit provided
- 5 or reasonably likely to be provided in the future to or on
- 6 behalf of the claimant, as a result of the injury or wrongful
- 7 death, pursuant to—
- 8 (1) any State or Federal health, sickness, in-
- 9 come-disability, accident, or workers' compensation
- 10 law;
- 11 (2) any health, sickness, income-disability, or
- accident insurance that provides health benefits or
- income-disability coverage;
- 14 (3) any contract or agreement of any group, or-
- ganization, partnership, or corporation to provide,
- pay for, or reimburse the cost of medical, hospital,
- dental, or income disability benefits; and
- 18 (4) any other publicly or privately funded pro-
- 19 gram.

20 SEC. 7. PUNITIVE DAMAGES.

- 21 (a) IN GENERAL.—Punitive damages may, if other-
- 22 wise permitted by applicable State or Federal law, be
- 23 awarded against any person in a medicare-related health
- 24 care lawsuit only if it is proven by clear and convincing
- 25 evidence that such person acted with malicious intent to

- 1 injure the claimant, or that such person deliberately failed
- 2 to avoid unnecessary injury that such person knew the
- 3 claimant was substantially certain to suffer. In any medi-
- 4 care-related health care lawsuit where no judgment for
- 5 compensatory damages is rendered against such person,
- 6 no punitive damages may be awarded with respect to the
- 7 claim in such lawsuit. No demand for punitive damages
- 8 shall be included in a medicare-related health care lawsuit
- 9 as initially filed. A court may allow a claimant to file an
- 10 amended pleading for punitive damages only upon a mo-
- 11 tion by the claimant and after a finding by the court, upon
- 12 review of supporting and opposing affidavits or after a
- 13 hearing, after weighing the evidence, that the claimant has
- 14 established by a substantial probability that the claimant
- 15 will prevail on the claim for punitive damages. At the re-
- 16 quest of any party in a medicare-related health care law-
- 17 suit, the trier of fact shall consider in a separate
- 18 proceeding—
- 19 (1) whether punitive damages are to be award-
- ed and the amount of such award; and
- 21 (2) the amount of punitive damages following a
- determination of punitive liability.
- 23 If a separate proceeding is requested, evidence relevant
- 24 only to the claim for punitive damages, as determined by
- 25 applicable State law, shall be inadmissible in any pro-

1	ceeding to determine whether compensatory damages are
2	to be awarded.
3	(b) Determining Amount of Punitive Dam-
4	AGES.—
5	(1) Factors considered.—In determining
6	the amount of punitive damages under subsection
7	(a), the trier of fact shall consider only the fol-
8	lowing:
9	(A) the severity of the harm caused by the
10	conduct of such party;
11	(B) the duration of the conduct or any
12	concealment of it by such party;
13	(C) the profitability of the conduct to such
14	party;
15	(D) the number of products sold or med-
16	ical procedures rendered for compensation, as
17	the case may be, by such party, of the kind
18	causing the harm complained of by the claim-
19	ant;
20	(E) any criminal penalties imposed on such
21	party, as a result of the conduct complained of
22	by the claimant; and
23	(F) the amount of any civil fines assessed
24	against such party as a result of the conduct
25	complained of by the claimant.

1	(2) Maximum award.—The amount of punitive
2	damages awarded in a medicare-related health care
3	lawsuit may be up to as much as two times the
4	amount of economic damages awarded or \$250,000,
5	whichever is greater. The jury shall not be informed
6	of this limitation.
7	(c) No Civil Monetary Penalties for Products
8	THAT COMPLY WITH FDA STANDARDS.—
9	(1) In general.—No punitive damages may be
10	awarded in a medicare-related health care lawsuit
11	against the manufacturer or distributor of a medical
12	product based on a medicare-related liability claim
13	that such product caused the claimant's harm
14	where—
15	(A)(i) such medical product was subject to
16	premarket approval or clearance by the Food
17	and Drug Administration with respect to the
18	safety of the formulation or performance of the
19	aspect of such medical product which caused
20	the claimant's harm or the adequacy of the
21	packaging or labeling of such medical product;
22	and
23	(ii) such medical product was so approved
24	or cleared: or

- 1 (B) such medical product is generally rec2 ognized among qualified experts as safe and ef3 fective pursuant to conditions established by the
 4 Food and Drug Administration and applicable
 5 Food and Drug Administration regulations, in6 cluding without limitation those related to pack7 aging and labeling.
 - (2) Liability of health care providers.—
 A person who prescribes a drug or device (including blood products) approved by the Food and Drug Administration that constitutes a medicare-related item or service shall not be named as a party to a product liability lawsuit involving such drug or device and shall not be liable to a claimant in a class action lawsuit against the manufacturer, distributor, or product seller of such drug or device.
 - (3) Packaging.—In a medicare-related health care lawsuit for harm which is alleged to relate to the adequacy of the packaging or labeling of a drug which is required to have tamper-resistant packaging under regulations of the Secretary of Health and Human Services (including labeling regulations related to such packaging), the manufacturer or product seller of the drug shall not be held liable for punitive damages unless such packaging or labeling is

- found by the trier of fact by clear and convincing 1 2 evidence to be substantially out of compliance with 3 such regulations. EXCEPTION.—Paragraph (1) shall apply in any medicare-related health care lawsuit in 5 6 which-7 (A) a person, before or after premarket ap-8 proval or clearance of such medical product, 9 knowingly misrepresented to or withheld from the Food and Drug Administration information 10 11 that is required to be submitted under the Fed-12 eral Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act (21 U.S.C. 13 301 et seq.) or section 351 of the Public Health 14 Service Act (42 U.S.C. 262) that is material 15 and is causally related to the harm which the 16 claimant allegedly suffered; or 17 (B) a person made an illegal payment to 18 an official of the Food and Drug Administra-19 tion for the purpose of either securing or main-20 taining approval or clearance of such medical 21 product.
 - (d) Definitions.—In this section:
 - (2) Malicious intent to injure" means intentionally

23

- causing or attempting to cause physical injury other
 than providing health care goods or services.
- 3 (3) MEDICAL PRODUCT.—The term "medical product" means a drug or device intended for hu5 mans, and the terms "drug" and "device" have the 6 meanings given such terms in sections 201(g)(1) and 201(h) of the Federal Food, Drug and Cosmetic Act (21 U.S.C. 321), respectively, including any component or raw material used therein, but excluding health care services.

$11\,$ SEC. 8. AUTHORIZATION OF PAYMENT OF FUTURE DAM-

- 12 AGES TO CLAIMANTS IN MEDICARE-RELATED
- 13 HEALTH CARE LAWSUITS.
- 14 (a) In General.—In any medicare-related health
- 15 care lawsuit, if an award of future damages, without re-
- 16 duction to present value, equaling or exceeding \$50,000
- 17 is made against a party with sufficient insurance or other
- 18 assets to fund a periodic payment of such a judgment,
- 19 the court shall, at the request of any party, enter a judg-
- 20 ment ordering that the future damages be paid by periodic
- 21 payments in accordance with the Uniform Periodic Pay-
- 22 ment of Judgments Act promulgated by the National Con-
- 23 ference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws.

1	(b) APPLICABILITY.—This section applies to all ac-
2	tions which have not been first set for trial or retrial be-
3	fore the effective date of this Act.
4	SEC. 9. EFFECT ON OTHER LAWS.
5	(a) VACCINE INJURY.—
6	(1) To the extent that title XXI of the Public
7	Health Service Act establishes a Federal rule of law
8	applicable to a civil action brought for a vaccine-re-
9	lated injury or death—
10	(A) this Act does not affect the application
11	of the rule of law to such an action; and
12	(B) any rule of law prescribed by this Act
13	in conflict with a rule of law of such title XXI
14	shall not apply to such action.
15	(2) If there is an aspect of a civil action
16	brought for a vaccine-related injury or death to
17	which a Federal rule of law under title XXI of the
18	Public Health Service Act does not apply, then this
19	Act or otherwise applicable law (as determined
20	under this Act) will apply to such aspect of such ac-
21	tion.
22	(b) Other Federal Law.—Except as provided in
23	this section, nothing in this Act shall be deemed to affect
24	any defense available to a defendant in a medicare-related

1	health care lawsuit or action under any other provision
2	of Federal law.
3	SEC. 10. STATE FLEXIBILITY AND PROTECTION OF STATES'
4	RIGHTS.
5	(a) Health Care Lawsuits.—The provisions gov-
6	erning medicare-related health care lawsuits set forth in
7	this Act preempt, subject to subsections (b) and (c), State
8	law to the extent that State law prevents the application
9	of any provisions of law established by or under this Act.
10	The provisions governing medicare-related health care
11	lawsuits set forth in this Act supersede chapter 171 of
12	title 28, United States Code, to the extent that such
13	chapter—
14	(1) provides for a greater amount of damages
15	or contingent fees, a longer period in which a medi-
16	care-related health care lawsuit may be commenced,
17	or a reduced applicability or scope of periodic pay-
18	ment of future damages, than provided in this Act;
19	or
20	(2) prohibits the introduction of evidence re-
21	garding collateral source benefits, or mandates or
22	permits subrogation or a lien on collateral source
23	benefits.
24	(b) Protection of States' Rights.—Any issue

25 that is not governed by any provision of law established

- 1 by or under this Act (including State standards of neg-
- 2 ligence) shall be governed by otherwise applicable State
- 3 or Federal law. This Act does not preempt or supersede
- 4 any law that imposes greater protections (such as a short-
- 5 er statute of limitations) for health care providers and
- 6 health care organizations from liability, loss, or damages
- 7 than those provided by this Act.
- 8 (c) State Flexibility.—No provision of this Act
- 9 shall be construed to preempt—
- 10 (1) any State statutory limit (whether enacted
- before, on, or after the date of the enactment of this
- 12 Act) on the amount of compensatory or punitive
- damages (or the total amount of damages) that may
- be awarded in a medicare-related health care law-
- suit, whether or not such State limit permits the re-
- 16 covery of a specific dollar amount of damages that
- is greater or lesser than is provided for under this
- 18 Act, notwithstanding section 4(a); or
- 19 (2) any defense available to a party in a medi-
- care-related health care lawsuit under any other pro-
- 21 vision of State or Federal law.
- 22 SEC. 11. NO MEDICARE+CHOICE CAUSE OF ACTION.
- No provision of this Act may be construed to create
- 24 a cause of action against a Medicare+Choice plan under
- 25 part C of title XVIII of the Social Security Act.

1 SEC. 12. DEFINITIONS.

2 In this Act:

- (1) Medicare-related health care law-SUIT.—The term "medicare-related health care law-suit" means any action concerning medicare-related items or services, brought in a State or Federal court or pursuant to alternative dispute resolution, against any person, regardless of the theory of liabil-ity on which the claim is based, in which the claim-ant alleges a medicare-related liability claim.
 - (2) Medicare-related liability claim.—
 The term "medicare-related liability claim" means a demand by any person, whether or not pursuant to alternative dispute resolution, against any person, based upon the provision of, use of, or payment for (or the failure to provide, use, or pay for) medicare-related items or services, regardless of the theory of liability on which the claim is based, or the number of plaintiffs, defendants, or other parties, or the number of causes of action.
 - (3) Medicare-related items or services.—
 The term "medicare-related items or services"
 means items or services for which payment may be
 made under title XVIII of the Social Security Act
 (including under a Medicare+Choice plan under
 part C of such title).

- (4) ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION.—The term "alternative dispute resolution" means a system that provides for the resolution of claims in a manner other than through a civil action brought in a State or Federal court.
 - (5) CLAIMANT.—The term "claimant" means any person who brings a medicare-related health care lawsuit, including a person who asserts or claims a right to legal or equitable contribution, indemnity or subrogation, arising out of a medicare-related claim, and any person on whose behalf such a claim is asserted or such an action is brought, whether deceased, incompetent, or a minor.
 - (6) Compensatory damages.—The term "compensatory damages"—
 - (A) means objectively verifiable monetary losses incurred as a result of the provision of, use of, or payment for (or failure to provide, use, or pay for) medicare-related items or services, such as past and future medical expenses, loss of past and future earnings, cost of obtaining domestic services, loss of employment, and loss of business or employment opportunities, damages for physical and emotional pain, suffering, inconvenience, physical impairment,

- mental anguish, disfigurement, loss of enjoyment of life, loss of society and companionship, loss of consortium (other than loss of domestic service), hedonic damages, injury to reputation, and all other nonpecuniary losses of any kind or nature; and
 - (B) includes economic damages and noneconomic damages, as such terms are defined in this section.
 - (7) Economic damages.—The term "economic damages" means objectively verifiable monetary losses, such as past and future medical expenses, loss of past and future earnings, cost of obtaining domestic services, loss of employment, and loss of business or employment opportunities.
 - (8) Noneconomic damages.—The term "non-economic damages" means damages for physical and emotional pain, suffering, inconvenience, physical impairment, mental anguish, disfigurement, loss of enjoyment of life, loss of society and companionship, loss of consortium (other than loss of domestic service), hedonic damages, injury to reputation, and all other nonpecuniary losses of any kind or nature.
 - (9) Punitive damages.—The term "punitive damages" means damages awarded, for the purpose

- of punishment or deterrence, and not solely for compensatory purposes. Punitive damages are neither economic nor noneconomic damages.
 - (10) Recovery.—The term "recovery" means the net sum recovered after deducting any disbursements or costs incurred in connection with prosecution or settlement of the claim, including all costs paid or advanced by any person. Costs of health care incurred by the claimant and the attorneys' office overhead costs or charges for legal services are not deductible disbursements or costs for such purpose.
 - (11) HEALTH CARE ORGANIZATION.—The term "health care organization" means any person or entity which is obligated to provide or pay for health benefits under any health plan, including any person or entity acting under a contract or arrangement with a health care organization to provide or administer any health benefit.
 - (12) Health care provider" means any person or entity required by State or Federal laws or regulations to be licensed, registered, or certified to provide health care services, and being either so licensed, registered, or exempted from such requirement by other statute or regulation.

- term "health care goods or services" means any goods or services provided by a health care organization, provider, or by any individual working under the supervision of a health care provider, that relates to the diagnosis, prevention, or treatment of any human disease or impairment, or the assessment of the health of human beings.
- 9 (14) STATE.—The term "State" means each of 10 the several States, the District of Columbia, the 11 Commonwealth of Puerto Rico, the Virgin Islands, 12 Guam, American Samoa, the Northern Mariana Is-13 lands, the Trust Territory of the Pacific Islands, and 14 any other territory or possession of the United 15 States, or any political subdivision thereof.

16 SEC. 13. SENSE OF CONGRESS.

It is the sense of Congress that any savings generated by this Act due to reduced Federal Medicare expenditures associated with defensive medicine and higher medical malpractice insurance rates should be placed in a Medicare Trust Fund to be used solely to meet Medicare expenditures, including current benefits, enhanced or new benefits, or the costs associated with the enactment of a prescription drugs benefit.

1 SEC. 14. APPLICABILITY; EFFECTIVE DATE.

- 2 This Act shall apply to any medicare-related health
- 3 care lawsuit brought in a Federal or State court, or sub-
- 4 ject to alternative dispute resolution, that is initiated on
- 5 or after the date of the enactment of this Act, except that
- 6 any medicare-related health care lawsuit arising from an
- 7 injury occurring prior to the date of the enactment of this
- 8 Act shall be governed by the applicable statute of limita-
- 9 tions provisions in effect at the time the injury occurred.

 \bigcirc