

Trafficked: Untangling the Bonds of Modern Slavery



OCTOBER 13, 2017

**Briefing of the
Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe**

Washington: 2017

Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe
234 Ford House Office Building
Washington, DC 20515
202-225-1901
csce@mail.house.gov
<http://www.csce.gov>
@HelsinkiComm

Legislative Branch Commissioners

HOUSE

CHRISTOPHER H. SMITH, NEW JERSEY
Co-Chairman
ALCEE L. HASTINGS, FLORIDA
ROBERT B. ADERHOLT, ALABAMA
MICHAEL C. BURGESS, TEXAS
STEVE COHEN, TENNESSEE
RICHARD HUDSON, NORTH CAROLINA
RANDY HULTGREN, ILLINOIS
SHEILA JACKSON LEE, TEXAS
GWEN MOORE, WISCONSIN

SENATE

ROGER WICKER, MISSISSIPPI,
Chairman
BENJAMIN L. CARDIN, MARYLAND
JOHN BOOZMAN, ARKANSAS
CORY GARDNER, COLORADO
MARCO RUBIO, FLORIDA
JEANNE SHAHEEN, NEW HAMPSHIRE
THOM TILLIS, NORTH CAROLINA
TOM UDALL, NEW MEXICO
SHELDON WHITEHOUSE, RHODE ISLAND

Executive Branch Commissioners

DEPARTMENT OF STATE
DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE
DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE

ABOUT THE ORGANIZATION FOR SECURITY AND COOPERATION IN EUROPE

The Helsinki process, formally titled the Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe, traces its origin to the signing of the Helsinki Final Act in Finland on August 1, 1975, by the leaders of 33 European countries, the United States and Canada. As of January 1, 1995, the Helsinki process was renamed the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE). The membership of the OSCE has expanded to 56 participating States, reflecting the breakup of the Soviet Union, Czechoslovakia, and Yugoslavia.

The OSCE Secretariat is in Vienna, Austria, where weekly meetings of the participating States' permanent representatives are held. In addition, specialized seminars and meetings are convened in various locations. Periodic consultations are held among Senior Officials, Ministers and Heads of State or Government.

Although the OSCE continues to engage in standard setting in the fields of military security, economic and environmental cooperation, and human rights and humanitarian concerns, the Organization is primarily focused on initiatives designed to prevent, manage and resolve conflict within and among the participating States. The Organization deploys numerous missions and field activities located in Southeastern and Eastern Europe, the Caucasus, and Central Asia. The website of the OSCE is: <www.osce.org>.

ABOUT THE COMMISSION ON SECURITY AND COOPERATION IN EUROPE

The Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe, also known as the Helsinki Commission, is a U.S. Government agency created in 1976 to monitor and encourage compliance by the participating States with their OSCE commitments, with a particular emphasis on human rights.

The Commission consists of nine members from the United States Senate, nine members from the House of Representatives, and one member each from the Departments of State, Defense and Commerce. The positions of Chair and Co-Chair rotate between the Senate and House every two years, when a new Congress convenes. A professional staff assists the Commissioners in their work.

In fulfilling its mandate, the Commission gathers and disseminates relevant information to the U.S. Congress and the public by convening hearings, issuing reports that reflect the views of Members of the Commission and/or its staff, and providing details about the activities of the Helsinki process and developments in OSCE participating States.

The Commission also contributes to the formulation and execution of U.S. policy regarding the OSCE, including through Member and staff participation on U.S. Delegations to OSCE meetings. Members of the Commission have regular contact with parliamentarians, government officials, representatives of non-governmental organizations, and private individuals from participating States. The website of the Commission is: <www.csce.gov>.

Trafficked: Untangling the Bonds of Modern Slavery

OCTOBER 13, 2017

Page

PARTICIPANTS

Stacy L. Hope, Communications Director, Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe	1
Allison B. Hollabaugh, Counsel, Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe	2
Siddharth Kara, Producer of <i>Trafficked</i> , Director of the Program on Human Trafficking and Modern Slavery at the Kennedy School of Government at Harvard University, and Visiting Scientist on Forced Labor at the Harvard School of Public Health	3
Marcia Eugenio, Director, Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor and Human Trafficking at the Bureau of International Labor Affairs, U.S. Department of Labor	4
Alex Trouteaud, Ph.D., Director of Policy and Research, Demand Abolition	7

Trafficked: Untangling the Bonds of Modern Slavery

October 13, 2017

Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe Washington, DC

The briefing was held at 2:40 p.m. in Room 2168, Rayburn House Office Building, Washington, DC, Allison B. Hollabaugh, Counsel, Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe, moderating.

Panelists present: Stacy L. Hope, Communications Director, Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe; Allison B. Hollabaugh, Counsel, Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe; Siddharth Kara, Producer of *Trafficked*, Director of the Program on Human Trafficking and Modern Slavery at the Kennedy School of Government at Harvard University, and Visiting Scientist on Forced Labor at the Harvard School of Public Health; Marcia Eugenio, Director, Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor and Human Trafficking at the Bureau of International Labor Affairs, U.S. Department of Labor; and Alex Trouteaud, Ph.D., Director of Policy and Research, Demand Abolition.

Ms. HOPE. Good afternoon, everybody. My name is Stacy Hope. I am the communications director of the U.S. Helsinki Commission. On behalf of our Chairman, Senator Roger Wicker, and our Co-Chairman, Representative Chris Smith, I am pleased to welcome you to today's screening of *Trafficked*.

Human trafficking remains an entrenched, but not an intractable, problem in the United States and around the world. According to the International Labour Organization, 40 million people suffered from human trafficking last year; most of these were women and girls.

Since the 1990s, members of the Helsinki Commission—especially our Co-Chairman, Representative Chris Smith—have been very active in combating human trafficking. Co-Chairman Smith has chaired numerous hearings on the subject and is the prime sponsor of four major laws and several international resolutions aimed at combating human trafficking both in the United States and around the world. Since 2004, he has served as special representative on human trafficking issues to the president of the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly.

Trafficked, the film we'll see today, is a drama based on Siddharth Kara's award-winning book that follows the stories of three girls from Nigeria, America and India as they

lose and reclaim their freedom. Following the screening, I invite you to join us for a panel discussion with Mr. Kara, as well as Ms. Marcia Eugenio of the Office of Child Labor of the U.S. Department of Labor, and Dr. Alex Trouteaud, director of policy at Demand Abolition. During our panel, we will be discussing the root causes of vulnerability to trafficking, the role of the buyer in trafficking, police corruption and accountability, the psychological effects of trafficking on survivors, the road to recovery, and what Congress can do about all of this.

The panel discussion will be streamed live on the Helsinki Commission Facebook page at www.facebook.com/HelsinkiCommission. That video as well as an unofficial transcript will be available on our website, www.csce.gov, early next week.

Thank you for joining us today. Now I'd like to hand the floor over to Mr. Kara to do some introduction of the film.

Dr. KARA. Hi, everyone. I will be brief. I just wanted to first thank the Helsinki Commission for hosting this event. I am very grateful for the opportunity to share the film with you this afternoon.

The film had its world premiere just eight days ago at the United Nations in New York. We had a very large gathering in the ECOSOC Chamber, several hundred dignitaries, ambassadors turned out to see the film. And then it was released in theaters—a limited release—the following day, last week in a handful of cities across the country.

As Stacy mentioned, I wrote this film, I produced it, based on and inspired by my first book, "Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery." My goal in doing so was to do a few things: First, to try to tell a global and authentic story about human trafficking. Second, to give voice to some of the voiceless survivors in this world. Most of the characters in this film are documented, are based on someone I actually documented, though, of course, fictionalized in order to tell a film story. And then finally, and this is the most delicate and I think the most crucial element, to shake people out of their apathy just a little bit on this issue and to give just a hint as to exactly how destructive the journey of human trafficking can be, and is.

Needless to say, no one wants to see the true horrors of that journey, of just how horrible it can be. But I also feel we can't sanitize just how horrible it can be. And so one of the most challenging aspects of writing this film and then being on set and producing it was to find that balance. And I think it will be up to you in the audience to decide whether we did find that balance. But if anything, I wanted to err a little bit towards shaking people up.

Now, you all know, by and large, what this issue is, what it's about, so much of this may not be new to you. Some of it may be. Certainly, for a mass audience, for the general audience, I think most of what happens in this film is going to be quite new, including the fact that these things take place here in this country.

That said, I shall thank you for being here. I will look forward to having the panel discussion and hearing your response.

Thank you.

[The film *Trafficked* is shown.]

Ms. HOLLABAUGH. Thank you for joining us this afternoon for the screening in Washington, D.C. of *Trafficked*, the new movie by Siddharth Kara.

I'd like to invite the producer to come up and our panelists, Marcia, Alex, please join me as we turn now to a discussion of the major themes of this movie.

There are tissues in the back if anybody needs them. [Laughter.]

And I look forward to hearing your thoughts after a few from our panelists.

I'd like to introduce Siddharth Kara. He is one of the world's foremost experts on human trafficking and contemporary slavery. He is the director of the Program on Human Trafficking and Modern Slavery at the Harvard Kennedy School of Government, where he is also an adjunct lecturer and teaches the only course on human trafficking at the Harvard Kennedy School of Government. In addition, Kara is a visiting scientist on forced labor at the Harvard School of Public Health.

He is the author of "Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery," co-winner of the prestigious 2010 Frederick Douglass Award at Yale University for the best nonfiction book on slavery.

And I would add that this is a very exciting time to be talking about trafficking in the U.S. Congress. It is a reauthorization year for the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000. Every three to five years, the U.S. Congress reauthorizes this bill that established our antitrafficking framework in the U.S. and directs \$130 million a year towards antitrafficking efforts in the Department of Justice, Department of State, Department of Homeland Security, Department of Labor and Department of Health and Human Services, just to name a few.

But before we turn to U.S. policy, I would like to hear more from Dr. Kara on his film.

Dr. KARA. Thank you, Allison, for that very warm introduction. Thank you all for being here again, and thank you to the Helsinki Commission for hosting this screening.

I warned you I wanted to shake you up a little bit. And I hope you have been shaken up, but in a productive way. The goal of this film is to raise awareness, awareness of the truths of how destructive the journey of human trafficking can be, of how global it is, of how interwoven it is, of how close to home it is, whether your home is the United States or Nigeria or India or Mexico or Moldova, or any of the countries in between those.

And above all, the goal of this film is to try to give some voice, some stirring voice to the millions of voiceless victims and survivors of human trafficking around the world. And when I say voiceless, I really want the one focus on that word, what it means to have no voice. It means no matter how loud you scream, no one is listening. That's what it means to have no voice. Documentary films, books, this film and other great films that have been made on this issue all endeavor, I believe, to lend an ear to those screams that are resonating around the world with too few people listening.

Allison mentioned this is an important year. It is a policy year here, a reauthorization year. This film does evoke many, I believe, of the very crucial issues being discussed and debated in terms of the Frederick Douglass Reauthorization Act and we'll talk about that, I believe, a little bit this afternoon.

So the purpose of the film is also to engage policymakers in the kinds of conversations they're having and to remind them that as much as we may talk about policy and talk about laws and talk about steps that need to be taken, what should never be lost in those conversations is the human element to all of this. And if this film accomplishes nothing else other than to be a vehicle through which people in very important positions who have an impact on this issue can be reminded of the human element, very forcefully reminded of the human element, then I think it will have achieved its goal, at least insofar as I am concerned.

I don't want to take up more time. I did speak a little earlier. I would like to pass it off to Allison to introduce the other panelists. And I really look forward to the discussion afterwards.

Ms. HOLLABAUGH. Thank you, Professor Kara. We are unforgettably reminded of the human element. The movie is riveting.

Our next speaker is Marcia Eugenio. Marcia is the director of Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor and Human Trafficking in the Bureau of International Labor Affairs. Under Ms. Eugenio's leadership, the Bureau of International Labor Affairs and the other offices have promoted the elimination of child labor and forced labor through policy, research, technical assistance projects and many other activities that have provided millions of children with the education and training that their families need to have viable livelihood opportunities and increase the capacity of governments to address vulnerability issues.

Ms. Eugenio.

Ms. EUGENIO. Good afternoon, everyone. I'm really honored to be here today and to have the opportunity to engage in this very important discussion.

I want to thank the Helsinki Commission as well as Allison and Stacy for hosting this event today.

And I also want to thank once again our friend Siddharth Kara for producing this film, for engaging in this issue, for being a voice for the voiceless.

And as he said, I will try to keep my remarks fairly short, because I think it would be really good to engage in a conversation about some of these issues.

I wanted to give you a little bit of my impressions about this movie and the importance of this type of film being produced and being shared with all of us. To be honest—and I shared this with Allison earlier—I'm a mother of two young girls, and it was really hard for me to watch this film. And I was fortunate enough to be able to watch the film at the United Nations last week at the premiere of the movie. I had very strong reactions to the film. I had an emotional reaction and a physical reaction to it, because it was hard to see the exploitation of these young girls. And it was hard to see the fact that no matter how loud they screamed, they were not being heard.

And I actually think that it is important to feel uncomfortable when you're watching this movie. I think it is important because it reminds us that there are people out there who need our support and our thinking and our policy engagement. And all of us want to be a part of the solution.

Again, Siddharth has spent a lot of time working on this issue, both as a filmmaker, but also as a researcher. And his research has been giving us the opportunity to really, truly engage.

I wanted briefly just to mention a couple of things related to the new global estimates on forced labor, modern slavery, and child labor, to tell you a little bit about the work that we do in the Bureau of International Labor Affairs at the Department of Labor, and also to give you some concrete actions that we think could be taken to address the problem.

Many of you may know that the International Labour Organization and the Walk Free Foundation released new estimates of forced labor last month and also of child labor. There are about 25 million people trapped in forced labor, 20 million of which are in forced labor exploitation, and 5 million are estimated to be in sexual exploitation. Of the 5 million in sexual exploitation, 1 million are young girls. That's more than the population

of Washington, D.C. That, to me, is a striking number right there. And as good as these estimates are, I believe that they are just the tip of the iceberg. It is very difficult to actually quantify and measure trafficking and sexual exploitation.

I also wanted to talk a little bit about Enrique, who I think you all saw in the movie, because there were clear victims or survivors of trafficking, and there were clear people who were perpetrators of a crime. And Enrique, to me, fell in between. I thought a lot about his situation because he is one of those victims of forced labor that was in the situation because he was being coerced—because his family was actually being threatened. And even though he seemed to be sympathetic to the struggle and the violence and the exploitation, he felt that he was powerless to help.

About 20 million people find themselves in a similar situation. They're people who are working in construction, working in manufacturing, working in agriculture, people who are working in service industries. And I think it's also important for us to remember those victims. I think that it is important to look at commercial sexual exploitation and trafficking, but also to look at all the victims of labor exploitation that end up in forced labor, because those could be the potential future victims of trafficking in commercial sexual exploitation.

As I mentioned, the international organization also released numbers on child labor worldwide. And while there is a good story to tell there—there has been a reduction of about 94 million children since back in 2000 when estimates started to be collected—there are also 152 million children around the world who are victims of child labor exploitation. And many of those potentially could end up as victims of trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation.

Another thing that the movie highlighted for me was the importance of the different types of stakeholders and the different types of organizations that need to be part of the solution—and that involves government officials, it involves civil society organizations, academics, filmmakers, and all of us who are here today.

The movie highlighted for me, and the global estimates, that trafficking, forced labor, modern slavery, whatever term you want to use, is big business and is underpinned by crime, by corruption, and, in some cases, by good people turning a blind eye to the exploitation of others, which, again, I believe and I think you all share with me, that we should and we could all do more to help.

Just briefly in terms of what the Department of Labor does—how we engage in this issue—I am very fortunate to have been directing the work of the Department of Labor on international child labor, forced labor, and human trafficking for the last almost 20 years. During that period of time, we have worked in about 90 countries. Back in 1995 we held a symposium here in Washington on commercial sexual exploitation, forced prostitution of children.

We also in 1997 funded one of the first United States Government programs in Thailand to address the commercial sexual exploitation of children. And that project is important to me, not only because it was one of the first ones that we funded out there, but because there was a very good lesson learned coming out of there. Some of the girls that we were able to rescue from commercial sexual exploitation became social workers and were able to go back into their communities and provide assistance to others. That's one of our proud moments that I can speak about.

We also produce reports and research on international child labor, forced labor, and human trafficking issues. Last month we released an update to our annual report on child labor. This report covers about 130 countries and it's the most comprehensive research product out there on international child labor issues. So if you want to know more about the issues of child labor, that's a good resource for you.

We also produce several apps. You know, we all are in the business of using technology to advance and communicate. We have one app that includes information on child labor and another one that provides a resource to businesses to address child labor and forced labor in the global supply chain. I think, again, Siddharth has done some work on global supply chains and especially in the carpet industry of India. And I think that these are really good resources, these apps, and I am going to do a shameless plug for them. So please download the Sweat & Toil app and the Comply Chain app. They will be good resources for you.

Also this year, another tool that we'll be using to help address the issues of child labor and forced labor is our funding of about \$47 million in grants to address exploitation in fishing, in coffee global supply chains, and also the trafficking of people for forced labor.

Let me conclude by saying that I feel that none of us are alone in the fight, and that each one of us can play a role. And that may be coming on a Friday afternoon and watching a very emotional, touching movie, a very hard-to-watch movie—for me, doing this is already one step forward in this. And you talking to your colleagues, talking to your family members and talking to others about how you can do something about this issue is already a step in the right direction.

And as a mother, again, and as someone who has worked for a very long time on this issue, I hope that 5 years from now, 10 years from now, it will not be necessary for us to watch a movie like this in order to remind us that we should be doing more about this issue.

Thank you.

Ms. HOLLABAUGH. Thank you, Ms. Eugenio, for reminding us of Enrique, the forgotten trafficking victim, perhaps, in the movie, as well as underscoring the importance of the Sweat & Toil app and the forced and child labor report.

These reports—I can't underscore enough the importance of them. They inform Customs and Border Patrol what goods they need to block from coming into the United States. This takes profits away from traffickers. This is an extremely important report that's put out by Ms. Eugenio's office.

And the Sweat & Toil app as well, this can be used by both consumers and by corporations and any private entity that wants to have a clean supply or a consumer who wants to buy clothing that's not made with human trafficking. The Sweat & Toil app will help you and companies identify where products are probably tainted with child or other forms of trafficking.

Our next speaker is Dr. Alex Trouteaud. Alex is an applied sociologist and public policy expert who has studied trafficking and prostitution in the United States for over 10 years. He focuses on bringing the best available research insights into critical conversations around trafficking policy and social change. As a specialist in perpetrator accountability, Alex works to address gaps in how we understand and respond effectively to exploitation caused by illegal sex-buying behavior and networks.

Prior to joining Demand Abolition in D.C., Alex led youthSpark, a victims' service and advocacy nonprofit in Atlanta, Georgia.

Dr. Trouteaud, we're very interested in your thoughts on the movie.

Dr. TROUTEAUD. Well, thank you.

Before I say my very brief remarks, because I am conscious of the fact that it is Friday afternoon and the Nats lost in the worst kind of way last night—how many of you all stayed up for all of that game? Yeah. Whew, all right, we're past that now, though.

But first, before I make some remarks, I feel like we're missing something, which is to give a round of applause to Siddharth for making such an amazing film. [Applause.] Perhaps your strategy of stunning us worked a little too well, stunned us into forgetting to clap.

But it is a very emotionally moving film because it's an emotionally moving issue, and I'm not going to belabor that point. The thing I'm going to focus on today is why you are all here. I mean, not why you're in here in this briefing room right now, but why you're here. Right? You obviously want to do something good for the world, you want to come in and make a change, you want to be part of our national conversation about how we make this world a better place, a safer place, a fairer place.

So let's talk a little bit about how we understand the issue of sex trafficking specifically in a policy framework and what we can be doing about that, what we should be paying attention to. And there's a lot to unpack in the film. I mean, there's some really wonderful observations in there that you could take away about the role that bystanders had or could have had in reducing harms to these folks.

But let's bring it back up to the sort of dorky D.C. level here and talk about policy instead. I want to give you a framework for thinking about how we do policy on trafficking. And let's understand it as an economic crime, an economic crime that has a very severe toll on people's lives, but an economic crime nonetheless.

And so we've got supply, right, we've got the victims. We've got market facilitation, pimping trafficking, right? Those are the folks that are connecting supply to demand, absolutely. And so the demand in this issue are the sex buyers. Some of them were, like, super creepy. I'm not sure what casting criteria you used for that—[laughter]—but it gives me the heebie-jeebies just thinking about it.

You know, the reason why at Demand Abolition we focus on sex buyers is because of exactly what you saw in the film. This is an issue where vulnerable people are used as supply to meet the demands of perpetrators. So to the extent that we want to reduce victimization, we have to be thinking about the issue in a totally different way, right?

In fact, it's really easy to think about sex trafficking as an issue of victimization, but I would like to challenge you to instead think of it as an act of perpetration. In fact, really any time when we're dealing with interpersonal assault, sexual assault in particular, you don't need me to tell you, but I'll do it anyway—victimization always happens as a cause of perpetration. Let's talk a little bit about what that perpetration looks like. You have sex buyers and then you have also in this case exploiters, people who are taking advantage of vulnerable individuals; and their vulnerabilities are complex and they are based on what happens here in the United States and based on what's happening in other countries, which means we have a role as global citizens in addressing those vulnerabilities.

But fundamentally, we have to be thinking about what is driving those perpetrators and what would stop them. And I think a lot of people take a really cynical view about

sex buyers—that, oh, this is something that we can't solve, this is something we can't address. We actually already are. You hear a lot about how the trafficking trade is growing, and that may all be true, but if we actually look long term at sex-buying behavior in the United States, it may surprise you, but we're actually seeing less and less sex buying over time. There are more men who bought sex a generation ago than who do today, which means there can be even fewer in the next generation. The question is, what can we do to hasten that decline?

We've got to be thinking about how we as a society organize our policy and our resources in order to reduce demand. There's a lot of ways that we can do that. And if you want to talk about some of those detailed ones after the panel discussion, I'm happy to do that.

I do want to talk a little bit about what makes for a great policy in human trafficking. A great policy, in my view at least, is one that is tackling all dimensions of trafficking at the same time. It's addressing vulnerabilities of individuals. It's addressing victims' services, which you don't even see that in the movie, but those individuals who have been victimized by the sex trade have years and years of services ahead of them to bring them back to a place where they can function stably in society. It's expensive and it's difficult to deliver, but that's really, really important to make sure that those victim services are in place, so that's one.

And then two is making sure that we're keeping traffickers and other exploiters, those intermediaries, those market facilitators, that we make it as hard for them to do business as possible, make it as risky for them to do business as possible, because they're in it for business.

And then third, we have to do everything we can to reduce demand for paid sex in this country because that's where sex trafficking flourishes. So, to the extent we can do all three of those at the same time, that's a huge win. And, as Allison mentioned, we actually have an opportunity right now to do that—the Trafficking Victims Protection Act, the TVPA. I think one of the agents said it in a really great way on the jet as he's arresting the guy, right? That was good. [Laughter.]

But TVPA is the marquee legislation in the United States for addressing human trafficking of all forms and sex trafficking specifically, both domestically and globally. This law has come a long way over the years and it is absolutely mission critical that we reauthorize it, because it provides for victim services. The services that those young women are going to rely on for years to come in large part get funded through the reauthorization of TVPA. It relies on the steep penalties and law enforcement resources dedicated to get traffickers and third-party exploiters. And now it's also starting to get great new provisions that help us reduce demand, both from a criminal justice standpoint and also seen from a public health standpoint as well, too. We're making great progress, but that reauthorization needs to happen.

And because we don't want anything to be super easy in D.C., we have, I think by my latest count, five bills ?

Ms. HOLLABAUGH. Four. It's four, cutting down to four.

Dr. TROUTEAUD. We have—wink, wink—four bills that reauthorize TVPA right now that have passed one chamber. Whew. So there's a lot of work to do, but absolutely there is consensus within Congress on most of what's going on there—we just need to get everyone to the table to get it all settled out and then Allison can take a vacation.

Then the other one that I'd really like to bring your attention to—some bills cover a wide territory and those are fantastic, high-priority bills, and then other bills take a narrower approach and they try to expand our federal response to trafficking or sometimes our state response to sex trafficking. And right now, a really big one that's also pretty contentious, that I really encourage you to read up on, is reform efforts for the Communications Decency Act. What those reform efforts are intending to do is to unleash state resources to hold websites accountable when those website operators knowingly participate as sex traffickers.

Again, it is a complicated issue. I really encourage you to read up on all sides of it. But that's a great example of how we have to, as the market adapts, challenge ourselves about who is involved in the different parts of the crime of sex trafficking and how we most reasonably hold all of them responsible so that we can see this become rarer and rarer and rarer.

So happy to talk in more detail with any folks later if you want to get more involved in some of these bills.

Thank you again, Siddharth, for making a fantastic film; Allison, for hosting; and all of you for being here on a Friday afternoon. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms. HOLLABAUGH. Thank you, Dr. Trouteaud.

Depending on the count, there could be one that can be considered a companion bill that could be considered a fifth. [Laughter.] But the good news is that everybody is together at the table and the bills are highly compatible. Each one approaches the problem a little bit differently with a little bit different emphases, and together they will make an excellent reauthorization package. We're in the final stages of that now.

So we have many questions for the panelists. If there's not a burning question from the audience at the moment, I have—yes?

QUESTIONER. I just wanted to ask Mr. Trouteaud about the source of the statistics. It sounds—I mean, obviously, the problem is horrific, but if it's reducing then obviously we're doing something right. It would be good to know the sources.

Dr. TROUETAUD. Looking longer term in the United States, the University of Chicago has had a survey project called the General Social Survey, and they've asked about involvement in the prostitution industry for many years now. And that's where we see a pretty steady decline. It's still a significant problem. I think we're talking about a multi-billion-dollar industry in the United States—we're talking hundreds of thousands, at least, men who are buying sex, so it's still a very significant problem. Probably about 6 percent of U.S. men who have bought sex within the last year, so that's still a sizeable problem. But it's on the decline, and I take that as a sign of hope that we can keep pushing that down further.

QUESTIONER. Thank you.

QUESTIONER. Hello, Mr. Kara. I'm from Hank Johnson's office and we're representing Georgia.

In the film, I saw Ashley Judd who was portraying the bad guy, or the bad woman. And it's interesting because in the news right now, with Harvey Weinstein with the abuse of power, and I believe that Ashley Judd was one of the first ones who kind of came out, and we have so many celebrities—it doesn't have to be a celebrity—just so many women speaking out, and it has gained significant traction. And Harvey Weinstein now is not just portrayed as a bad guy, but a lot of people are speaking out against abuse of power.

I was just wondering, in terms of this particular topic, I know that we're talking on a more policy-focused issue right now, but is there something that can be done, for example, just like how Harvey Weinstein's case is unfolding, that if more people speak out, the trafficking can be reduced? I wanted your opinion on that.

Dr. TROUETAUD. I think you asked and answered the question beautifully: When more people speak out, when more people stand up and say this is not acceptable—a substantial number of men know other men who buy sex. How often do they talk about that? A substantial number of women know men who buy sex, and we don't talk about it. For the longest time, we wouldn't even arrest men who bought sex. Instead, we would just arrest people who we identified as prostitutes, many of whom had stories a lot like what you saw in the movie here today. So we're changing how we think about the issue, we're changing expectations for speaking out, and the more the rest of us can stand up as allies when someone is brave enough to speak out, the more we encourage that kind of accountability, which ultimately changes norms. That's my take on it, at least.

Ms. HOLLABAUGH. So, on that note, in many OSCE-participating States, the percentage of buyers of commercial sex in the population can be as high as 40 percent, which is a shocking number. And those are in cultures where purchase of commercial sex is widely accepted.

Another trend that we're seeing in the OSCE-participating States is huge numbers of migrants coming from Nigeria, Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, and other African countries, who have been bound by juju to their traffickers and feel like they must participate in sex trafficking in the OSCE-participating States because of being bound by juju. We saw an example of this in the movie.

I want to ask Professor Kara if you could explain a little bit more about the psychological coercion and how it can be remedied. And interestingly, the woman bound by juju was the one that didn't escape in the movie.

Dr. KARA. Yes, this is a very interesting question, and I write about it extensively. I just published my third book called "Modern Slavery: A Global Perspective," and I go chapter by chapter through all the key manifestations of slavery in the world today using case studies. And my case study on sex trafficking is the story of Nigeria. I spent a month there. And the focus of that research was trying to understand some of these cultural practices that I first encountered with Nigerian sex-trafficking victims across Western Europe who were terrified—terrified of cooperating with the police, terrified of testifying, terrified of not discharging these immense debts they had. And they had the largest debts, upwards of 40,000 to 50,000 euros, of any sex-trafficking victims I had ever encountered.

And they lived in such terrifying and palpable fear of a curse, a curse because a priest back in Nigeria had taken control over their womb, anything that had or might come from it one day. So I went to Nigeria to try to understand these practices. I spoke to several of the women there, and I even met a few juju priests. And you don't need chains, you don't even need physical threats or verbal threats when you've got something so much more powerful, which is a person's core belief.

And you couldn't rationalize it away. There is no explaining to a 16-year-old Nigerian girl who has given an oath that's part of her practice, and gone through these very intense rituals that involve hallucinogens and alcohol and drugs, that actually, no, the priest doesn't control, and he can't curse you. Because at that shrine where she went and had

the ritual performed, there are actually witch children running around hissing because they were born from a woman who broke her oath and had been cursed. It's so powerful.

And as I stepped into some of these shrines and some of these places, as rational and educated as I am, and I'm not even from that culture, I started to wonder, just what are the rules here? And when that happened to me, the penny dropped and I understood, retroactively, all those petrified, shivering Nigerian sex-trafficking victims I had met across Europe, across Asia, even in this country, who lived in fear of this oath, and that you will arrest them and deport them and send them back to Nigeria. And they'll walk for six months if that's what it takes to get back to their madam to pay off that debt because the consequences are so much more severe.

So this speaks to the power of culture, the power of certain matters relating to gender, the power of belief, but also the power of education and how important it is, especially in the developing world, and even in this country, to make sure young girls in particular get an education and have some capacity to earn a living other than having to take the desperate offer for distressed migration.

As Mali said, "I couldn't save my child unless I left my child." And that's the reality that was spoken to me by so many of the women in Nigeria and the things they put themselves through and the things many young women put themselves through, because the alternative to this doomsday journey with the trafficker—even when they know where it's headed—the alternative they face that moment in front of them, a starving child or a broken family or war or whatever, is so much more palpably worse.

Anyway, I spend a whole chapter talking about this in my book, and I could spend the rest of tonight doing so and just barely get started. But it is the most powerful hold over a young woman victim of sex trafficking that I've encountered anywhere in the world, and I've done this research in more than 50 countries. And this was everything I knew, I thought I knew, about human trafficking put on steroids and taken to an extreme. And few people know about these practices and understand them. So part of the character of Mali is to get that narrative and that story out.

Ms. HOLLABAUGH. Thank you for explaining in more detail the bonds that hold some of these girls, the psychological coercion. These are the type of bonds that law enforcement really need to be trained in because they're not as obvious. To many law enforcement, she may appear to be a willing prostituted woman as opposed to an unwilling one, when in fact there's a much deeper story there.

This topic also came up at the Alliance Against Human Trafficking Conference in the OSCE earlier this year. And I believe it was Kevin Hyland, who leads the fight against trafficking in the United Kingdom, who said that he had begun to try and work directly with juju priests in Nigeria and tell them this is what's going to happen to these girls when they leave your country, do not be a part of this, do not do these curses. And he has also looked into having juju priests in the U.K. have ceremonies that undo the curse and so the girls feel psychologically free from the curse. Whether or not that prevents the traffickers from taking retaliatory measures against their families in their home country is a whole other issue. That's more of a visa discussion. But there are some innovative ways being applied to address this very, very difficult psychological coercion problem.

Are there any other questions from the audience?

Yes?

QUESTIONER. Thank you, Professor Kara, for bringing your film to D.C. And thank you all for being here and sharing your afternoon with us and your thoughts.

My question is maybe for Dr. Trouteaud. Just last week here in D.C., Councilmember Grosso introduced a new resolution to decriminalize sex work in D.C. I'm curious what the latest research shows about the impact of the victims of sex trafficking.

Dr. TROUTEAUD. That is a great question. There are a lot of different ways folks think are ideal to combat sex trafficking and the broader problem of harms associated with prostitution. One of those ideas is a full legalization or a full decriminalization of the sex trade. And I think what Commissioner Grosso was trying to get at was laudable, noting how individuals who suffer in the sex trade often lack access to services, often are victims of violence. I think something like 3 percent of women who are murdered in the United States are prostitute women murdered by men. Let that sink in for a second—3 percent of all women murdered in the United States. So there's a real concern associated with the harms to women and youth and trans people in the life.

I think to the extent that we can reduce system involvement, to the extent that we can reduce harms caused by criminalization or caused by the unintended consequences of criminal justice involvement to prostituted persons, we should really be trying to do that. We should have a services-first approach at all times.

I think the problem is, when you look at what a policy that legalizes sex buying would do, it tends to create an offsetting effect. So, by legalizing sex buying, you actually reduce barriers to buying, which increases the amount of demand, which necessitates an increase in supply. So, while a full decriminalization is laudable in its goal, one of the unintended consequences—and we see this playing out internationally—one of the unintended consequences is, it so dramatically increases demand that it actually draws more vulnerable people into the very trade that it's trying to free people from. That's, I think, what we have to think really critically about.

To the extent that we can provide services instead of criminal justice involvement to prostituted persons, it's a really darn good thing. It's incredibly important because you see the stigma associated with it, you see the harms that they face, you see the violence that threatens their daily lives and you see what kind of desperation many of them are in. We should treat that as a humanitarian crisis. But to think that sex buying falls into the same camp, I think, is incorrect, and we need a different approach for buyers.

Ms. HOLLABAUGH. Thank you, Dr. Trouteaud.

There is an excellent London School of Economics study from 2012 that asks that same question, does the legalization of prostitution increase sex trafficking, and fully supports what Dr. Trouteaud has just shared. I would encourage it to be used for debates.

I saw another question.

QUESTIONER. I had a question for Dr. Kara. Well, first, I wanted to congratulate that this was shown at the U.N. last weekend, the opening. I'm really happy that I was able to see it just fresh off the bat.

Your character, the young woman with the blond hair who came out of foster care that was portrayed—I was wondering, how many people that are trafficked are from foster care in the United States? And also, are you considering showing your film to foster care homes? I don't know if that's too graphic, but if it's a huge, prevalent thing, whether it's worth showing to foster care centers.

Dr. KARA. Very good question. And there is a reason I wrote that character, the character of Sara coming out of the foster care system. In particular, in the last few years of my research, I kept encountering this scenario more and more often, either a young girl recruited while she was in foster care or very soon after aging out. In particular, because in the last several years there have been more and more cuts of those transitional protective nets and transitional services.

And I think one thing in the Frederick Douglass Reauthorization Act is to put some of that back. There is funding allocated to assist with transitional housing and assistance and care for individuals in and coming out of foster care. I just cannot stress how important that is. Vulnerability doesn't just happen on the far side of the world in developing countries. It certainly happens here and it certainly happens in the foster care system.

There isn't, to my knowledge, a sufficient answer to your question on data. In fact, this is one study that I'd really like to do in this country is a prevalence estimate of sex trafficking while in or coming out of the foster care system, because I think we need to have an answer, a very specific answer to that question, if it's a small percent or something, I think, probably more substantial than that. And that will really start to ring some bells in this country and start making us think about what kind of resources and protections need to be in place state by state across the country.

That's a study I'd like to do, and I don't think anyone has really done it yet, or done it substantially or nationally to get a sense of when you're talking about U.S. domestic teens, citizens who end up as victims of sex trafficking, how many of them came out of or were in the foster care system when that journey started. I think it's more than people realize because I keep coming across these cases, which is why I changed that character from the first draft of the script I wrote. In the second draft, I changed what her backstory was.

Amba's [backstory], the Indian girl, was always sort of the same, and Mali's was certainly always the same and very, very closely linked to one particular young woman I met in Nigeria. But Sara's I changed for this exact reason, because that conversation—people don't even realize it, let alone have a basis from which to have a conversation about the deficiencies that lead to her outcome.

Ms. HOLLABAUGH. Foster care, lack of housing—these are issues we see coming up very often as indicators of vulnerability, both in the United States and the other OSCE-participating States.

Ms. Eugenio, these indicators of vulnerability, are they the same with children who end up in labor trafficking? What are some of the similarities and, more importantly, what are some of the interventions that you have seen work around the world to prevent trafficking?

Ms. EUGENIO. Thank you, Allison, for that question. The indicators of forced labor, or really to forced labor or trafficking or modern slavery, tend to kind of differ but in some cases are the same, depending on the situation. The movie had various examples of indicators of forced labor. Coercion, or being somehow emotionally and culturally ingrained that you owe a debt to someone else and that you must pay that debt, issues of threats to yourself or to your family—I mean, you have situations in this movie about people being held against their will.

When it comes to labor trafficking, those indicators can be a little bit more subtle and that makes it even more difficult to address the problem because you are talking

about situations with somebody's wages being withheld. And initially you may think, well, this is just an issue of not receiving your wages or your salary. But if your wages are being withheld, you do not have the ability to leave your place of employment, you do not have the ability to actually seek help. You are, for all intents and purposes, in a situation of forced labor.

The same goes with issues if you're in a vulnerable situation because, in the case of Nigerian or African migrants going into Europe where you're outside of your home, outside of your culture, you do not have access to certain services. You do not have access to certain protections that other citizens of those countries will have.

The interventions differ as well. One of the things that we haven't really talked about or touched on here is this issue of prevention. We have talked a little bit about identifying victims, trying to provide assistance to survivors. And I agree with you that that is where the hard work really begins. It's not just rescuing somebody from a brothel, but what happens afterwards? How does that person get back to standing on their own two feet and building their own lives again?

But prevention is also very important, and the social systems need to be there; education, social protection, whether it is providing economic alternatives, ensuring that people have decent work. It's important for prevention purposes.

In the labor front, not the sexual exploitation front, I think that this is where the work that the Department of Labor does in conjunction with other U.S. Government agencies is very important. You know, we have really good wages, and our investigators are the frontline people who are there. They're not there to identify victims of trafficking, they are there to identify exploitation and abuse. But those are red flags and they can coordinate and they can raise awareness about the issue and they can, in some cases, refer back to other U.S. Government agencies that do have the ability to go in and enforce criminal law.

I just wanted to put it out there that there are very different ways to go about this issue. Prevention is something that we all really have to look at and focus on because we don't always want to have to be dealing with addressing a problem after it happens. And that's an area that requires a little bit more attention.

Ms. HOLLABAUGH. Thank you for underscoring the importance in particular of prevention. We're seeing a renewed interest in this, a renewed need for it in the U.S. Congress.

And in fact, in the Smith-Bass Frederick Douglass Trafficking Prevention and Protection Reauthorization Act, "prevention" was added this year for just the reasons Ms. Eugenio mentioned, to underscore the need for it. And the opening section of the bill is for grant money to go to schools so that children will be educated on the indicators of human trafficking, and so that their vulnerability will be reduced just through knowledge of this person that's offering to buy you all sorts of things and be your boyfriend and take you on trips—that this may not be as good of a deal as you think it is. Thank you very much for that.

I did see another question, and this will be our last one because we are running out of time.

QUESTIONER. It's another resource—we're going to be hosting a congressional briefing on November 2nd sponsored by the Society for the Psychological Study of Social Issues and the National Prevention Science Coalition to Save Lives, and it's going to be on

prevention. We're bringing in a number of psychologists and other social scientists to talk exactly about prevention, especially at the community level.

Ms. HOLLABAUGH. Thank you. It sounds like it will be an excellent event. Please feel free to send me the information and I will help you circulate it.

Are there any concluding thoughts from our panelists today?

Yes?

Ms. EUGENIO. Thank you, Allison. I wanted to share something finally with all of you because I think it's also important. This movie focused a lot on what was happening in the United States, but it also very clearly indicated the connection with what happens in other countries having an impact on what happens here. And that is true for a lot of the trafficking, forced labor, modern slavery situations that we have to deal with; they intertwine.

And there is a lot of discussion in the United States, and rightly so, about how we have to focus on U.S. citizens and U.S. workers. But also how preventing abuse and exploitation in other countries actually helps us level the playing field for U.S. workers and helps us address situations of exploitation in the United States.

So I once again thank you for the work that you do every day, Allison, and that the Commission does, because this broader view of the world is important. And it's important to remind ourselves that we're interconnected, and that a lot of what is happening in other parts of the world is affecting us in the United States, and we need to do more as well.

Thank you.

Ms. HOLLABAUGH. Thank you, Ms. Eugenio. I could not have said it better myself. We will leave it at that.

I hope you will join me in thanking our panelists. [Applause.]

[Whereupon, at 5:22 p.m., the briefing ended.]



This is an official publication of the **Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe.**



This publication is intended to document developments and trends in participating States of the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE).



All Commission publications may be freely reproduced, in any form, with appropriate credit. The Commission encourages the widest possible dissemination of its publications.



www.csce.gov **@HelsinkiComm**

The Commission's Web site provides access to the latest press releases and reports, as well as hearings and briefings. Using the Commission's electronic subscription service, readers are able to receive press releases, articles, and other materials by topic or countries of particular interest.

Please subscribe today.