

1 Michael R. Lazerwitz (PRO HAC VICE)  
2 Jeremy J. Calsyn (State Bar No. 205062)  
3 Lee F. Berger (State Bar No. 222756)  
4 CLEARY GOTTLIEB STEEN & HAMILTON LLP  
5 2000 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Suite 9000  
6 Washington, DC 20006  
7 (202) 974-1500 (Phone)  
(202) 974-1999 (Facsimile)  
*mlazerwitz@cgsh.com*  
*jcalsyn@cgsh.com*  
*lberger@cgsh.com*

8 *Counsel for Defendants LG Display Co., Ltd. and LG Display America, Inc.*

9 [Additional counsel listed on signature page]

10 Roman M. Silberfeld (State Bar No. 62783)  
11 Michael A. Geibelson (State Bar No. 179970)  
12 ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI LLP  
13 2049 Century Park East, Suite 3400  
14 Los Angeles, CA 90067-3208  
Telephone: 310-552-0130  
Facsimile: 310-229-5800

15 *Counsel for Plaintiffs*

16 [Additional counsel listed on signature page]

17 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
18 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
19 (SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION)

20  
21 BEST BUY CO., INC., et al.,  
22 Plaintiffs,  
23 v.  
24 AU OPTRONICS CORPORATION, et al.,  
25 Defendants.

CASE NO. 3:07-md-1827 SI  
INDIVIDUAL ACTION NO. 10-cv-4572  
**STIPULATION OF EXTENSION OF TIME  
TO RESPOND TO COMPLAINT, WAIVER  
OF SERVICE, PRODUCTION OF DATA,  
AND [PROPOSED] ORDER**

**Assigned to Hon. Susan J. Illston, United  
States District Judge**

1 *Whereas* the undersigned counsel, on behalf of their respective clients, plaintiffs Best Buy Co., Inc.,  
2 Best Buy Purchasing LLC, Best Buy Enterprise Services, Inc., Best Buy Stores, L.P., Best Buy China  
3 Ltd., and Magnolia Hi-Fi, Inc. (collectively, “Best Buy”) filed a complaint in the above-captioned  
4 case against AU Optronics Corporation, AU Optronics Corporation America, Chimei Innolux  
5 Corporation f/k/a Chi Mei Optoelectronics Corporation, Chi Mei Optoelectronics USA, Inc., CMO  
6 Japan Co., Ltd., Epson Imaging Devices Corporation, Epson Electronics America, Inc., Seiko Epson  
7 Corporation, HannStar Display Corporation, Hitachi, Ltd., Hitachi Displays, Ltd., Hitachi Electronic  
8 Devices (USA), Inc., LG Display Co., Ltd., LG Display America, Inc., Sharp Corporation, Sharp  
9 Electronics Corporation, and Tatung Company of America, Inc., (collectively, “Stipulating  
10 Defendants”), among other defendants, on October 8, 2010 (“Complaint”);

11 *Whereas* Best Buy wishes to avoid the burden and expense of serving process on the Stipulating  
12 Defendants;

13 *Whereas* the Stipulating Defendants desire a reasonable amount of time to respond to the Complaint;

14 *Whereas* Best Buy agrees to produce certain data relevant to its claims and the claims of other  
15 plaintiffs in related cases; and

16 *Whereas* Best Buy and the Stipulating Defendants believe that proceeding on a unified response date  
17 and setting a production date for certain data will create efficiency for the Court and the parties by  
18 reducing duplicative motion practice and avoiding needless discovery disputes;

19 THEREFORE, Best Buy and the Stipulating Defendants hereby agree:

- 20 1. The Stipulating Defendants waive service of the Complaint under Federal Rule of Civil  
21 Procedure 4(d). This stipulation does not constitute a waiver by the Stipulating Defendants of  
22 any other substantive or procedural defense, including but not limited to the defense of lack of  
23 personal or subject matter jurisdiction and improper venue.
- 24 2. The Stipulating Defendants’ deadline to move to dismiss, answer, or otherwise respond to the  
25 Complaint will be 90 days from the execution of this stipulation, subject to Federal Rule of  
26 Civil Procedure 6(a)(1).

- 1 3. By 30 calendar days from the execution of this stipulation, Best Buy will produce data  
2 responsive to the requests in Annex A, except with respect to purchase-for-resale data and  
3 sales data for the 2008 calendar year, which data Best Buy will use its best efforts to produce  
4 within 60 days. All data produced under this stipulation supersedes data produced in response  
5 to class plaintiffs' subpoena on Best Buy dated March 4, 2008. Neither this stipulation nor  
6 any production made under this stipulation may serve as a limit on any further discovery  
7 requests or objections to future discovery requests by Best Buy or Stipulating Defendants.
- 8 4. Best Buy's claims do not include claims based on any product purchased for Best Buy's own  
9 consumption.
- 10 5. Best Buy does not yet know and cannot yet identify the manufacturer of the TFT-LCD panels  
11 contained in the TFT-LCD televisions, notebook computers, monitors, and other finished  
12 products it purchased.

13 DATED: February 9, 2011

14  
15 By: /s/ Michael R. Lazerwitz  
16 Michael R. Lazerwitz (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
17 Jeremy J. Calsyn (State Bar No. 205062)  
18 Lee F. Berger (State Bar No. 222756)  
19 CLEARY GOTTLIEB STEEN & HAMILTON LLP  
20 2000 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
21 Washington, DC 20006  
22 (202) 974-1500 (Phone)  
23 (202) 974-1999 (Facsimile)  
24 *mlazerwitz@cgsh.com*  
25 *Counsel for Defendants LG Display Co., Ltd. and LG Display America, Inc.*

26  
27 By: /s/ Christopher A. Nedeau  
28 Christopher A. Nedeau (State Bar No. 81297)  
NOSSAMAN LLP  
50 California Street, 34th Floor  
San Francisco, California 94111-4799  
(415) 398-3600 (Phone)  
(415) 398-2438 (Facsimile)  
*cnedeau@nossaman.com*  
*Counsel for Defendants AU Optronics Corporation and AU Optronics Corporation America*

1 By:  /s/ Steven Cherry

2 Steven Cherry

3 Adam Raviv

4 WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP

5 1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

6 Washington, DC 20006-3642

(202) 663-6000 (Phone)

(202) 663-6363 (Facsimile)

*steven.cherry@wilmerhale.com*

7 Nathan L. Walker (State Bar No. 206128)

8 WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP

9 950 Page Mill Road

10 Palo Alto, California 94304

(650) 858-6000 (Phone)

(650) 858-6100 (Facsimile)

*Nathan.Walker@wilmerhale.com*

11  
12 *Counsel for Defendants Chimei Innolux Corporation f/k/a Chi Mei Optoelectronics Corporation, and*  
13 *Chi Mei Optoelectronics USA, Inc., CMO Japan Co., Ltd.,*

14 By:  /s/ Stephen P. Freccero

15 Morrison & Foerster LLP

16 MELVIN R. GOLDMAN (State Bar No. 34097)

17 STEPHEN P. FRECCERO (State Bar No. 131093)

18 DEREK F. FORAN (State Bar No. 224569)

19 425 Market Street

20 San Francisco, California 94105-2482

(415) 268-7000 (Phone)

(415) 268-7522 (Facsimile)

*MGoldman@mofocom*

*SFreccero@mofocom*

*DForan@mofocom*

21  
22 Attorneys for Defendants EPSON IMAGING DEVICES CORPORATION, EPSON  
23 ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., and SEIKO EPSON CORPORATION  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 By:  /s/ Ramona M. Emerson  
2 Hugh F. Bangasser (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
3 Ramona M. Emerson (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
4 K&L Gates LLP  
5 925 Fourth Avenue, Suite 2900  
6 Seattle, WA 98004-1158  
7 (206) 623-7580 (Phone)  
8 (206) 623-7022 (Facsimile)  
9 *hugh.bangasser@klgates.com*  
10 *ramona.emerson@klgates.com*

11 Jeffrey L. Bornstein (State Bar No. 99358)  
12 K&L GATES LLP  
13 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1200  
14 San Francisco, CA 94111-5994  
15 (415) 882-8200 (Phone)  
16 (415) 882-8220 (Facsimile)  
17 *jeff.Bornstein@klgates.com*

18 *Counsel for Defendant HannStar Display Corporation*

19 By:  /s/ Kent M. Roger  
20 Kent M. Roger (State Bar No. 95987)  
21 Michelle Kim-Szrom (State Bar No. 252901)  
22 MORGAN LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
23 One Market, Spear Street Tower  
24 San Francisco, CA 94105-1126  
25 (415) 442-1000 (Phone)  
26 (415) 442-1001 (Facsimile)  
27 *kruger@morganlewis.com*  
28 *mkim-szrom@morganlewis.com*

*Counsel for Defendants Hitachi, Ltd., Hitachi Displays, Ltd. and Hitachi Electronic Devices (USA), Inc.*

By:  /s/ Fusae Nara  
John M. Grenfell (State Bar No. 88500)  
Jacob R. Sorensen (State Bar No. 209134)  
Fusae Nara (*pro hac vice*)  
PILLSBURY WINTHROP SHAW PITTMAN LLP  
50 Fremont Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
(415) 983-1000 (Phone)  
(415) 983-1200 (Facsimile)  
*john.grenfell@pillsburylaw.com*  
*jake.sorensen@pillsburylaw.com*

1 *fusaenara@pillsburylaw.com*

2 *Counsel for Defendants Sharp Corporation and Sharp Electronics Corporation*

3 By:     /s/ Patrick J. Ahern    

4 Patrick J. Ahern (*pro hac vice*)

BAKER & MCKENZIE LLP

5 130 East Randolph Drive

Chicago, IL 60601

6 (312) 861-3735 (Phone)

7 (312) 698-2034 (Facsimile)

patrick.ahern@bakermckenzie.com

8 *Counsel for Defendant Tatum Co. of America, Inc.*

9  
10 By:     /s/ Michael A. Geibelson    

11 Roman M. Silberfeld (State Bar No. 62783)

Michael A. Geibelson (State Bar No. 179970)

12 ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI LLP

2049 Century Park East, Suite 3400

13 Los Angeles, CA 90067-3208

14 Telephone: 310-552-0130

Facsimile: 310-229-5800

15 Elliot S. Kaplan (*Pending Pro Hac Vice Application*)

16 K. Craig Wildfang (*Pending Pro Hac Vice Application*)

ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI LLP

17 800 LaSalle Avenue

2800 LaSalle Plaza

18 Minneapolis, MN 55402

19 Telephone: 612-349-8500

Facsimile: 612-339-4181

20  
21 *Counsel for Plaintiffs*

22 Attestation: The filer of this document attests that the concurrence of the other  
23 signatories thereto has been obtained.

24     /s/ Michael R. Lazerwitz    

25 SO ORDERED <sup>2/10/11</sup>

26 By:     Susan Helton    

Judge of the U.S. District Court, N.D. California

1 **ANNEX A: Best Buy's Production of Data**

2 **STIPULATED DEFINITIONS**

3 The words and phrases used in this Annex A shall have the meanings ascribed to them under the  
4 Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and the Local Rules of the United States District Court for the  
5 Northern District of California. In addition, the following terms shall have the meanings set forth  
6 below whenever used in any Request for Production of Documents.

- 7 1. "Acquired" or "acquisition" means or refers to, without limitation, anything given,  
8 purchased, received or that Best Buy came to possess.
- 9 2. "Document" and "documents" shall have the meaning ascribed to them under the  
10 Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and shall also mean all electronically stored  
11 information ("ESI") including, without limitation, electronic data or data compilations,  
12 electronic files, e-mail and other electronic communications saved to or located on  
13 hard disks, file servers, floppy disks, CDs, DVDs, backup tapes, thumb drives, or any  
14 other electronic media, whether or not in tangible or electronic form.
- 15 3. "Including" or "includes" means without limitation.
- 16 4. "TFT-LCD Panel" means a flat panel display screen, called a Thin Film Transistor  
17 Liquid Crystal Display, that consists of a liquid crystal compound containing pixels  
18 that are sandwiched between two pieces of glass called substrates, and each pixel has a  
19 transistor built into it and changes polarization of light when voltage is applied to that  
20 transistor; and, as used herein, the term "TFT-LCD Panel" includes a module  
21 consisting of a TFT-LCD Panel attached to a backlight, a driver, and other elements  
22 needed for the TFT-LCD Panel to modulate illumination and generate images.
- 23 5. "TFT-LCD Product" means a product or finished good that contains a TFT-LCD  
24 Panel.
- 25 6. The term "person" or "persons" includes any natural person, public entity, partnership,  
26 corporation, association, firm, trust, joint venture, agency, board, authority,  
27 commission or other such entity.
- 28

- 1 7. "Type" means the product name, brand, model and product/serial number.
- 2 8. "Best Buy" means each of Plaintiffs Best Buy Co., Inc., Best Buy Purchasing LLC,
- 3 Best Buy Enterprise Services, Inc., Best Buy Stores, L.P., Best Buy China Ltd., and
- 4 Magnolia Hi-Fi, Inc. and each of their parent companies and subsidiaries.
- 5 9. "Net Purchase Price" "Contains the cost of the SKU for this Shipment/Location
- 6 combination based on the purchase order cost for the item." OR "The unit cost for the
- 7 SKU on the order, including discounts (deal/bracket/allowance), but not landed cost
- 8 components."

9 **STIPULATED INSTRUCTIONS**

- 10 1. The scope of documents subject to production in response to the production requests below
- 11 include all documents in Best Buy's possession, custody, or control, wherever located,
- 12 including without limitation any document available to Best Buy upon request from its
- 13 parents, affiliates, subsidiaries, employees, officers, directors, attorneys, accountants,
- 14 financial advisors, consultants, private investigators, or other agents or persons acting or
- 15 purporting to act on Best Buy's behalf, as required by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure
- 16 and the applicable local rules.
- 17 2. All electronically stored information shall be produced in accordance with the Protocol
- 18 Governing the Production of Electronically Stored Information, attached as Exhibit A to the
- 19 Joint Case Management Conference Statement filed in this matter on January 10, 2008, and
- 20 binding on Best Buy under the Special Master's Order of March 12, 2010 (Dkt. No. 1595).
- 21 Documents originating in paper or other hard copy format should be produced in 300 DPI
- 22 Group IV Monochrome Tagged Image File Format (.TIFF or .TIF) files. TIFF files shall be
- 23 produced in single-page format along with image load files (.DII file and .OPT file and .LFP
- 24 file). All documents are to be provided with multi-page searchable text (.TXT) files. These
- 25 text files and image load files should indicate page breaks to the extent possible, as well as
- 26 Production Number Begin, Production Number End, Production Attachment Range Number
- 27 Begin, Production Attachment Range Number End, and Production Document Page Count.



1 As well, each .TIFF image should be branded with the applicable Bates number and  
2 confidentiality designation.

- 3 3. The production requests in this Annex are designed to capture, among other things,  
4 acquisitions, sales, and transfer pricing, and to permit the tracing of products throughout  
5 various plaintiffs. For example, if Best Buy Purchasing LLC purchased a TFT-LCD Product  
6 from a manufacturer and then sent that TFT-LCD Product to Best Buy Stores L.P., which in  
7 turn sold the TFT-LCD Product to a consumer, Best Buy Purchasing LLC's data would show  
8 both the acquisition from the manufacturer and the sale to Best Buy Stores L.P., and Best Buy  
9 Stores L.P.'s data would show the acquisition from Best Buy Purchasing LLC and the sale to  
10 the consumer. Further, the linking data would enable tracing of that TFT-LCD Product from  
11 Best Buy Purchasing LLC's acquisition from the manufacturer, through the various plaintiffs  
12 and their parents and subsidiaries, to the sale of the TFT-LCD Product to a consumer.

13  
14 **STIPULATED PRODUCTION NO. 1: Purchase-For-Resale Data**

- 15 a. Best Buy will produce for the period January 1, 2003 through December 31, 2008, for each  
16 TFT-LCD Panel or TFT-LCD Product Best Buy acquired that Best Buy subsequently resold,  
17 data regarding that acquisition in the following categories: the purchase date; the vendor; the  
18 TFT-LCD Panel or TFT-LCD Product name; the TFT-LCD Panel or TFT-LCD Product  
19 brand; the TFT-LCD Panel or TFT-LCD Product model; the quantity purchased; the TFT-  
20 LCD Panel's or TFT-LCD Product's manufacturer; the Net Purchase Price; the purchase  
21 order number; the shipping identification number, and the SKU number.
- 22 b. Best Buy will produce data adequate to tabulate aggregate purchase totals by SKU for any  
23 selected period from January 1, 1996 through December 31, 2002. The purchase data  
24 provided under this section 1(b) is reflected in the Point of Sale data provided under  
25 Production No. 2. The purchase data provided under this section 1(b) is constructed by  
26 totaling the field called Tot Xtn'd SKU Cost AMT by SKU from January 1, 1996 through  
27 December 31, 2002.

1  
2 **STIPULATED PRODUCTION NO. 2: Sales Data**

- 3 a. Separately for each Best Buy entity, Best Buy will produce, for the period January 1, 1996  
4 through December 31, 2008, for each sale by Best Buy of any TFT-LCD Panel or TFT-LCD  
5 Product, data regarding that sale in the following categories: sale date; sale location by store  
6 number; product name; product brand; quantity sold; net sales price; approximate net  
7 purchase price; transaction keys, and SKU numbers.
- 8 b. Additional data can be gleaned from the other data provided, such as product descriptions  
9 from SKUs, and classes and subclasses of products.

10 **STIPULATED PRODUCTION NO. 3: Linking Data**

11 Best Buy states that it does not have data sufficient to track or link individual products sold to  
12 individual products purchased for each sale to a customer, in other words, the purchase information  
13 provided in response No. 1 to purchases identified in documents in Response No. 2. Best Buy will  
14 identify people who can discuss Best Buy's inventory control practices with respect to the TFT-LCD  
15 Panels and TFT-LCD Products.

16 **STIPULATED PRODUCTION NO. 4: Other Codes In Data Sets**

17 Best Buy will provide the SKU information referenced above in Production No. 1 and Production No.  
18 2, the product class and subclass information to which they belong that is contained in Best Buy's  
19 SKU look-up table for the included products and that discloses how Best Buy groups SKUs into  
20 classes and subclasses) and that contains its narrative product descriptions for each SKU number. To  
21 the extent the data provided under Production No. 1 and Production No. 2 above contain other codes,  
22 symbols, or abbreviations (other than with respect to the product descriptions in the SKU look-up  
23 table referred to in the preceding sentence), Best Buy will produce a key explaining the meaning of  
24 any such codes, symbols, or abbreviations.