

114
NATIONAL BUREAU OF STANDARDS REPORT

2104

MINIMAX THEOREMS

by

Ky Fan



**U. S. DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
NATIONAL BUREAU OF STANDARDS**

U. S. DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE

Charles Sawyer, *Secretary*

NATIONAL BUREAU OF STANDARDS

A. V. Astin, *Director*



THE NATIONAL BUREAU OF STANDARDS

The scope of activities of the National Bureau of Standards is suggested in the following listing of the divisions and sections engaged in technical work. In general, each section is engaged in specialized research, development, and engineering in the field indicated by its title. A brief description of the activities, and of the resultant reports and publications, appears on the inside of the back cover of this report.

Electricity. Resistance Measurements. Inductance and Capacitance. Electrical Instruments. Magnetic Measurements. Applied Electricity. Electrochemistry.

Optics and Metrology. Photometry and Colorimetry. Optical Instruments. Photographic Technology. Length. Gage.

Heat and Power. Temperature Measurements. Thermodynamics. Cryogenics. Engines and Lubrication. Engine Fuels. Cryogenic Engineering.

Atomic and Radiation Physics. Spectroscopy. Radiometry. Mass Spectrometry. Solid State Physics. Electron Physics. Atomic Physics. Neutron Measurements. Infrared Spectroscopy. Nuclear Physics. Radioactivity. X-Rays. Betatron. Nucleonic Instrumentation. Radiological Equipment. Atomic Energy Commission Instruments Branch.

Chemistry. Organic Coatings. Surface Chemistry. Organic Chemistry. Analytical Chemistry. Inorganic Chemistry. Electrodeposition. Gas Chemistry. Physical Chemistry. Thermochemistry. Spectrochemistry. Pure Substances.

Mechanics. Sound. Mechanical Instruments. Aerodynamics. Engineering Mechanics. Hydraulics. Mass. Capacity, Density, and Fluid Meters.

Organic and Fibrous Materials. Rubber. Textiles. Paper. Leather. Testing and Specifications. Polymer Structure. Organic Plastics. Dental Research.

Metallurgy. Thermal Metallurgy. Chemical Metallurgy. Mechanical Metallurgy. Corrosion.

Mineral Products. Porcelain and Pottery. Glass. Refractories. Enameled Metals. Concrete Materials. Constitution and Microstructure. Chemistry of Mineral Products.

Building Technology. Structural Engineering. Fire Protection. Heating and Air Conditioning. Floor, Roof, and Wall Coverings. Codes and Specifications.

Applied Mathematics. Numerical Analysis. Computation. Statistical Engineering. Machine Development.

Electronics. Engineering Electronics. Electron Tubes. Electronic Computers. Electronic Instrumentation.

Radio Propagation. Upper Atmosphere Research. Ionospheric Research. Regular Propagation Services. Frequency Utilization Research. Tropospheric Propagation Research. High Frequency Standards. Microwave Standards.

Ordnance Development. These three divisions are engaged in a broad program of research and development in advanced ordnance. Activities include basic and applied research, engineering, pilot production, field testing, and evaluation of a wide variety of ordnance matériel. Special skills and facilities of other NBS divisions also contribute to this program. The activity is sponsored by the Department of Defense.

Missile Development. Missile research and development: engineering, dynamics, intelligence, instrumentation, evaluation. Combustion in jet engines. These activities are sponsored by the Department of Defense.

● Office of Basic Instrumentation

● Office of Weights and Measures.

NATIONAL BUREAU OF STANDARDS REPORT

NBS PROJECT

NBS REPORT

1102-20-1104

December 10, 1952

2104

MINIMAX THEOREMS

by

Ky Fan

University of Notre Dame
American University



The publication, reprinting
unless permission is obtained
from the National Institute of
Standards, D. C. Such permission
should be obtained if that agency

Approved for public release by the
Director of the National Institute of
Standards and Technology (NIST)
on October 9, 2015

It is prohibited
to reproduce, in whole or in part,
this report, or its contents,
without the express written
permission of the National Institute
of Standards and Technology.

MINIMAX THEOREMS*

by

Ky Fan

Department of Mathematics, University of Notre Dame

Various generalizations of von Neumann's minimax theorem¹ have been given by several authors (J. Ville², A. Wald², S. Karlin², H. Kneser³, K. Fan⁴). In all these theorems, the structure of linear spaces is always present. This Note contains some new minimax theorems involving no linear space.

1. Let f be a real-valued function defined on the product set $X \times Y$ of two arbitrary sets X, Y (not necessarily topologized). f is said to be convex on X , if for any two elements $x_1, x_2 \in X$ and two numbers $\xi_1 \geq 0, \xi_2 \geq 0$ with $\xi_1 + \xi_2 = 1$, there exists an element $x_0 \in X$ such that $f(x_0, y) \leq \xi_1 f(x_1, y) + \xi_2 f(x_2, y)$ for all $y \in Y$. Similarly f is said to be concave on Y , if for

-
1. Von Neumann, J., "Zur Theorie der Gesellschaftsspiele", Math. Annalen, 100, 295-320 (1928); von Neumann, J., and Morgenstern, O., Theory of Games and Economic Behavior, Princeton Univ. Press, Princeton, 1944, pp. 153-155.
 2. For the references concerning minimax theorems of J. Ville, A. Wald and S. Karlin, see the Bibliography in Contributions to the Theory of Games, edited by H.W.Kuhn and A.W.Tucker, Princeton Univ. Press, Princeton, 1950.
 3. Kneser, H., "Sur un théorème fondamental de la théorie des jeux", C.R.Acad.Sci.Paris, 234, 2418-2420 (1952).
 4. Fan, K., "Fixed-point and minimax theorems in locally convex topological linear spaces", Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci., 38, 121-126 (1952).

*This work was performed in part under the sponsorship of the Office of Naval Research, and in part under a National Bureau of Standards contract with American University with the sponsorship of the Air Research and Development Command, USAF.

any two elements $y_1, y_2 \in Y$ and two numbers $\eta_1 \geq 0, \eta_2 \geq 0$ with $\eta_1 + \eta_2 = 1$, there exists an $y_0 \in Y$ such that $f(x, y_0) \geq \eta_1 f(x, y_1) + \eta_2 f(x, y_2)$ for all $x \in X$.

THEOREM 1. Let X, Y be two compact Hausdorff spaces and f a real-valued function defined on $X \times Y$. Suppose that, for every $y \in Y$, $f(x, y)$ is lower semi-continuous (l.s.c.) on X ; and for every $x \in X$, $f(x, y)$ is upper semi-continuous (u.s.c.) on Y .

Then:

(i) The equality

$$\min_{x \in X} \max_{y \in Y} f(x, y) = \max_{y \in Y} \min_{x \in X} f(x, y) \quad (1)$$

holds, if and only if the following condition is satisfied:

For any two finite sets $\{x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n\} \subset X$ and $\{y_1, y_2, \dots, y_m\} \subset Y$, there exist $x_0 \in X$ and $y_0 \in Y$ such that

$$f(x_0, y_k) \leq f(x_i, y_0). \quad (1 \leq i \leq n, 1 \leq k \leq m) \quad (2)$$

(ii) In particular, if f is convex on X and concave on Y , then (1) holds.

Proof: Observe first that, regardless of the condition stated in (i), the expressions on both sides of (1) are meaningful. In fact, for each $x \in X$, $f(x, y)$ is u.s.c. on the compact space Y , so that $\max_{y \in Y} f(x, y)$ exists. As maximum of a family of l.s.c. functions on X , $\max_{y \in Y} f(x, y)$ is a l.s.c. function on the compact space X and therefore $\min_{x \in X} \max_{y \in Y} f(x, y)$ exists.

(i) The necessity of the condition being trivial, we only prove its sufficiency. According to this condition,

$$\min_{x \in X} \max_{1 \leq k \leq m} f(x, y_k) \leq \max_{y \in Y} \min_{1 \leq i \leq n} f(x_i, y)$$

hold for any two finite sets $\{x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n\} \subset X$ and $\{y_1, y_2, \dots, y_m\} \subset Y$. Then any real number α satisfies at least one of the two inequalities

$$\min_{x \in X} \max_{1 \leq k \leq m} f(x, y_k) \leq \alpha, \quad \max_{y \in Y} \min_{1 \leq i \leq n} f(x_i, y) \geq \alpha$$

Let $L(y; \alpha) = \{x \in X \mid f(x, y) \leq \alpha\}$, $U(x; \alpha) = \{y \in Y \mid f(x, y) \geq \alpha\}$, which are closed subsets of X, Y respectively. Then for any real α and any two finite sets $\{x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n\} \subset X$, $\{y_1, y_2, \dots, y_m\} \subset Y$, the two intersections $\bigcap_{k=1}^m L(y_k; \alpha)$ and $\bigcap_{i=1}^n U(x_i; \alpha)$ are never both empty. As X, Y are compact, it follows that for any real α , at least one of the two intersections $\bigcap_{y \in Y} L(y; \alpha)$ and $\bigcap_{x \in X} U(x; \alpha)$ is not empty. That is, either there exists $x_0 \in X$ such that $f(x_0, y) \leq \alpha$ for all $y \in Y$, or there exists $y_0 \in Y$ such that $f(x, y_0) \geq \alpha$ for all $x \in X$. In other words, any real α satisfies at least one of the two inequalities:

$$\min_{x \in X} \max_{y \in Y} f(x, y) \leq \alpha, \quad \max_{y \in Y} \min_{x \in X} f(x, y) \geq \alpha.$$

Hence $\min_{x \in X} \max_{y \in Y} f(x, y) \leq \max_{y \in Y} \min_{x \in X} f(x, y)$ and therefore (1).

(ii) Assume now that f is convex on X and concave on Y .

In order to prove (1), it suffices to verify the condition stated in (i). Let $\{x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n\} \subset X$ and $\{y_1, y_2, \dots, y_m\} \subset Y$ be given. By von Neumann's minimax theorem¹¹, there exist two sets

$\{\xi_1, \xi_2, \dots, \xi_n\}$, $\{\eta_1, \eta_2, \dots, \eta_m\}$ of nonnegative numbers with $\sum_{i=1}^n \xi_i = 1$, $\sum_{k=1}^m \eta_k = 1$ such that

$$\max_{1 \leq k \leq m} \sum_{i=1}^n \xi_i f(x_i, y_k) \leq \min_{1 \leq i \leq n} \sum_{k=1}^m \eta_k f(x_i, y_k). \quad (3)$$

Since f is convex on X and concave on Y , there exist $x_0 \in X$, $y_0 \in Y$ such that

$$f(x_0, y_k) \leq \sum_{i=1}^n \xi_i f(x_i, y_k), \quad (1 \leq k \leq m) \quad (4)$$

$$f(x_i, y_0) \geq \sum_{k=1}^m \eta_k f(x_i, y_k). \quad (1 \leq i \leq n) \quad (5)$$

Then (2) follows from (3), (4), (5).

In (ii) of Theorem 1, we have an easily applicable sufficient condition for equality (1). It can be used to provide simple proofs for minimax theorems for infinite games (for instance, the generalized Ville's minimax theorem as stated in our earlier Note⁴ is a special case of part (ii) of Theorem 1). Since the proof of (ii) is based on von Neumann's minimax theorem, its application in proving a minimax theorem for infinite games amounts essentially to a reduction of the latter to von Neumann's theorem for finite games.

2. Theorem 2 below generalizes Kneser's minimax theorem³ by eliminating the structure of linear spaces. Theorem 2 also improves (ii) of Theorem 1. Our proof of Theorem 2 is a modification of Kneser's proof of his theorem.

THEOREM 2. Let X be a compact Hausdorff space and Y an arbitrary set (not topologized). Let f be a real-valued function on $X \times Y$ such that, for every $y \in Y$, $f(x, y)$ is l.s.c. on X . If f is convex on X and concave on Y , then

$$\min_{x \in X} \sup_{y \in Y} f(x, y) = \sup_{y \in Y} \min_{x \in X} f(x, y) \quad (6)$$

Proof: Observe first that the expressions on both sides of (6) have meaning, although their values may be $+\infty$. We divide the proof of (6) into four steps:

(i) Let $y_0 \in Y$ be such that $X_0 = \{x \in X \mid f(x, y_0) \leq 0\}$ is not empty. If we replace X by X_0 , and restrict f on $X_0 \times Y$, then the hypothesis of Theorem 2 remains fulfilled.

We need only to verify that f restricted on $X_0 \times Y$ is convex on X_0 . Let $x_1, x_2 \in X_0$, and $\xi_1, \xi_2, \geq 0, \xi_1 + \xi_2 = 1$ be given. By convexity of f on X , there exists $x_0 \in X$ such that

$$f(x_0, y) \leq \xi_1 f(x_1, y) + \xi_2 f(x_2, y) \text{ for all } y \in Y. \quad (7)$$

Since $f(x_1, y_0) \leq 0, f(x_2, y_0) \leq 0$, the case $y = y_0$ of (7) implies $f(x_0, y_0) \leq 0$, i.e. $x_0 \in X_0$.

(ii) If $\{y_1, y_2\} \subset Y$ is such that

$$\max_{k=1,2} f(x, y_k) > 0 \text{ for all } x \in X, \quad (8)$$

then there exists $y_0 \in Y$ such that

$$f(x, y_0) > 0 \text{ for all } x \in X. \quad (9)$$

Let $X_k = \{x \in X \mid f(x, y_k) \leq 0\}$, ($k=1,2$), which are disjoint closed sets in X . We assume that none of them is empty (otherwise (ii) is trivial). We have $-f(x, y_1) \geq 0$ and $f(x, y_2) > 0$ for $x \in X_1$, so that $\frac{-f(x, y_1)}{f(x, y_2)}$ is u.s.c. and ≥ 0 on X_1 . Let $x_1 \in X_1$ and $\mu_1 \geq 0$ be such that

$$\max_{x \in X_1} \frac{-f(x, y_1)}{f(x, y_2)} = \frac{-f(x_1, y_1)}{f(x_1, y_2)} = \mu_1. \quad (10)$$

Similarly, let $x_2 \in X_2$ and $\mu_2 \geq 0$ be such that

$$\max_{x \in X_2} \frac{-f(x, y_2)}{f(x, y_1)} = \frac{-f(x_2, y_2)}{f(x_2, y_1)} = \mu_2. \quad (11)$$

We claim that $\mu_1 \mu_2 < 1$. To verify this, we may assume $\mu_1 \mu_2 \neq 0$. Since $f(x_1, y_1) \leq 0$, $f(x_2, y_1) > 0$, we can find $\xi_1, \xi_2 \geq 0$ such that $\xi_1 + \xi_2 = 1$ and

$$\xi_1 f(x_1, y_1) + \xi_2 f(x_2, y_1) = 0. \quad (12)$$

f being convex on X , there exists $x_0 \in X$ such that

$$f(x_0, y) \leq \xi_1 f(x_1, y) + \xi_2 f(x_2, y) \text{ for all } y \in Y. \quad (13)$$

From (12), (13), we have $f(x_0, y_1) \leq 0$ and therefore, by (8), $f(x_0, y_2) > 0$, so that

$$0 < \xi_1 f(x_1, y_2) + \xi_2 f(x_2, y_2).$$

Using (10), (11) and the fact $\mu_1 > 0$, the last inequality may be written

$$\xi_1 f(x_1, y_1) + \mu_1 \mu_2 \xi_2 f(x_2, y_1) < 0,$$

which compared with (12) yields $\mu_1 \mu_2 < 1$.

Take ν_1, ν_2 such that $\nu_1 > \mu_1, \nu_2 > \mu_2, \nu_1 \nu_2 = 1$. Let

$$\eta_1 = \frac{1}{1+\nu_1} = \frac{\nu_2}{1+\nu_2}, \quad \eta_2 = \frac{\nu_1}{1+\nu_1} = \frac{1}{1+\nu_2}. \quad \text{Then}$$

$$\eta_1 f(x, y_1) + \eta_2 f(x, y_2) > 0 \quad \text{for all } x \in X. \quad (14)$$

In fact, if x is not in $X_1 \cup X_2$, (14) is trivial. If $x \in X_1$, we have $0 \leq f(x, y_1) + \mu_1 f(x, y_2) < f(x, y_1) + \nu_1 f(x, y_2) = (1+\nu_1)[\eta_1 f(x, y_1) + \eta_2 f(x, y_2)]$. Similarly one verifies (14) for $x \in X_2$. Finally the existence of $y_0 \in Y$ with property (9) follows from (14) and the concavity of f on Y .

(iii) If a finite set $\{y_1, y_2, \dots, y_m\} \subset Y$ is such that

$$\max_{1 \leq k \leq m} f(x, y_k) > 0 \quad \text{for all } x \in X, \quad (15)$$

then there exists $y_0 \in Y$ satisfying (9).

We prove this by induction on m . Let $X_m = \{x \in X \mid f(x, y_m) \leq 0\}$. We assume that X_m is not empty (otherwise we take $y_0 = y_m$). By (i), we can apply our induction-assumption to f restricted on $X_m \times Y$. Since $\max_{1 \leq k \leq m-1} f(x, y_k) > 0$ for all $x \in X_m$, there exists $y_{m+1} \in Y$ such that $f(x, y_{m+1}) > 0$ for all $x \in X_m$. Then $\max_{k=m, m+1} f(x, y_k) > 0$ for all $x \in X$. By (ii), there exists $y_0 \in Y$ satisfying (9).

(iv) For any real number α , either there exists an $x_0 \in X$ such that $f(x_0, y) \leq \alpha$ for all $y \in Y$, or there exists an $y_0 \in Y$ such that $f(x, y_0) > \alpha$ for all $x \in X$. (Therefore the right side of (6) is not less than the left side, and consequently the two are equal.)

Suppose the first alternative is not true. Then $\bigcap_{y \in Y} L(y; \alpha)$ is empty, where $L(y; \alpha) = \{x \in X \mid f(x, y) \leq \alpha\}$. As X is compact, there exists a finite set $\{y_1, y_2, \dots, y_m\} \subset Y$ such that $\bigcap_{k=1}^m L(y_k; \alpha)$ is empty. That is, $\max_{1 \leq k \leq m} f(x, y_k) > \alpha$ for all $x \in X$. Then an application of (iii) to the function $f - \alpha$ shows that the second alternative is true.

3. The next theorem is free of topological structures. This is made possible by generalizing von Neumann's almost periodic functions on a group⁵: A real-valued function f defined on the product set $X \times Y$ of two arbitrary sets X, Y (not topologized) is said to be right almost periodic, if f is bounded on $X \times Y$ and if, for any $\varepsilon > 0$, there exists a finite covering $Y = \bigcup_{k=1}^m Y_k$ of Y such that $|f(x, y') - f(x, y'')| < \varepsilon$ for all $x \in X$, whenever y', y'' belong to the same Y_k . Left almost periodic functions are defined similarly. However, every right almost periodic function

5. Von Neumann, J., "Almost periodic functions in a group, I", Trans. Amer. Math. Soc., 36, 445-492 (1934); Maak, W., "Eine neue Definition der fast-periodischen Funktionen", Abhandl. Math. Sem. Hans. Univ., 11, 240-244 (1936).

on $X \times Y$ is also left almost periodic and vice versa.⁶ Thus we simply use the term almost periodic.

THEOREM 3.⁷ Let f be a real-valued almost periodic function on the product set $X \times Y$ of two arbitrary sets X, Y (not topologized).

Then:

(i) The equality

$$\inf_{x \in X} \sup_{y \in Y} f(x, y) = \sup_{y \in Y} \inf_{x \in X} f(x, y) \quad (16)$$

holds, if and only if the following condition is satisfied: For any $\epsilon > 0$, any two finite sets $\{x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n\} \subset X$ and $\{y_1, y_2, \dots, y_m\} \subset Y$, there exist $x_0 \in X, y_0 \in Y$ such that

$$f(x_0, y_k) - f(x_i, y_0) \leq \epsilon \quad (1 \leq i \leq n, 1 \leq k \leq m). \quad (17)$$

6. Let f be right almost periodic. Given $\epsilon > 0$, let $Y = \bigcup_{k=1}^m Y_k$ be a finite covering of Y with the property corresponding to $\epsilon/3$ required in the definition of right almost periodicity. Let $y_k \in Y_k (1 \leq k \leq m)$. For each $k, f(x, y_k)$ is a bounded function on X , there is a finite covering $X = \bigcup_{i=1}^n X_i^{(k)}$ of X such that $|f(x', y_k) - f(x'', y_k)| < \frac{\epsilon}{3}$ whenever $x', x'' \in X_i^{(k)}$ for some i . Then the common refinement of these m finite coverings of X has the property corresponding to ϵ required in the definition of left almost periodicity.

7. It should be said that the absence of topological structures in Theorem 3 is more apparent than real. In fact, the almost periodicity of f is a necessary and sufficient condition in order that X, Y can be made into two precompact (in the sense of Bourbaki, but not necessarily separated) uniform spaces in such a way that f is uniformly continuous on the product uniform space $X \times Y$.

(ii) In particular, if f is convex on X and concave on Y , then (16) holds.

Proof: We only prove the sufficiency part of (i). Consider an arbitrary $\varepsilon > 0$. Let $X = \bigcup_{i=1}^n X_i$ be a finite covering of X with the property corresponding to ε required in the definition of left almost periodicity. Let $Y = \bigcup_{k=1}^m Y_k$ be a finite covering of Y with the property corresponding to ε required in the definition of right almost periodicity. Let $x_i \in X_i (1 \leq i \leq n)$, $y_k \in Y_k (1 \leq k \leq m)$. Then $\sup_{y \in Y} f(x, y) \leq \max_{1 \leq k \leq m} f(x, y_k) + \varepsilon$ holds for all $x \in X$; and $\inf_{x \in X} f(x, y) \geq \min_{1 \leq i \leq n} f(x_i, y) - \varepsilon$ holds for all $y \in Y$.⁸ Hence

$$\inf_{x \in X} \sup_{y \in Y} f(x, y) \leq \inf_{x \in X} \max_{1 \leq k \leq m} f(x, y_k) + \varepsilon, \quad (18)$$

$$\sup_{y \in Y} \inf_{x \in X} f(x, y) \geq \sup_{y \in Y} \min_{1 \leq i \leq n} f(x_i, y) - \varepsilon. \quad (19)$$

Using our condition, there exist $x_0 \in X$, $y_0 \in Y$ satisfying (17).

From (17), (18), (19), we get

$$0 \leq \inf_{x \in X} \sup_{y \in Y} f(x, y) - \sup_{y \in Y} \inf_{x \in X} f(x, y) \leq 3\varepsilon,$$

which holds for any $\varepsilon > 0$. Thus (16) is proved.

8. Here we see that the hypothesis in Theorem 3 on almost periodicity of f can be considerably weakened.

THE NATIONAL BUREAU OF STANDARDS

Functions and Activities

The functions of the National Bureau of Standards are set forth in the Act of Congress, March 3, 1901, as amended by Congress in Public Law 619, 1950. These include the development and maintenance of the national standards of measurement and the provision of means and methods for making measurements consistent with these standards; the determination of physical constants and properties of materials; the development of methods and instruments for testing materials, devices, and structures; advisory services to Government Agencies on scientific and technical problems; invention and development of devices to serve special needs of the Government; and the development of standard practices, codes, and specifications. The work includes basic and applied research, development, engineering, instrumentation, testing, evaluation, calibration services and various consultation and information services. A major portion of the Bureau's work is performed for other Government Agencies, particularly the Department of Defense and the Atomic Energy Commission. The scope of activities is suggested by the listing of divisions and sections on the inside of the front cover.

Reports and Publications

The results of the Bureau's work take the form of either actual equipment and devices or published papers and reports. Reports are issued to the sponsoring agency of a particular project or program. Published papers appear either in the Bureau's own series of publications or in the journals of professional and scientific societies. The Bureau itself publishes three monthly periodicals, available from the Government Printing Office: The Journal of Research, which presents complete papers reporting technical investigations; the Technical News Bulletin, which presents summary and preliminary reports on work in progress; and Basic Radio Propagation Predictions, which provides data for determining the best frequencies to use for radio communications throughout the world. There are also five series of nonperiodical publications: The Applied Mathematics Series, Circulars, Handbooks, Building Materials and Structures Reports, and Miscellaneous Publications.

Information on the Bureau's publications can be found in NBS Circular 460, Publications of the National Bureau of Standards (\$1.00). Information on calibration services and fees can be found in NBS Circular 483, Testing by the National Bureau of Standards (25 cents). Both are available from the Government Printing Office. Inquiries regarding the Bureau's reports and publications should be addressed to the Office of Scientific Publications, National Bureau of Standards, Washington 25, D. C.

