
February 1995

NATIONAL PARKS

Information on the Condition of Civil War Monuments at Selected Sites





United States
General Accounting Office
Washington, D.C. 20548

**Resources, Community, and
Economic Development Division**

B-259918

February 1, 1995

The Honorable Trent Lott
United States Senate

Dear Senator Lott:

In response to your request and subsequent agreements with your office, we collected information on the condition of monuments at Civil War battlefield park sites managed by the National Park Service (NPS). Concerned about whether NPS was properly maintaining the monuments at these locations, you asked us to provide you with information on (1) the overall condition of the monuments and (2) cost estimates, if available, for repairing the monuments in poor condition. As you previously requested, we provided you on November 15, 1994, with an interim report on the status of the monuments at Vicksburg National Military Park. This fact sheet presents the information we obtained for all of the sites in our review, including the Vicksburg site.

As agreed with your office, our work covered the sites for which NPS had readily available and reasonably up-to-date information. NPS had such information for 11 of its 20 Civil War battlefield park sites. Section 1 lists all 20 of the sites and identifies the 11 that are included in our review.

In summary, NPS' records indicate that there are 2,510 monuments at the 11 sites included in this fact sheet. Of these, according to NPS data, 2,456 monuments—or 98 percent—are in good or fair condition, meaning that they need no or limited repair and rehabilitation. The remaining 54—or 2 percent—are in poor condition and need substantial repair.

The 54 monuments in poor condition generally have one or more of the following problems: broken or missing parts and pieces; chips, fractures, or cracks in the base or statuary; and wear or erosion of the base, bronzes, or stone inscriptions.¹ The most common causes of these problems are weather and vandalism. Other causes include erosion, structural deficiencies, and neglect.

Park officials provided cost estimates to repair 34—or 63 percent—of the 54 monuments in poor condition. The total cost to repair these monuments was about \$2,403,000. Cost estimates were not provided for 20

¹The monuments in good or fair condition may also exhibit some of these problems but not to the extent warranting designation of their condition as poor.

of the monuments—or 37 percent—either because officials were uncertain of the correct “fix” or did not know how much the repairs would cost. Cost estimates for repairing individual monuments ranged from \$500 to over \$1,000,000; the majority—or 56 percent—were under \$10,000, and the rest, except for one \$1 million estimate, ranged between \$10,000 and \$280,000.

Section 2 provides details about the condition of the monuments and the costs of repairing those in poor condition for the 11 sites included in this fact sheet.

Scope and Methodology

The information provided in this fact sheet is based primarily on data obtained from a centralized NPS data base called the List of Classified Structures (LCS). NPS uses this data base to inventory and track the condition of historic structures. Among other things, the data base identifies all historic structures, including monuments, in all NPS units and categorizes their condition as good, fair, poor, or unknown. (See app. I for NPS’ definitions of these terms.) NPS headquarters officials provided us with LCS data updated as of 1991 or later for monuments at the 11 Civil War battlefield park sites discussed in this fact sheet.² The LCS data base also contains estimates of repair costs for some monuments.

We discussed the LCS data with regional NPS officials and with officials at each of the 11 sites to determine whether any changes were needed to either the number or the condition of the monuments. For eight sites, we obtained this information by telephone and fax. We visited three sites—Gettysburg National Military Park, Manassas National Battlefield Park, and Vicksburg National Military Park—to discuss the data and observe the condition of the monuments in these parks, particularly of those identified as being in poor condition.

Officials at the sites generally agreed with the accuracy of the LCS data but did suggest revisions in some cases. If the information from a site differed from the LCS data, we used the site’s data, since site personnel have first-hand information about the current condition of their monuments. We also used the site’s repair cost estimate if it differed from an LCS estimate.

Our audit work was conducted from October through December 1994. We did not independently verify the total number of monuments at a site, their condition, or the estimated costs to repair them. We discussed a draft of

²The monuments discussed in this fact sheet do not include cemetery headstones and certain types of cast iron tablets and plaques, hundreds or thousands of which may be at some parks.

this fact sheet with responsible agency officials, including the Chief of the Park Historic Architecture Division, who generally agreed with its contents. We incorporated the changes suggested by these officials where appropriate.

As arranged with your office, unless you publicly announce its contents earlier, we plan no further distribution of this fact sheet until 7 days after the date of this letter. At that time, we will send copies to the Secretary of the Interior, the Assistant Secretary for Fish and Wildlife and Parks, and the Director of the National Park Service. We will make copies available to others on request.

Should you have questions about this fact sheet or need more information, please call me at (202) 512-7756. Major contributors to this fact sheet are listed in appendix II.

Sincerely yours,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "James Duffus III". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, sweeping "J" and a stylized "III" at the end.

James Duffus III
Director, Natural Resources
Management Issues

Contents

Letter	1
Section 1 National Park Service Civil War Battlefield Park Sites	6
Section 2 Data on Individual Sites	7
Appendix I The National Park Service’s Terms for Defining the Condition of Historic Structures	22
Appendix II Major Contributors to This Fact Sheet	23
Tables	
Table 2.1: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Antietam	8
Table 2.2: Monuments in Poor Condition at Antietam	8
Table 2.3: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Chickamauga and Chattanooga	9
Table 2.4: Monuments in Poor Condition at Chickamauga and Chattanooga	9
Table 2.5: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Fort Pulaski	12
Table 2.6: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Gettysburg	13
Table 2.7: Monuments in Poor Condition at Gettysburg	13
Table 2.8: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Harpers Ferry	15
Table 2.9: Monuments in Poor Condition at Harpers Ferry	15
Table 2.10: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Kennesaw Mountain	16

Contents

Table 2.11: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Manassas	17
Table 2.12: Monuments in Poor Condition at Manassas	17
Table 2.13: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Monocacy	18
Table 2.14: Monuments in Poor Condition at Monocacy	18
Table 2.15: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Shiloh	19
Table 2.16: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Stones River	20
Table 2.17: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Vicksburg	21
Table 2.18: Monuments in Poor Condition at Vicksburg	21

Abbreviations

GAO	General Accounting Office
LCS	List of Classified Structures
NPS	National Park Service

National Park Service Civil War Battlefield Park Sites

Battlefield park sites	Included in review	Not included in review
Antietam National Battlefield	X	
Brices Cross Roads National Battlefield Site		X
Chickamauga and Chattanooga National Military Park	X	
Fort Donelson National Battlefield		X
Fort Pulaski National Monument	X	
Fort Sumter National Monument		X
Fredericksburg and Spotsylvania County Battlefields Memorial National Military Park		X
Gettysburg National Military Park	X	
Harpers Ferry National Historical Park	X	
Kennesaw Mountain National Battlefield Park	X	
Manassas National Battlefield Park	X	
Monocacy National Battlefield	X	
Pea Ridge National Military Park		X
Petersburg National Battlefield		X
Richmond National Battlefield Park		X
Shiloh National Military Park	X	
Stones River National Battlefield	X	
Tupelo National Battlefield		X
Vicksburg National Military Park	X	
Wilson's Creek National Battlefield		X
Total = 20	11	9

Data on Individual Sites

We obtained information on the condition of Civil War monuments at 11 sites in the National Park Service (NPS). These 11 sites have a total of 2,510 monuments, of which 2,456—or 98 percent—are in good or fair condition and 54—or 2 percent—are in poor condition and need substantial repair, according to NPS officials. The 54 monuments are located in 7 of the 11 sites; 4 sites have no monuments in poor condition. The number of monuments in poor condition at a site ranges from 1 to 22 and represents from less than 1 percent to 33 percent of the total number of monuments at a site. However, the two sites with the highest percentage of monuments in poor condition—Monocacy Battlefield with 20 percent and Harpers Ferry National Historical Park with 33 percent—have only five and three monuments, respectively, and each has only one monument in poor condition. The site with the highest number of monuments in poor condition—Gettysburg National Military Park—has 895 monuments, of which 22—or only 2 percent—are in poor condition. Estimates of the costs to repair the monuments in poor condition were obtained for 63 percent of the 54 monuments and total about \$2,403,000.

The remainder of this section presents information for each of the 11 sites, including the names of the monuments in poor condition; the repair cost estimates, if available; the primary cause of the problem requiring repair; and a description of the repair required.

ANTIETAM NATIONAL BATTLEFIELD

Location: Sharpsburg, Maryland

Table 2.1: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Antietam

Condition of monuments	Number of monuments	Percent of total
Good/Fair	97	94
Poor	6	6
Total	103	100

Table 2.2: Monuments in Poor Condition at Antietam

Name of monument	Repair cost estimate	Primary cause of problem	Required repair
Maj. Gen. Mansfield cannon marker	\$ 500	Neglect	Clean and repaint
Maj. Gen. Richardson cannon marker	500	Weather	Clean and repaint
Brig. Gen. Branch cannon marker	500	Vandalism	Clean and repaint
Brig. Gen. Starke cannon marker	500	Weather	Clean and repaint
Brig. Gen. Anderson cannon marker	500	Neglect	Clean and repaint
Brig. Gen. Rodman cannon marker	500	Vandalism	Clean and repaint
Total	\$3,000		

The six cannon marker monuments consist of inverted bronze 12-pounder cannon tubes mounted in a base formed by various field-size stones. The monuments have not had any attention for 14 years and need to be stripped of old paint and repainted. No other monuments at Antietam are in poor condition, according to park officials.

CHICKAMAUGA AND CHATTANOOGA NATIONAL MILITARY PARK

Location: Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia

Table 2.3: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Chickamauga and Chattanooga

Condition of monuments	Number of monuments	Percent of total
Good/Fair	656	97
Poor	20	3
Total	676	100

Table 2.4: Monuments in Poor Condition at Chickamauga and Chattanooga

Name of monument	Repair cost estimate	Primary cause of problem	Required repair
9th Michigan Infantry	^a	Vandalism	Repair and reattach broken central top figure
Battery D, 1st Michigan Light Artillery	\$25,000	Vandalism	Replace all stolen bronze work
Lytle shell	^a	Vandalism	Replace numerous original cannon balls
33rd Ohio Regiment tablet marker	500	Mowing accident	Repair chip caused by mower
38th Ohio Regiment tablet marker	500	Mowing accident	Repair chip caused by mower
Co. F, 2nd U.S. Missouri Light Artillery marker	^a	Weather	^b
Battery D, 1st Missouri Light Artillery marker	^a	Weather	^b
2nd U.S. Missouri Infantry Regiment marker	^a	Weather	^b
3rd U.S. Missouri Infantry Regiment marker	^a	Weather	^b
6th U.S. Missouri Infantry Regiment marker	^a	Weather	^b
8th U.S. Missouri Infantry Regiment marker	^a	Weather	^b

(continued)

Section 2
Data on Individual Sites

Name of monument	Repair cost estimate	Primary cause of problem	Required repair
10th U.S. Missouri Infantry Regiment marker	^a	Weather	^b
12th U.S. Missouri Infantry Regiment marker	^a	Weather	^b
15th U.S. Missouri Infantry Regiment marker	^a	Weather	^b
17th U.S. Missouri Infantry Regiment marker	^a	Weather	^b
26th U.S. Missouri Infantry Regiment marker	^a	Weather	^b
31st U.S. Missouri Infantry Regiment marker	^a	Weather	^b
32nd U.S. Missouri Infantry Regiment marker	^a	Weather	^b
Barrett's C.S.A. ^c Missouri Battery marker	^a	Weather	^b
Bledsoe's C.S.A. ^c Missouri Battery marker	^a	Weather	^b
Total	\$26,000 (3 of 20)		

^aNot available.

^bReplace eroded marble and engrave inscription on new stone. However, this repair poses a dilemma: If the original stone is replaced with the same kind of stone at the same angle, the problem will recur. And if a different kind of stone or a different angle is used, the monument's historical integrity will be destroyed. Therefore, the Park Historian is uncertain how this monument should be repaired.

^cC.S.A. = Confederate States of America.

Park officials stressed that although only 20 monuments at Chickamauga and Chattanooga are classified as being in poor condition, almost every monument in this—the oldest—national military park has been affected by vandalism and/or weather. Many monuments are missing statuary, plaques, state seals, and/or pieces, such as rifles or bayonets. Many have

Section 2
Data on Individual Sites

also been chipped by lawn mowers. However, except in the 20 cases listed above, these effects have not been severe enough to warrant classifying the monuments' condition as poor, according to a park official.

FORT PULASKI NATIONAL MONUMENT

Location: Savannah, Georgia

**Table 2.5: Condition of Civil War
Monuments at Fort Pulaski**

Condition of monuments	Number of monuments	Percent of total
Good/Fair	1	100
Poor	0	0
Total	1	100

GETTYSBURG NATIONAL MILITARY PARK

Location: Gettysburg, Pennsylvania

Table 2.6: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Gettysburg

Condition of monuments	Number of monuments	Percent of total
Good/Fair	873	98
Poor	22	2
Total	895	100

Table 2.7: Monuments in Poor Condition at Gettysburg

Name of monument	Repair cost estimate	Primary cause of problem	Required repair
Maj. Gen. John Reynolds equestrian statue	\$ 7,000	Animal/pest infestation	Take apart, clean, and reassemble to find cause of mineral leaching
Maj. Gen. John Sedgewick statue	84,500	Structural deterioration	Repair cracked and tilted plaza around base
Gen. Longstreet's C.S.A. ^a headquarters marker	35,000	Structural deterioration	Dismantle and reset to eliminate spreading fracture in base
1st and 2nd U.S. Cavalry left flank marker	2,000	Weather	Reset tilted marker
New York State	190,000	Weather	Reset large bronze cap on statue and repair bronze staff
20th New York (Ulster Guard)	5,000	Inappropriate preservation	Repair missing and yellowed epoxy
58th New York Infantry	4,800	Weather	Reset top layers of stone
78th and 102nd New York Infantry	30,000	Vandalism	Repair broken granite arm, hand, and rifle
4th Ohio Infantry	130,000	Structural deterioration	Repair structural failure
55th Ohio Infantry	280,000	Weather	Replace (in kind) eroded sandstone and return left flank marker
1st Maryland Cavalry	6,000	Vandalism	Repair horse's broken head and ear
1st Maryland (Eastern Shore)	4,000	Vandalism	Recast face to repair soldier's broken nose

(continued)

Section 2
Data on Individual Sites

Name of monument	Repair cost estimate	Primary cause of problem	Required repair
Purnell Legion, Co. A, Maryland Cavalry	12,000	Weather	Repair severe fractures
1st Minnesota Infantry	60,000	Pollution	Replace (in kind) fractured marble urn
Battery B, 1st Pennsylvania Artillery	200,000	Erosion	Replace (in kind) eroded marble and limestone
Battery E, 1st Pennsylvania Artillery	23,000	Erosion	Take apart and reassemble to relieve stress on side fracture
18th Pennsylvania Cavalry	6,000	Vandalism	Repair granite horse's broken head and ear
21st Pennsylvania Cavalry	5,000	Erosion	Clear trees and perform needed masonry work
27th Pennsylvania Infantry	75,000	Erosion	Shore up leaning monument
Pennsylvania monument marble bench	28,000	Vandalism	Replace (in kind) destroyed bench
13th Vermont Infantry	3,000	Erosion	Reset capital (top) stone
Co. F, 1st U.S. Sharpshooters	175,000	Weather	Repair eagle and column toppled in storm
Total	\$1,365,300		

^aC.S.A. = Confederate States of America.

Gettysburg developed a monument preservation program in 1990. The park competes for yearly regional cyclic repair/rehabilitation funds for this program. According to park officials, because the park is not sure of receiving this money every year, it cannot hire permanent staff to do the work and has not been able to maintain its preservation schedule. The park estimates that it needs an additional \$226,000 in base funding annually to run the program properly. Also, the park recently adopted a policy that any new monuments erected must come with a lifetime endowment for maintenance. Three monuments have such endowments.

HARPERS FERRY NATIONAL HISTORICAL PARK

Location: Harpers Ferry, West Virginia

Table 2.8: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Harpers Ferry

Condition of monuments	Number of monuments	Percent of total
Good/Fair	2	67
Poor	1	33
Total	3	100

Table 2.9: Monuments in Poor Condition at Harpers Ferry

Name of monument	Repair cost estimate	Primary cause of problem	Required repair
John Brown	\$5,000	Weather	Repair cracks in obelisk and foundation
Total	\$5,000		

This monument is located within the park's boundaries but is privately owned. The park may be acquiring the monument shortly. The park intends to relocate this monument to another site once NPS has acquired it; however, it will still need to be repaired.

KENNESAW MOUNTAIN NATIONAL BATTLEFIELD PARK

Location: Marietta, Georgia

**Table 2.10: Condition of Civil War
Monuments at Kennesaw Mountain**

Condition of monuments	Number of monuments	Percent of total
Good/Fair	8	100
Poor	0	0
Total	8	100

MANASSAS NATIONAL BATTLEFIELD PARK

Location: Manassas, Virginia

Table 2.11: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Manassas

Condition of monuments	Number of monuments	Percent of total
Good/Fair	15	88
Poor	2	12
Total	17	100

Table 2.12: Monuments in Poor Condition at Manassas

Name of monument	Repair cost estimate	Primary cause of problem	Required repair
Bartow base	^a	Structural deterioration	Cannot be repaired (see below)
George Stoval	^a	Weather	Remove from encasement and repair chips
Total	^a		

^aNot available.

The Bartow monument is believed to be the first Civil War monument. It was actually erected during the war, but the top did not survive the war. All that remains is the base. Because no one knows what was there, the monument cannot be repaired.

The Stoval monument is chipped, has worn inscriptions, and has been vandalized extensively. It has actually been moved by vandals and/or visitors and was once found in a stream. As a result, it was attached and secured to a concrete base 20 years ago.

MONOCACY NATIONAL BATTLEFIELD

Location: Sharpsburg, Maryland

Table 2.13: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Monocacy

Condition of monuments	Number of monuments	Percent of total
Good/Fair	4	80
Poor	1	20
Total	5	100

Table 2.14: Monuments in Poor Condition at Monocacy

Name of monument	Repair cost estimate	Primary cause of problem	Required repair
14th New Jersey Regiment	^a	Vandalism	Replace missing pieces and recarve inscriptions
Total	^a		

^aNot available.

Only two of the five monuments in this park are owned by NPS. The other three are owned by the state organizations that erected them. The 14th New Jersey Regiment monument is not owned by NPS. NPS cannot repair this or the other two privately owned monuments because it has not been able to negotiate maintenance agreements with these organizations.

SHILOH NATIONAL MILITARY PARK

Location: Shiloh, Tennessee

Table 2.15: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Shiloh

Condition of monuments	Number of monuments	Percent of total
Good/Fair	153	100
Poor	0	0
Total	153	100

Park officials indicated that although none of the monuments at Shiloh is classified as being in poor condition, many of the monuments have been vandalized and are missing such items as rifles and cannonballs, which the park cannot afford to replace without additional funds.

STONES RIVER NATIONAL BATTLEFIELD

Location: Murfreesboro, Tennessee

Table 2.16: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Stones River

Condition of monuments	Number of monuments	Percent of total
Good/Fair	9	100
Poor	0	0
Total	9	100

Although a park official agreed that no monument at Stones River is classifiable as being in poor condition, he indicated that weather has substantially eroded the stone inscriptions on at least two monuments. He also indicated that vandalism, particularly of cannonballs, is an ongoing problem at the park.

VICKSBURG NATIONAL MILITARY PARK

Location: Vicksburg, Mississippi

Table 2.17: Condition of Civil War Monuments at Vicksburg

Condition of monuments	Number of monuments	Percent of total
Good/Fair	638	100
Poor	2	<1
Total	640	100

Table 2.18: Monuments in Poor Condition at Vicksburg

Name of monument	Repair cost estimate	Primary cause of problem	Required repair
19th, 20th, 34th, 38th Iowa Infantry	\$3,200 to 4,000	Vandalism	Replace four bronze tablets
Mississippi State	1,000,000	Weather	Repair and restore large bronze panels
Total	\$1,003,200 to 1,004,000		

The 19th, 20th, 34th, 38th Iowa Infantry monument has been missing all four of its bronze tablets for at least 15 years. Park staff have not replaced them partly because they have lacked funds and partly because this monument is isolated and is not seen by the public. The Mississippi State monument has severe problems with its bronze work and requires substantial repair and restoration. We provided more detail about these monuments in our letter to Senator Lott dated November 15, 1994 (GAO/RCED-95-55R).

Park officials told us that about one-third of the park's monuments and plaques are located on city property outside the park. Although park officials have the right of access, access is difficult, if not impossible, in some cases because of the heavy growth of vegetation. Some of the monuments are toppled, some have missing pieces, and others need cleaning and other preservation work. Because of funding limitations, the park has prioritized its repair schedule to address, first, monuments seen in the park and, second, monuments outside the park that are easily visible.

The National Park Service’s Terms for Defining the Condition of Historic Structures

Good:	The structure and significant features are intact, structurally sound, and performing their intended purpose. The structure and significant features need no repair or rehabilitation but only routine or preventive maintenance.
Fair:	There are early signs of wear, failure, or deterioration through the structure, and its features are generally sound and performing their intended purpose; or there is failure of a significant feature of the structure.
Poor:	The significant features are no longer performing their intended purpose; or significant features are missing; or deterioration or damage affects more than 25 percent of the structure; or the structure or significant features show signs of imminent failure or breakdown.
Unknown:	Not enough information is available to make a determination.

Source: National Park Service.

Major Contributors to This Fact Sheet

Resources,
Community, and
Economic
Development
Division, Washington,
D.C.

Cliff Fowler
H. Cheryl Rusten
Ned H. Woodward

Ordering Information

The first copy of each GAO report and testimony is free. Additional copies are \$2 each. Orders should be sent to the following address, accompanied by a check or money order made out to the Superintendent of Documents, when necessary. Orders for 100 or more copies to be mailed to a single address are discounted 25 percent.

Orders by mail:

U.S. General Accounting Office
P.O. Box 6015
Gaithersburg, MD 20884-6015

or visit:

Room 1100
700 4th St. NW (corner of 4th and G Sts. NW)
U.S. General Accounting Office
Washington, DC

Orders may also be placed by calling (202) 512-6000
or by using fax number (301) 258-4066, or TDD (301) 413-0006.

Each day, GAO issues a list of newly available reports and testimony. To receive facsimile copies of the daily list or any list from the past 30 days, please call (301) 258-4097 using a touchtone phone. A recorded menu will provide information on how to obtain these lists.

**United States
General Accounting Office
Washington, D.C. 20548-0001**

**Bulk Mail
Postage & Fees Paid
GAO
Permit No. G100**

**Official Business
Penalty for Private Use \$300**

Address Correction Requested



