

Federal Trade Commission

§ 3.45

shall not be ordered by the Administrative Law Judge except upon notice and opportunity for the hearing of objections. Such corrections shall be made by the official reporter by furnishing substitute type pages, under the usual certificate of the reporter, for insertion in the official record. The original uncorrected pages shall be retained in the files of the Commission.

(c) *Closing of the hearing record.* Upon completion of the evidentiary hearing, the Administrative Law Judge shall issue an order closing the hearing record after giving the parties 3 business days to determine if the record is complete or needs to be supplemented. The Administrative Law Judge shall retain the discretion to permit or order correction of the record as provided in § 3.44(b).

[74 FR 1832, Jan. 13, 2009, as amended at 76 FR 52252, Aug. 22, 2011]

§ 3.45 *In camera* orders.

(a) *Definition.* Except as hereinafter provided, material made subject to an *in camera* order will be kept confidential and not placed on the public record of the proceeding in which it was submitted. Only respondents, their counsel, authorized Commission personnel, and court personnel concerned with judicial review may have access thereto, provided that the Administrative Law Judge, the Commission and reviewing courts may disclose such *in camera* material to the extent necessary for the proper disposition of the proceeding.

(b) *In camera treatment of material.* A party or third party may obtain *in camera* treatment for material, or portions thereof, offered into evidence only by motion to the Administrative Law Judge. Parties who seek to use material obtained from a third party subject to confidentiality restrictions must demonstrate that the third party has been given at least 10 days notice of the proposed use of such material. Each such motion must include an attachment containing a copy of each page of the document in question on which *in camera* or otherwise confidential excerpts appear. The Administrative Law Judge shall order that such material, whether admitted or rejected, be placed *in camera* only after finding that its public disclosure will

likely result in a clearly defined, serious injury to the person, partnership, or corporation requesting *in camera* treatment or after finding that the material constitutes sensitive personal information. "Sensitive personal information" shall include, but shall not be limited to, an individual's Social Security number, taxpayer identification number, financial account number, credit card or debit card number, driver's license number, state-issued identification number, passport number, date of birth (other than year), and any sensitive health information identifiable by individual, such as an individual's medical records. For material other than sensitive personal information, a finding that public disclosure will likely result in a clearly defined, serious injury shall be based on the standard articulated in *H.P. Hood & Sons, Inc.*, 58 F.T.C. 1184, 1188 (1961); see also *Bristol-Myers Co.*, 90 F.T.C. 455, 456 (1977), which established a three-part test that was modified by *General Foods Corp.*, 95 F.T.C. 352, 355 (1980). The party submitting material for which *in camera* treatment is sought must provide, for each piece of such evidence and affixed to such evidence, the name and address of any person who should be notified in the event that the Commission intends to disclose *in camera* information in a final decision. No material, or portion thereof, offered into evidence, whether admitted or rejected, may be withheld from the public record unless it falls within the scope of an order issued in accordance with this section, stating the date on which *in camera* treatment will expire, and including:

- (1) A description of the material;
- (2) A statement of the reasons for granting *in camera* treatment; and
- (3) A statement of the reasons for the date on which *in camera* treatment will expire, except in the case of sensitive personal information, which shall be accorded permanent *in camera* treatment unless disclosure or an expiration date is required or provided by law. For *in camera* material other than sensitive personal information, an expiration date may not be omitted except in unusual circumstances, in which event the order shall state with specificity

§ 3.45

16 CFR Ch. I (1–1–23 Edition)

the reasons why the need for confidentiality of the material, or portion thereof at issue is not likely to decrease over time, and any other reasons why such material is entitled to *in camera* treatment for an indeterminate period. If an *in camera* order is silent as to duration, without explanation, then it will expire 3 years after its date of issuance. Material subject to an *in camera* order shall be segregated from the public record and filed in a sealed envelope, or other appropriate container, bearing the title, the docket number of the proceeding, the notation “*In Camera* Record under § 3.45,” and the date on which *in camera* treatment expires. If the Administrative Law Judge has determined that *in camera* treatment should be granted for an indeterminate period, the notation should state that fact. Parties are not required to provide documents subject to *in camera* treatment, including documents obtained from third parties, to any individual or entity other than the Administrative Law Judge, counsel for other parties, and, during an appeal, the Commission or a federal court.

(c) *Release of in camera material.* *In camera* material constitutes part of the confidential records of the Commission and is subject to the provisions of § 4.11 of this chapter.

(d) *Briefs and other submissions referring to in camera or confidential information.* Parties shall not disclose information that has been granted *in camera* status pursuant to § 3.45(b) or is subject to confidentiality protections pursuant to a protective order in the public version of proposed findings, briefs, or other documents. This provision does not preclude references in such proposed findings, briefs, or other documents to *in camera* or other confidential information or general statements based on the content of such information.

(e) *When in camera or confidential information is included in briefs and other submissions.* If a party includes specific information that has been granted *in camera* status pursuant to paragraph (b) of this section or is subject to confidentiality protections pursuant to a protective order in any document filed in a proceeding under this part, the party shall file 2 versions of the docu-

ment. A complete version shall be marked “*In Camera*” or “Subject to Protective Order,” as appropriate, on every page and shall be filed with the Secretary and served by the party on the other parties in accordance with the Commission’s rules. Submitters of *in camera* or other confidential material should mark any such material in the complete versions of their submissions in a conspicuous matter, such as with highlighting or bracketing. References to *in camera* or confidential material must be supported by record citations to relevant evidentiary materials and associated Administrative Law Judge *in camera* or other confidentiality rulings to confirm that *in camera* or other confidential treatment is warranted for such material. In addition, the document must include an attachment containing a copy of each page of the document in question on which *in camera* or otherwise confidential excerpts appear, and providing the name and address of any person who should be notified of the Commission’s intent to disclose in a final decision any of the *in camera* or otherwise confidential information in the document. Any time period within which these rules allow a party to respond to a document shall run from the date the party is served with the complete version of the document. An expurgated version of the document, marked “Public Record” on every page and omitting the *in camera* and confidential information and attachment that appear in the complete version, shall be filed with the Secretary within 5 days after the filing of the complete version, unless the Administrative Law Judge or the Commission directs otherwise, and shall be served by the party on the other parties in accordance with the rules in this part. The expurgated version shall indicate any omissions with brackets or ellipses, and its pagination and depiction of text on each page shall be identical to that of the *in camera* version.

(f) *When in camera or confidential information is included in rulings or recommendations of the Administrative Law Judge.* If the Administrative Law Judge includes in any ruling or recommendation information that has been granted *in camera* status pursuant to paragraph

(b) of this section or is subject to confidentiality protections pursuant to a protective order, the Administrative Law Judge shall file 2 versions of the ruling or recommendation. A complete version shall be marked “*In Camera*” or “Subject to Protective Order,” as appropriate, on every page and shall be served upon the parties. The complete version will be placed in the *in camera* record of the proceeding. An expurgated version, to be filed within 5 days after the filing of the complete version, shall omit the *in camera* and confidential information that appears in the complete version, shall be marked “Public Record” on every page, shall be served upon the parties, and shall be included in the public record of the proceeding.

(g) *Provisional in camera rulings.* The Administrative Law Judge may make a provisional grant of *in camera* status to materials if the showing required in § 3.45(b) cannot be made at the time the material is offered into evidence but the Administrative Law Judge determines that the interests of justice would be served by such a ruling. Within 20 days of such a provisional grant of *in camera* status, the party offering the evidence or an interested third party must present a motion to the Administrative Law Judge for a final ruling on whether *in camera* treatment of the material is appropriate pursuant to § 3.45(b). If no such motion is filed, the Administrative Law Judge may either exclude the evidence, deny *in camera* status, or take such other action as is appropriate.

[74 FR 1832, Jan. 13, 2009, as amended at 76 FR 52253, Aug. 22, 2011; 80 FR 15162, Mar. 3, 2015]

§ 3.46 Proposed findings, conclusions, and order.

(a) *General.* Within 21 days of the closing of the hearing record, each party may file with the Secretary for consideration of the Administrative Law Judge proposed findings of fact, conclusions of law, and rule or order, together with reasons therefor and briefs in support thereof. Such proposals shall be in writing, shall be served upon all parties, and shall contain adequate references to the record and authorities relied on. If a party in-

cludes in the proposals information that has been granted *in camera* status pursuant to § 3.45(b), the party shall file 2 versions of the proposals in accordance with the procedures set forth in § 3.45(e). Reply findings of fact, conclusions of law, and briefs may be filed by each party within 10 days of service of the initial proposed findings.

(b) *Exhibit index.* The first statement of proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law filed by a party shall include an index listing for each exhibit offered by the party and received in evidence:

- (1) The exhibit number, followed by
- (2) The exhibit’s title or a brief description if the exhibit is untitled;
- (3) The transcript page at which the Administrative Law Judge ruled on the exhibit’s admissibility or a citation to any written order in which such ruling was made;
- (4) The transcript pages at which the exhibit is discussed;
- (5) An identification of any other exhibit which summarizes the contents of the listed exhibit, or of any other exhibit of which the listed exhibit is a summary;
- (6) A cross-reference, by exhibit number, to any other portions of that document admitted as a separate exhibit on motion by any other party; and
- (7) A statement whether the exhibit has been accorded *in camera* treatment, and a citation to the *in camera* ruling.

(c) *Witness index.* The first statement of proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law filed by a party shall also include an index to the witnesses called by that party, to include for each witness:

- (1) The name of the witness;
- (2) A brief identification of the witness;
- (3) The transcript pages at which any testimony of the witness appears; and
- (4) A statement whether the witness testimony has been accorded *in camera* treatment, and a citation to the *in camera* ruling.

(d) *Stipulated indices.* As an alternative to the filing of separate indices, the parties are encouraged to stipulate to joint exhibit and witness indices at the time the first statement of proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law is due to be filed.