Calendar No. 532

107TH CONGRESS 2D SESSION

H. R. 3892

IN THE SENATE OF THE UNITED STATES

July 23, 2002

Received; read twice and referred to the Committee on the Judiciary

July 31, 2002

Reported by Mr. LEAHY, with an amendment

[Strike out all after the enacting clause and insert the part printed in italic]

AN ACT

To amend title 28, United States Code, to make certain modifications in the judicial discipline procedures, and for other purposes.

- 1 Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representa-
- 2 tives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,
- 3 SECTION 1. SHORT TITLE.
- 4 This Act may be cited as the "Judicial Improvements
- 5 Act of 2002".

SEC. 2. JUDICIAL DISCIPLINE PROCEDURES.

- 2 (a) In General.—Part I of title 28, United States
- 3 Code, is amended by inserting after chapter 15 the fol-
- 4 lowing new chapter:

"CHAPTER 16—COMPLAINTS AGAINST JUDGES AND JUDICIAL DISCIPLINE

"Sec.

- "351. Complaints; judge defined.
- "352. Review of complaint by chief judge.
- "353. Special committees.
- "354. Action by judicial council.
- "355. Action by Judicial Conference.
- "356. Subpoena power.
- "357. Review of orders and actions.
- "358. Rules.
- "359. Restrictions.
- "360. Disclosure of information.
- "361. Reimbursement of expenses.
- "362. Other provisions and rules not affected.
- "363. Court of Federal Claims, Court of International Trade, Court of Appeals
 for the Federal Circuit.
- "364. Effect of felony conviction.

5 "\\$351. Complaints; judge defined

- 6 "(a) Filing of Complaint by Any Person.—Any
- 7 person alleging that a judge has engaged in conduct preju-
- 8 dicial to the effective and expeditious administration of the
- 9 business of the courts, or alleging that such judge is un-
- 10 able to discharge all the duties of office by reason of men-
- 11 tal or physical disability, may file with the clerk of the
- 12 court of appeals for the circuit a written complaint con-
- 13 taining a brief statement of the facts constituting such
- 14 conduct.
- 15 "(b) IDENTIFYING COMPLAINT BY CHIEF JUDGE.—
- 16 In the interests of the effective and expeditious adminis-
- 17 tration of the business of the courts and on the basis of

- 1 information available to the chief judge of the circuit, the
- 2 chief judge may, by written order stating reasons therefor,
- 3 identify a complaint for purposes of this chapter and
- 4 thereby dispense with filing of a written complaint.
- 5 "(e) Transmittal of Complaint.—Upon receipt of
- 6 a complaint filed under subsection (a), the clerk shall
- 7 promptly transmit the complaint to the chief judge of the
- 8 circuit, or, if the conduct complained of is that of the chief
- 9 judge, to that circuit judge in regular active service next
- 10 senior in date of commission (hereafter, for purposes of
- 11 this chapter only, included in the term 'chief judge'). The
- 12 clerk shall simultaneously transmit a copy of the com-
- 13 plaint to the judge whose conduct is the subject of the
- 14 complaint. The clerk shall also transmit a copy of any
- 15 complaint identified under subsection (b) to the judge
- 16 whose conduct is the subject of the complaint.
- 17 "(d) DEFINITIONS.—In this chapter—
- 18 "(1) the term 'judge' means a circuit judge, dis-
- 19 triet judge, bankruptey judge, or magistrate judge;
- 20 and
- 21 "(2) the term 'complainant' means the person
- 22 filing a complaint under subsection (a) of this sec-
- 23 tion.

1 "\\$352. Review of complaint by chief judge

2 "(a) Expeditious Review; Limited Inquiry.— 3 The chief judge shall expeditiously review any complaint received under section 351(a) or identified under section 4 5 351(b). In determining what action to take, the chief judge may conduct a limited inquiry for the purpose of 6 7 determining 8 "(1) whether appropriate corrective action has 9 been or can be taken without the necessity for a for-10 mal investigation; and 11 "(2) whether the facts stated in the complaint 12 are either plainly untrue or are incapable of being 13 established through investigation. For this purpose, the chief judge may request the judge whose conduct is complained of to file a written response to the complaint. Such response shall not be made available to the complainant unless authorized by the judge filing the response. The chief judge or his or her designee may also communicate orally or in writing with the com-19 plainant, the judge whose conduct is complained of, and any other person who may have knowledge of the matter, and may review any transcripts or other relevant documents. The chief judge shall not undertake to make findings of fact about any matter that is reasonably in dispute. 25 "(b) ACTION BY CHIEF JUDGE FOLLOWING RE-VIEW.—After expeditiously reviewing a complaint under

1	subsection (a), the chief judge, by written order stating
2	his or her reasons, may—
3	"(1) dismiss the complaint—
4	"(A) if the chief judge finds the complaint
5	to be—
6	"(i) not in conformity with section
7	351(a);
8	"(ii) directly related to the merits of
9	a decision or procedural ruling; or
10	"(iii) frivolous, lacking sufficient evi-
11	dence to raise an inference that mis-
12	conduct has occurred, or containing allega-
13	tions which are incapable of being estab-
14	lished through investigation; or
15	"(B) when a limited inquiry conducted
16	under subsection (a) demonstrates that the alle-
17	gations in the complaint lack any factual foun-
18	dation or are conclusively refuted by objective
19	evidence; or
20	"(2) conclude the proceeding if the chief judge
21	finds that appropriate corrective action has been
22	taken or that action on the complaint is no longer
23	necessary because of intervening events

- 1 The chief judge shall transmit copies of the written order
- 2 to the complainant and to the judge whose conduct is the
- 3 subject of the complaint.
- 4 "(c) Review of Orders of Chief Judge.—A com-
- 5 plainant or judge aggrieved by a final order of the chief
- 6 judge under this section may petition the judicial council
- 7 of the circuit for review thereof. The denial of a petition
- 8 for review of the chief judge's order shall be final and con-
- 9 clusive and shall not be judicially reviewable on appeal or
- 10 otherwise.
- 11 "(d) Referral of Petitions for Review to Pan-
- 12 ELS OF THE JUDICIAL COUNCIL.—Each judicial council
- 13 may, pursuant to rules prescribed under section 358, refer
- 14 a petition for review filed under subsection (e) to a panel
- 15 of no fewer than 5 members of the council, at least 2 of
- 16 whom shall be district judges.
- 17 **"§ 353. Special committees**
- 18 "(a) Appointment.—If the chief judge does not
- 19 enter an order under section 352(b), the chief judge shall
- 20 promptly—
- 21 "(1) appoint himself or herself and equal num-
- bers of circuit and district judges of the circuit to
- a special committee to investigate the facts and alle-
- 24 gations contained in the complaint;

1 "(2) certify the complaint and any other docu-2 ments pertaining thereto to each member of such 3 committee; and

4 "(3) provide written notice to the complainant 5 and the judge whose conduct is the subject of the 6 complaint of the action taken under this subsection. 7 "(b) Change in Status or Death of Judges.— 8 A judge appointed to a special committee under subsection (a) may continue to serve on that committee after becom-10 ing a senior judge or, in the case of the chief judge of the circuit, after his or her term as chief judge terminates under subsection (a)(3) or (e) of section 45. If a judge appointed to a committee under subsection (a) dies, or retires from office under section 371(a), while serving on 15 the committee, the chief judge of the circuit may appoint another circuit or district judge, as the case may be, to

19 Each committee appointed under subsection (a) shall con20 duct an investigation as extensive as it considers nec21 essary, and shall expeditiously file a comprehensive written
22 report thereon with the judicial council of the circuit. Such
23 report shall present both the findings of the investigation
24 and the committee's recommendations for necessary and
25 appropriate action by the judicial council of the circuit.

the committee.

17

1 "§ 354. Action by judicial council

2	"(a) ACTIONS UPON RECEIPT OF REPORT.
3	"(1) ACTIONS.—The judicial council of a cir-
4	cuit, upon receipt of a report filed under section
5	353(e)—
6	"(A) may conduct any additional investiga-
7	tion which it considers to be necessary;
8	"(B) may dismiss the complaint; and
9	"(C) if the complaint is not dismissed,
10	shall take such action as is appropriate to as-
11	sure the effective and expeditious administra-
12	tion of the business of the courts within the cir-
13	euit.
14	"(2) DESCRIPTION OF POSSIBLE ACTIONS IF
15	COMPLAINT NOT DISMISSED.—
16	"(A) In GENERAL.—Action by the judicial
17	council under paragraph (1)(C) may include—
18	"(i) ordering that, on a temporary
19	basis for a time certain, no further cases
20	be assigned to the judge whose conduct is
21	the subject of a complaint;
22	"(ii) censuring or reprimanding such
23	judge by means of private communication;
24	and
25	"(iii) censuring or reprimanding such
26	judge by means of public announcement.

1	"(B) FOR ARTICLE III JUDGES.—If the
2	conduct of a judge appointed to hold office dur-
3	ing good behavior is the subject of the com-
4	plaint, action by the judicial council under
5	paragraph (1)(C) may include—
6	"(i) certifying disability of the judge
7	pursuant to the procedures and standards
8	provided under section 372(b); and
9	"(ii) requesting that the judge volun-
10	tarily retire, with the provision that the
11	length of service requirements under sec-
12	tion 371 of this title shall not apply.
13	"(C) FOR MAGISTRATE JUDGES.—If the
14	conduct of a magistrate judge is the subject of
15	the complaint, action by the judicial council
16	under paragraph (1)(C) may include directing
17	the chief judge of the district of the magistrate
18	judge to take such action as the judicial council
19	considers appropriate.
20	"(3) Limitations on Judicial Council Re-
21	GARDING REMOVALS.—
22	"(A) ARTICLE III JUDGES.—Under no cir-
23	cumstances may the judicial council order re-
24	moval from office of any judge appointed to
25	hold office during good behavior.

1 "(B) MAGISTRATE AND BANKRUPTCY
2 JUDGES.—Any removal of a magistrate judge
3 under this subsection shall be in accordance
4 with section 631 and any removal of a bank5 ruptcy judge shall be in accordance with section
6 152.

"(4) NOTICE OF ACTION TO JUDGE.—The judicial council shall immediately provide written notice to the complainant and to the judge whose conduct is the subject of the complaint of the action taken under this subsection.

"(b) REFERRAL TO JUDICIAL CONFERENCE.—

"(1) In GENERAL.—In addition to the authority granted under subsection (a), the judicial council may, in its discretion, refer any complaint under section 351, together with the record of any associated proceedings and its recommendations for appropriate action, to the Judicial Conference of the United States.

"(2) SPECIAL CIRCUMSTANCES.—In any case in which the judicial council determines, on the basis of a complaint and an investigation under this chapter, or on the basis of information otherwise available to the judicial council, that a judge appointed to hold

1	office during good behavior may have engaged in
2	conduct
3	"(A) which might constitute one or more
4	grounds for impeachment under article H of the
5	Constitution, or
6	"(B) which, in the interest of justice, is
7	not amenable to resolution by the judicial coun-
8	eil,
9	the judicial council shall promptly certify such deter-
10	mination, together with any complaint and a record
11	of any associated proceedings, to the Judicial Con-
12	ference of the United States.
13	"(3) NOTICE TO COMPLAINANT AND JUDGE.—
14	A judicial council acting under authority of this sub-
15	section shall, unless contrary to the interests of jus-
16	tice, immediately submit written notice to the com-
17	plainant and to the judge whose conduct is the sub-
18	ject of the action taken under this subsection.
19	"§ 355. Action by Judicial Conference
20	"(a) In General.—Upon referral or certification of
21	any matter under section 354(b), the Judicial Conference,
22	after consideration of the prior proceedings and such addi-
23	tional investigation as it considers appropriate, shall by
24	majority vote take such action, as described in section
25	354(a)(1)(C) and (2), as it considers appropriate.

"(b) IF IMPEACHMENT WARRANTED.—

"(1) IN GENERAL.—If the Judicial Conference concurs in the determination of the judicial council, or makes its own determination, that consideration of impeachment may be warranted, it shall so certify and transmit the determination and the record of proceedings to the House of Representatives for whatever action the House of Representatives considers to be necessary. Upon receipt of the determination and record of proceedings in the House of Representatives, the Clerk of the House of Representatives shall make available to the public the determination.

"(2) IN CASE OF FELONY CONVICTION.—If a judge has been convicted of a felony under State or Federal law and has exhausted all means of obtaining direct review of the conviction, or the time for seeking further direct review of the conviction has passed and no such review has been sought, the Judicial Conference may, by majority vote and without referral or certification under section 354(b), transmit to the House of Representatives a determination that consideration of impeachment may be warranted, together with appropriate court records, for

- 1 whatever action the House of Representatives con-
- 2 siders to be necessary.

3 **"§ 356. Subpoena power**

- 4 "(a) Judicial Councils and Special Commit-
- 5 TEES.—In conducting any investigation under this chap-
- 6 ter, the judicial council, or a special committee appointed
- 7 under section 353, shall have full subpoena powers as pro-
- 8 vided in section 332(d).
- 9 "(b) Judicial Conference and Standing Com-
- 10 MITTEES.—In conducting any investigation under this
- 11 chapter, the Judicial Conference, or a standing committee
- 12 appointed by the Chief Justice under section 331, shall
- 13 have full subpoena powers as provided in that section.

14 "8357. Review of orders and actions

- 15 "(a) Review of Action of Judicial Council.—
- 16 A complainant or judge aggrieved by an action of the judi-
- 17 cial council under section 354 may petition the Judicial
- 18 Conference of the United States for review thereof.
- 19 "(b) ACTION OF JUDICIAL CONFERENCE.—The Judi-
- 20 cial Conference, or the standing committee established
- 21 under section 331, may grant a petition filed by a com-
- 22 plainant or judge under subsection (a).
- 23 "(c) No Judicial Review.—Except as expressly
- 24 provided in this section and section 352(e), all orders and
- 25 determinations, including denials of petitions for review,

- 1 shall be final and conclusive and shall not be judicially
- 2 reviewable on appeal or otherwise.
- 3 **48 358. Rules**
- 4 "(a) In General.—Each judicial council and the
- 5 Judicial Conference may prescribe such rules for the con-
- 6 duet of proceedings under this chapter, including the proc-
- 7 essing of petitions for review, as each considers to be ap-
- 8 propriate.
- 9 "(b) REQUIRED PROVISIONS.—Rules prescribed
- 10 under subsection (a) shall contain provisions requiring
- 11 that—
- 12 "(1) adequate prior notice of any investigation
- be given in writing to the judge whose conduct is the
- subject of a complaint under this chapter;
- 15 "(2) the judge whose conduct is the subject of
- a complaint under this chapter be afforded an op-
- 17 portunity to appear (in person or by counsel) at pro-
- 18 ceedings conducted by the investigating panel, to
- 19 present oral and documentary evidence, to compel
- 20 the attendance of witnesses or the production of doc-
- 21 uments, to cross-examine witnesses, and to present
- 22 argument orally or in writing; and
- 23 "(3) the complainant be afforded an oppor-
- 24 tunity to appear at proceedings conducted by the in-

- 1 vestigating panel, if the panel concludes that the
- 2 complainant could offer substantial information.
- 3 "(e) Procedures.—Any rule prescribed under this
- 4 section shall be made or amended only after giving appro-
- 5 priate public notice and an opportunity for comment. Any
- 6 such rule shall be a matter of public record, and any such
- 7 rule promulgated by a judicial council may be modified
- 8 by the Judicial Conference. No rule promulgated under
- 9 this section may limit the period of time within which a
- 10 person may file a complaint under this chapter.

11 "§ 359. Restrictions

- 12 "(a) Restriction on Individuals Who Are Sub-
- 13 JECT OF INVESTIGATION.—No judge whose conduct is the
- 14 subject of an investigation under this chapter shall serve
- 15 upon a special committee appointed under section 353,
- 16 upon a judicial council, upon the Judicial Conference, or
- 17 upon the standing committee established under section
- 18 331, until all proceedings under this chapter relating to
- 19 such investigation have been finally terminated.
- 20 "(b) Amicus Curiae.—No person shall be granted
- 21 the right to intervene or to appear as amicus curiae in
- 22 any proceeding before a judicial council or the Judicial
- 23 Conference under this chapter.

1 "§ 360. Disclosure of information

2	"(a) Confidentiality of Proceedings.—Except
3	as provided in section 355, all papers, documents, and
4	records of proceedings related to investigations conducted
5	under this chapter shall be confidential and shall not be
6	disclosed by any person in any proceeding except to the
7	extent that—
8	"(1) the judicial council of the circuit in its dis-
9	eretion releases a copy of a report of a special com-
10	mittee under section 353(e) to the complainant
11	whose complaint initiated the investigation by that
12	special committee and to the judge whose conduct is
13	the subject of the complaint;
14	"(2) the judicial council of the circuit, the Judi-
15	cial Conference of the United States, or the Senate
16	or the House of Representatives by resolution, re-
17	leases any such material which is believed necessary
18	to an impeachment investigation or trial of a judge
19	under article I of the Constitution; or
20	"(3) such disclosure is authorized in writing by
21	the judge who is the subject of the complaint and by
22	the chief judge of the circuit, the Chief Justice, or
23	the chairman of the standing committee established
24	under section 331.
25	"(b) Public Availability of Written Orders.—
26	Each written order to implement any action under section

- 1 354(a)(1)(C), which is issued by a judicial council, the Ju-
- 2 dicial Conference, or the standing committee established
- 3 under section 331, shall be made available to the public
- 4 through the appropriate elerk's office of the court of ap-
- 5 peals for the circuit. Unless contrary to the interests of
- 6 justice, each such order shall be accompanied by written
- 7 reasons therefor.

8 "\\$361. Reimbursement of expenses

- 9 "Upon the request of a judge whose conduct is the
- 10 subject of a complaint under this chapter, the judicial
- 11 council may, if the complaint has been finally dismissed
- 12 under section 354(a)(1)(B), recommend that the Director
- 13 of the Administrative Office of the United States Courts
- 14 award reimbursement, from funds appropriated to the
- 15 Federal judiciary, for those reasonable expenses, including
- 16 attorneys' fees, incurred by that judge during the inves-
- 17 tigation which would not have been incurred but for the
- 18 requirements of this chapter.

19 **48362. Other provisions and rules not affected**

- 20 "Except as expressly provided in this chapter, noth-
- 21 ing in this chapter shall be construed to affect any other
- 22 provision of this title, the Federal Rules of Civil Proce-
- 23 dure, the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure, the Fed-
- 24 eral Rules of Appellate Procedure, or the Federal Rules
- 25 of Evidence.

1	"§ 363. Court of Federal Claims, Court of Inter-
2	national Trade, Court of Appeals for the
3	Federal Circuit
4	"The United States Court of Federal Claims, the
5	Court of International Trade, and the Court of Appeals
6	for the Federal Circuit shall each prescribe rules, con-
7	sistent with the provisions of this chapter, establishing
8	procedures for the filing of complaints with respect to the
9	conduct of any judge of such court and for the investiga-
10	tion and resolution of such complaints. In investigating
11	and taking action with respect to any such complaint, each
12	such court shall have the powers granted to a judicial
13	council under this chapter.
14	"§ 364. Effect of felony conviction
15	"In the case of any judge or judge of a court referred
16	to in section 363 who is convicted of a felony under State
17	or Federal law and has exhausted all means of obtaining
18	direct review of the conviction, or the time for seeking fur-
19	ther direct review of the conviction has passed and no such
20	review has been sought, that judge shall not hear eases
21	unless the judicial council of the circuit (or, in the case
22	of a judge of a court referred to in section 363, that court)
23	determines otherwise.".
24	(b) Conforming Amendment.—The table of chap-
25	ters for part I of title 28, United States Code, is amended

1	by inserting after the item relating to chapter 15 the fol-
2	lowing new item:
	"16. Complaints against judges and judicial discipline 351".
3	SEC. 3. TECHNICAL AMENDMENTS.
4	(a) Retirement for Disability.—(1) Section 372
5	of title 28, United States Code, is amended—
6	(A) in the section eaption by striking "; judi-
7	cial discipline"; and
8	(B) by striking subsection (c).
9	(2) The item relating to section 372 in the table of
10	sections for chapter 17 of title 28, United States Code,
11	is amended by striking "; judicial discipline".
12	(b) JUDICIAL CONFERENCE.—Section 331 of title 28,
13	United States Code, is amended in the fourth undesig-
14	nated paragraph by striking "section 372(e)" each place
15	it appears and inserting "chapter 16".
16	(e) Judicial Councils.—Section 332 of title 28,
17	United States Code, is amended—
18	(1) in subsection $(d)(2)$ —
19	(A) by striking "section 372(e) of this
20	title" and inserting "chapter 16 of this title";
21	and
22	(B) by striking "372(e)(4)" and inserting
23	"353"; and
24	(2) by striking the second subsection designated
25	as subsection (h).

1	(d) RECALL OF BANKRUPTCY JUDGES AND MAG-
2	ISTRATE JUDGES.—Section 375(d) of title 28, United
3	States Code, is amended by striking "section 372(e)" and
4	inserting "chapter 16".
5	(e) Director of the Administrative Office of
6	THE UNITED STATES COURTS.—Section 604 of title 28,
7	United States Code, is amended—
8	(1) in subsection $(a)(20)$ —
9	(A) in subparagraph (B), by striking
10	"372(e)(11)" and inserting "358"; and
11	(B) in subparagraph (C), by striking
12	"372(c)(15)" and inserting "360(b)"; and
13	(2) in subsection (h)—
14	(A) in paragraph (1), by striking "section
15	372" each place it appears and inserting "chap-
16	ter 16"; and
17	(B) in paragraph (2), by striking "section
18	372(e)" and inserting "chapter 16".
19	(f) Court of Appeals for Veterans Claims.—
20	Section 7253(g) of title 38, United States Code, is
21	amended—
22	(1) in paragraph (1)—
23	(A) by striking "section 372(e)" and in-
24	serting "chapter 16"; and

1	(B) by striking "such section" and insert-
2	ing "such chapter";
3	(2) in paragraph (2)—
4	(A) in the first sentence, by striking
5	"paragraphs (7) through (15) of section
6	372(e)" and inserting "sections 354(b) through
7	360"; and
8	(B) in the second sentence, by striking
9	"paragraph (7) or (8) of section 372(e)" and
10	inserting "section 354(b) or 355"; and
11	(3) in paragraph $(3)(B)$, by striking
12	"372(e)(16)" and inserting "361".
	Passed the House of Representatives July 22, 2002.
	Attest: JEFF TRANDAHL,
	Clerk.
13	SECTION 1. SHORT TITLE.
14	This Act may be cited as the "Judicial Improvements
15	Act of 2002".
16	SEC. 2. JUDICIAL DISCIPLINE PROCEDURES.
17	(a) In General.—Part I of title 28, United States
18	Code, is amended by inserting after chapter 15 the following
19	new chapter:
20	"CHAPTER 16—COMPLAINTS AGAINST JUDGES
21	AND JUDICIAL DISCIPLINE

^{``}Sec.

[&]quot;351. Complaints; judge defined.
"352. Review of complaint by chief judge.

- "353. Special committees.
- "354. Action by judicial council.
- "355. Action by Judicial Conference.
- "356. Subpoena power.
- "357. Review of orders and actions.
- "358. Rules.
- "359. Restrictions.
- "360. Disclosure of information.
- "361. Reimbursement of expenses.
- "362. Other provisions and rules not affected.
- "363. Court of Federal Claims, Court of International Trade, Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit.
- "364. Effect of felony conviction.

1 "§ 351. Complaints; judge defined

- 2 "(a) Filing of Complaint by Any Person.—Any
- 3 person alleging that a judge has engaged in conduct preju-
- 4 dicial to the effective and expeditious administration of the
- 5 business of the courts, or alleging that such judge is unable
- 6 to discharge all the duties of office by reason of mental or
- 7 physical disability, may file with the clerk of the court of
- 8 appeals for the circuit a written complaint containing a
- 9 brief statement of the facts constituting such conduct.
- 10 "(b) Identifying Complaint by Chief Judge.—In
- 11 the interests of the effective and expeditious administration
- 12 of the business of the courts and on the basis of information
- 13 available to the chief judge of the circuit, the chief judge
- 14 may, by written order stating reasons therefor, identify a
- 15 complaint for purposes of this chapter and thereby dispense
- 16 with filing of a written complaint.
- 17 "(c) Transmittal of Complaint.—Upon receipt of
- 18 a complaint filed under subsection (a), the clerk shall
- 19 promptly transmit the complaint to the chief judge of the

1 circuit, or, if the conduct complained of is that of the chief judge, to that circuit judge in regular active service next senior in date of commission (hereafter, for purposes of this 4 chapter only, included in the term 'chief judge'). The clerk shall simultaneously transmit a copy of the complaint to 5 the judge whose conduct is the subject of the complaint. The 6 clerk shall also transmit a copy of any complaint identified 8 under subsection (b) to the judge whose conduct is the subject of the complaint. 10 "(d) Definitions.—In this chapter— 11 "(1) the term 'judge' means a circuit judge, dis-12 trict judge, bankruptcy judge, or magistrate judge; 13 and 14 "(2) the term 'complainant' means the person 15 filing a complaint under subsection (a) of this section. 16 "§ 352. Review of complaint by chief judge 17 "(a) Expeditious Review; Limited Inquiry.—The chief judge shall expeditiously review any complaint re-18 19 ceived under section 351(a) or identified under section 20 351(b). In determining what action to take, the chief judge 21 may conduct a limited inquiry for the purpose of 22 determining— 23 "(1) whether appropriate corrective action has 24 been or can be taken without the necessity for a for-

25

mal investigation; and

1	"(2) whether the facts stated in the complaint
2	are either plainly untrue or are incapable of being es-
3	tablished through investigation.
4	For this purpose, the chief judge may request the judge
5	whose conduct is complained of to file a written response
6	to the complaint. Such response shall not be made available
7	to the complainant unless authorized by the judge filing the
8	response. The chief judge or his or her designee may also
9	communicate orally or in writing with the complainant,
10	the judge whose conduct is complained of, and any other
11	person who may have knowledge of the matter, and may
12	review any transcripts or other relevant documents. The
13	chief judge shall not undertake to make findings of fact
14	about any matter that is reasonably in dispute.
15	"(b) Action by Chief Judge Following Review.—
16	After expeditiously reviewing a complaint under subsection
17	(a), the chief judge, by written order stating his or her rea-
18	sons, may—
19	"(1) dismiss the complaint—
20	"(A) if the chief judge finds the complaint
21	to be—
22	"(i) not in conformity with section
23	351(a);
24	"(ii) directly related to the merits of a
25	decision or procedural ruling; or

1	"(iii) frivolous, lacking sufficient evi-
2	dence to raise an inference that misconduct
3	has occurred, or containing allegations
4	which are incapable of being established
5	through investigation; or
6	"(B) when a limited inquiry conducted
7	under subsection (a) demonstrates that the alle-
8	gations in the complaint lack any factual foun-
9	dation or are conclusively refuted by objective
10	$evidence;\ or$
11	"(2) conclude the proceeding if the chief judge
12	finds that appropriate corrective action has been
13	taken or that action on the complaint is no longer
14	necessary because of intervening events.
15	The chief judge shall transmit copies of the written order
16	to the complainant and to the judge whose conduct is the
17	subject of the complaint.
18	"(c) Review of Orders of Chief Judge.—A com-
19	plainant or judge aggrieved by a final order of the chief
20	judge under this section may petition the judicial council
21	of the circuit for review thereof. The denial of a petition
22	for review of the chief judge's order shall be final and con-
23	clusive and shall not be judicially reviewable on appeal or
24	otherwise.

"(d) Referral of Petitions for Review to Pan-1 ELS OF THE JUDICIAL COUNCIL.—Each judicial council 3 may, pursuant to rules prescribed under section 358, refer 4 a petition for review filed under subsection (c) to a panel of no fewer than 5 members of the council, at least 2 of whom shall be district judges. 7 "§ 353. Special committees 8 "(a) Appointment.—If the chief judge does not enter an order under section 352(b), the chief judge shall 10 promptly— 11 "(1) appoint himself or herself and equal num-12 bers of circuit and district judges of the circuit to a 13 special committee to investigate the facts and allega-14 tions contained in the complaint; 15 "(2) certify the complaint and any other docu-16 ments pertaining thereto to each member of such com-17 mittee; and 18 "(3) provide written notice to the complainant 19 and the judge whose conduct is the subject of the com-20 plaint of the action taken under this subsection. 21 "(b) Change in Status or Death of Judges.—A judge appointed to a special committee under subsection (a) 23 may continue to serve on that committee after becoming a senior judge or, in the case of the chief judge of the circuit, after his or her term as chief judge terminates under sub-

1	section (a)(3) or (c) of section 45. If a judge appointed to
2	a committee under subsection (a) dies, or retires from office
3	under section 371(a), while serving on the committee, the
4	chief judge of the circuit may appoint another circuit or
5	district judge, as the case may be, to the committee.
6	"(c) Investigation by Special Committee.—Each
7	committee appointed under subsection (a) shall conduct an
8	investigation as extensive as it considers necessary, and
9	shall expeditiously file a comprehensive written report
10	thereon with the judicial council of the circuit. Such report
11	shall present both the findings of the investigation and the
12	committee's recommendations for necessary and appro-
13	priate action by the judicial council of the circuit.
14	"§ 354. Action by judicial council
15	"(a) Actions Upon Receipt of Report.—
16	"(1) Actions.—The judicial council of a circuit,
17	upon receipt of a report filed under section 353(c)—
18	"(A) may conduct any additional investiga-
19	tion which it considers to be necessary;
20	"(B) may dismiss the complaint; and
21	"(C) if the complaint is not dismissed, shall
22	take such action as is appropriate to assure the
23	effective and expeditious administration of the
24	business of the courts within the circuit.

1	"(2) Description of possible actions if
2	COMPLAINT NOT DISMISSED.—
3	"(A) In general.—Action by the judicial
4	council under paragraph (1)(C) may include—
5	"(i) ordering that, on a temporary
6	basis for a time certain, no further cases be
7	assigned to the judge whose conduct is the
8	subject of a complaint;
9	"(ii) censuring or reprimanding such
10	judge by means of private communication;
11	and
12	"(iii) censuring or reprimanding such
13	judge by means of public announcement.
14	"(B) For article III Judges.—If the con-
15	duct of a judge appointed to hold office during
16	good behavior is the subject of the complaint, ac-
17	tion by the judicial council under paragraph
18	(1)(C) may $include$ —
19	"(i) certifying disability of the judge
20	pursuant to the procedures and standards
21	provided under section 372(b); and
22	"(ii) requesting that the judge volun-
23	tarily retire, with the provision that the
24	length of service requirements under section
25	371 of this title shall not apply.

1	"(C) For magistrate judges.—If the
2	conduct of a magistrate judge is the subject of the
3	complaint, action by the judicial council under
4	paragraph (1)(C) may include directing the chief
5	judge of the district of the magistrate judge to
6	take such action as the judicial council considers
7	appropriate.
8	"(3) Limitations on judicial council re-
9	GARDING REMOVALS.—
10	"(A) Article III Judges.—Under no cir-
11	cumstances may the judicial council order re-
12	moval from office of any judge appointed to hold
13	office during good behavior.
14	"(B) Magistrate and bankruptcy
15	JUDGES.—Any removal of a magistrate judge
16	under this subsection shall be in accordance with
17	section 631 and any removal of a bankruptcy
18	judge shall be in accordance with section 152.
19	"(4) Notice of action to judge.—The judi-
20	cial council shall immediately provide written notice
21	to the complainant and to the judge whose conduct is
22	the subject of the complaint of the action taken under
23	this subsection.
24	"(b) Referral to Judicial Conference.—

"(1) In general.—In addition to the authority
granted under subsection (a), the judicial council
may, in its discretion, refer any complaint under sec-
tion 351, together with the record of any associated
proceedings and its recommendations for appropriate
action, to the Judicial Conference of the United
States.
"(2) Special circumstances.—In any case in
which the judicial council determines, on the basis of
a complaint and an investigation under this chapter,
or on the basis of information otherwise available to
the judicial council, that a judge appointed to hold of-
fice during good behavior may have engaged in
conduct—
"(A) which might constitute one or more
grounds for impeachment under article II of the
$Constitution,\ or$
"(B) which, in the interest of justice, is not
amenable to resolution by the judicial council,
the judicial council shall promptly certify such deter-
mination, together with any complaint and a record
of any associated proceedings, to the Judicial Con-
ference of the United States.
"(3) Notice to complainant and judge.—A

judicial council acting under authority of this sub-

25

- 1 section shall, unless contrary to the interests of jus-
- 2 tice, immediately submit written notice to the com-
- 3 plainant and to the judge whose conduct is the subject
- 4 of the action taken under this subsection.

5 "§ 355. Action by Judicial Conference

- 6 "(a) In General.—Upon referral or certification of
- 7 any matter under section 354(b), the Judicial Conference,
- 8 after consideration of the prior proceedings and such addi-
- 9 tional investigation as it considers appropriate, shall by
- 10 majority vote take such action, as described in section
- 11 354(a)(1)(C) and (2), as it considers appropriate.
- 12 "(b) If Impeachment Warranted.—
- 13 "(1) In General.—If the Judicial Conference
- 14 concurs in the determination of the judicial council,
- or makes its own determination, that consideration of
- impeachment may be warranted, it shall so certify
- and transmit the determination and the record of
- proceedings to the House of Representatives for what-
- 19 ever action the House of Representatives considers to
- be necessary. Upon receipt of the determination and
- 21 record of proceedings in the House of Representatives,
- 22 the Clerk of the House of Representatives shall make
- 23 available to the public the determination and any
- reasons for the determination.

1 "(2) In case of felony conviction.—If a 2 judge has been convicted of a felony under State or 3 Federal law and has exhausted all means of obtaining 4 direct review of the conviction, or the time for seeking 5 further direct review of the conviction has passed and 6 no such review has been sought, the Judicial Con-7 ference may, by majority vote and without referral or 8 certification under section 354(b), transmit to the 9 House of Representatives a determination that consid-10 eration of impeachment may be warranted, together 11 with appropriate court records, for whatever action 12 the House of Representatives considers to be nec-13 essary.

14 "§ 356. Subpoena power

- 15 "(a) Judicial Councils and Special Commit-
- 16 TEES.—In conducting any investigation under this chapter,
- 17 the judicial council, or a special committee appointed under
- 18 section 353, shall have full subpoena powers as provided
- 19 in section 332(d).
- 20 "(b) Judicial Conference and Standing Commit-
- 21 TEES.—In conducting any investigation under this chapter,
- 22 the Judicial Conference, or a standing committee appointed
- 23 by the Chief Justice under section 331, shall have full sub-
- 24 poena powers as provided in that section.

1 "§ 357. Review of orders and actions

- 2 "(a) Review of Action of Judicial Council.—A
- 3 complainant or judge aggrieved by an action of the judicial
- 4 council under section 354 may petition the Judicial Con-
- 5 ference of the United States for review thereof.
- 6 "(b) Action of Judicial Conference.—The Judi-
- 7 cial Conference, or the standing committee established
- 8 under section 331, may grant a petition filed by a com-
- 9 plainant or judge under subsection (a).
- 10 "(c) No Judicial Review.—Except as expressly pro-
- 11 vided in this section and section 352(c), all orders and de-
- 12 terminations, including denials of petitions for review, shall
- 13 be final and conclusive and shall not be judicially review-
- 14 able on appeal or otherwise.
- 15 "§ 358. Rules
- 16 "(a) In General.—Each judicial council and the Ju-
- 17 dicial Conference may prescribe such rules for the conduct
- 18 of proceedings under this chapter, including the processing
- 19 of petitions for review, as each considers to be appropriate.
- 20 "(b) Required Provisions.—Rules prescribed under
- 21 subsection (a) shall contain provisions requiring that—
- 22 "(1) adequate prior notice of any investigation
- be given in writing to the judge whose conduct is the
- subject of a complaint under this chapter;
- 25 "(2) the judge whose conduct is the subject of a
- 26 complaint under this chapter be afforded an oppor-

- 1 tunity to appear (in person or by counsel) at pro-
- 2 ceedings conducted by the investigating panel, to
- 3 present oral and documentary evidence, to compel the
- 4 attendance of witnesses or the production of docu-
- 5 ments, to cross-examine witnesses, and to present ar-
- 6 gument orally or in writing; and
- 7 "(3) the complainant be afforded an opportunity
- 8 to appear at proceedings conducted by the inves-
- 9 tigating panel, if the panel concludes that the com-
- 10 plainant could offer substantial information.
- 11 "(c) Procedures.—Any rule prescribed under this
- 12 section shall be made or amended only after giving appro-
- 13 priate public notice and an opportunity for comment. Any
- 14 such rule shall be a matter of public record, and any such
- 15 rule promulgated by a judicial council may be modified by
- 16 the Judicial Conference. No rule promulgated under this
- 17 section may limit the period of time within which a person
- 18 may file a complaint under this chapter.

19 **"§ 359. Restrictions**

- 20 "(a) Restriction on Individuals Who Are Sub-
- 21 JECT OF INVESTIGATION.—No judge whose conduct is the
- 22 subject of an investigation under this chapter shall serve
- 23 upon a special committee appointed under section 353,
- 24 upon a judicial council, upon the Judicial Conference, or
- 25 upon the standing committee established under section 331,

- 1 until all proceedings under this chapter relating to such in-
- 2 vestigation have been finally terminated.
- 3 "(b) Amicus Curiae.—No person shall be granted the
- 4 right to intervene or to appear as amicus curiae in any
- 5 proceeding before a judicial council or the Judicial Con-
- 6 ference under this chapter.

7 "§ 360. Disclosure of information

- 8 "(a) Confidentiality of Proceedings.—Except as
- 9 provided in section 355, all papers, documents, and records
- 10 of proceedings related to investigations conducted under this
- 11 chapter shall be confidential and shall not be disclosed by
- 12 any person in any proceeding except to the extent that—
- "(1) the judicial council of the circuit in its dis-
- cretion releases a copy of a report of a special com-
- 15 mittee under section 353(c) to the complainant whose
- 16 complaint initiated the investigation by that special
- 17 committee and to the judge whose conduct is the sub-
- ject of the complaint;
- 19 "(2) the judicial council of the circuit, the Judi-
- 20 cial Conference of the United States, or the Senate or
- 21 the House of Representatives by resolution, releases
- any such material which is believed necessary to an
- 23 impeachment investigation or trial of a judge under
- 24 article I of the Constitution; or

- 1 "(3) such disclosure is authorized in writing by
- 2 the judge who is the subject of the complaint and by
- 3 the chief judge of the circuit, the Chief Justice, or the
- 4 chairman of the standing committee established under
- 5 *section 331.*
- 6 "(b) Public Availability of Written Orders.—
- 7 Each written order to implement any action under section
- 8 354(a)(1)(C), which is issued by a judicial council, the Ju-
- 9 dicial Conference, or the standing committee established
- 10 under section 331, shall be made available to the public
- 11 through the appropriate clerk's office of the court of appeals
- 12 for the circuit. Unless contrary to the interests of justice,
- 13 each such order shall be accompanied by written reasons
- 14 therefor.

15 "§ 361. Reimbursement of expenses

- "Upon the request of a judge whose conduct is the sub-
- 17 ject of a complaint under this chapter, the judicial council
- 18 may, if the complaint has been finally dismissed under sec-
- 19 tion 354(a)(1)(B), recommend that the Director of the Ad-
- 20 ministrative Office of the United States Courts award reim-
- 21 bursement, from funds appropriated to the Federal judici-
- 22 ary, for those reasonable expenses, including attorneys' fees,
- 23 incurred by that judge during the investigation which
- 24 would not have been incurred but for the requirements of
- 25 this chapter.

1 "§ 362. Other provisions and rules not affected

- 2 "Except as expressly provided in this chapter, nothing
- 3 in this chapter shall be construed to affect any other provi-
- 4 sion of this title, the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, the
- 5 Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure, the Federal Rules of
- 6 Appellate Procedure, or the Federal Rules of Evidence.
- 7 "§ 363. Court of Federal Claims, Court of Inter-
- 8 national Trade, Court of Appeals for the
- 9 Federal Circuit
- 10 "The United States Court of Federal Claims, the Court
- 11 of International Trade, and the Court of Appeals for the
- 12 Federal Circuit shall each prescribe rules, consistent with
- 13 the provisions of this chapter, establishing procedures for
- 14 the filing of complaints with respect to the conduct of any
- 15 judge of such court and for the investigation and resolution
- 16 of such complaints. In investigating and taking action with
- 17 respect to any such complaint, each such court shall have
- 18 the powers granted to a judicial council under this chapter.

19 "§ 364. Effect of felony conviction

- 20 "In the case of any judge or judge of a court referred
- 21 to in section 363 who is convicted of a felony under State
- 22 or Federal law and has exhausted all means of obtaining
- 23 direct review of the conviction, or the time for seeking fur-
- 24 ther direct review of the conviction has passed and no such
- 25 review has been sought, the following shall apply:

1	"(1) The judge shall not hear or decide cases un-
2	less the judicial council of the circuit (or, in the case
3	of a judge of a court referred to in section 363, that
4	court) determines otherwise.
5	"(2) Any service as such judge or judge of a
6	court referred to in section 363, after the conviction
7	is final and all time for filing appeals thereof has ex-
8	pired, shall not be included for purposes of deter-
9	mining years of service under section 371(c), 377, or
10	178 of this title or creditable service under subchapter
11	III of chapter 83, or chapter 84, of title 5.".
12	(b) Conforming Amendment.—The table of chapters
13	for part I of title 28, United States Code, is amended by
14	inserting after the item relating to chapter 15 the following
15	new item:
	"16. Complaints against judges and judicial discipline 351".
16	SEC. 3. TECHNICAL AMENDMENTS.
17	(a) Retirement for Disability.—(1) Section 372 of
18	title 28, United States Code, is amended—
19	(A) in the section caption by striking "; judi-
20	cial discipline"; and
21	(B) by striking subsection (c).
22	(2) The item relating to section 372 in the table of
23	sections for chapter 17 of title 28, United States Code, is
24	amended by striking "; judicial discipline".

```
1
        (b) Judicial Conference.—Section 331 of title 28,
   United States Code, is amended in the fourth undesignated
   paragraph by striking "section 372(c)" each place it ap-
   pears and inserting "chapter 16".
 5
        (c) Judicial Councils.—Section 332 of title 28,
 6
    United States Code, is amended—
 7
             (1) in subsection (d)(2)—
 8
                 (A) by striking "section 372(c) of this title"
 9
             and inserting "chapter 16 of this title"; and
                 (B) by striking "372(c)(4)" and inserting
10
11
             "353"; and
12
             (2) by striking the second subsection designated
13
        as subsection (h).
        (d) Recall of Bankruptcy Judges and Mag-
14
   ISTRATE Judges.—Section 375(d) of title 28, United
   States Code, is amended by striking "section 372(c)" and
16
   inserting "chapter 16".
17
18
        (e) Director of the Administrative Office of
19
   THE UNITED STATES COURTS.—Section 604 of title 28,
20
    United States Code, is amended—
21
             (1) in subsection (a)(20)—
22
                 (A) in subparagraph (B), by striking
23
             "372(c)(11)" and inserting "358"; and
24
                 (B) in subparagraph (C), by striking
             "372(c)(15)" and inserting "360(b)"; and
25
```

1	(2) in subsection (h)—
2	(A) in paragraph (1), by striking "section
3	372" each place it appears and inserting "chap-
4	ter 16"; and
5	(B) in paragraph (2), by striking "section
6	372(c)" and inserting "chapter 16".
7	(f) Court of Appeals for Veterans Claims.—Sec-
8	tion 7253(g) of title 38, United States Code, is amended—
9	(1) in paragraph (1)—
10	(A) by striking "section 372(c)" and insert-
11	ing "chapter 16"; and
12	(B) by striking "such section" and inserting
13	"such chapter";
14	(2) in paragraph (2)—
15	(A) in the first sentence, by striking "para-
16	graphs (7) through (15) of section 372(c)" and
17	inserting "sections 354(b) through 360"; and
18	(B) in the second sentence, by striking
19	"paragraph (7) or (8) of section 372(c)" and in-
20	serting "section 354(b) or 355"; and
21	(3) in paragraph (3)(B), by striking
22	"372(c)(16)" and inserting "361".
23	SEC. 4. SEVERABILITY.
24	If any provision of this Act, an amendment made by
25	this Act, or the application of such provision or amendment

- 1 to any person or circumstance is held to be unconstitu-
- 2 tional, the remainder of this Act, the amendments made by
- 3 this Act, and the application of the provisions of such to
- 4 any person or circumstance shall not be affected thereby.

Calendar No. 532

 ${}^{\tiny{107\text{TH CONGRESS}}}_{\tiny{2D Session}}~\textbf{H.R. 3892}$

AN ACT

To amend title 28, United States Code, to make certain modifications in the judicial discipline procedures, and for other purposes.

July 31, 2002

Reported with an amendment