

Office of Thrift Supervision, Treasury

§ 509.1

(b) The Office's final decision shall contain a statement of the basis therefor. The Office may satisfy this requirement where it adopts the recommended decision of the presiding officer upon finding that the recommended decision satisfies the requirements of §509.38 of this chapter.

(c) The Secretary shall serve upon the petitioner and the representative of the Office of Enforcement a copy of the Office's final decision and the related recommended decision.

[54 FR 49444, Nov. 30, 1989, as amended at 56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991; 59 FR 53570, Oct. 25, 1994]

§ 508.14 Miscellaneous.

The provisions of §§509.10, 509.11, and 509.12 of this chapter shall apply to proceedings under this part.

[54 FR 49444, Nov. 30, 1989, as amended at 56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991]

PART 509—RULES OF PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE IN ADJUDICATORY PROCEEDINGS

Subpart A—Uniform Rules of Practice and Procedure

Sec.

- 509.1 Scope.
- 509.2 Rules of construction.
- 509.3 Definitions.
- 509.4 Authority of Director.
- 509.5 Authority of the administrative law judge.
- 509.6 Appearance and practice in adjudicatory proceedings.
- 509.7 Good faith certification.
- 509.8 Conflicts of interest.
- 509.9 Ex parte communications.
- 509.10 Filing of papers.
- 509.11 Service of papers.
- 509.12 Construction of time limits.
- 509.13 Change of time limits.
- 509.14 Witness fees and expenses.
- 509.15 Opportunity for informal settlement.
- 509.16 Office's right to conduct examination.
- 509.17 Collateral attacks on adjudicatory proceeding.
- 509.18 Commencement of proceeding and contents of notice.
- 509.19 Answer.
- 509.20 Amended pleadings.
- 509.21 Failure to appear.
- 509.22 Consolidation and severance of actions.
- 509.23 Motions.
- 509.24 Scope of document discovery.

- 509.25 Request for document discovery from parties.
- 509.26 Document subpoenas to nonparties.
- 509.27 Deposition of witness unavailable for hearing.
- 509.28 Interlocutory review.
- 509.29 Summary disposition.
- 509.30 Partial summary disposition.
- 509.31 Scheduling and prehearing conferences.
- 509.32 Prehearing submissions.
- 509.33 Public hearings.
- 509.34 Hearing subpoenas.
- 509.35 Conduct of hearings.
- 509.36 Evidence.
- 509.37 Post-hearing filings.
- 509.38 Recommended decision and filing of record.
- 509.39 Exceptions to recommended decision.
- 509.40 Review by the Director.
- 509.41 Stays pending judicial review.

Subpart B—Local Rules

- 509.100 Scope.
- 509.101 Appointment of Office of Financial Institution Adjudication.
- 509.102 Discovery.
- 509.103 Civil money penalties.
- 509.104 Additional procedures.

Subpart C—Special Rules

- 509.200 Scope.
- 509.201 Definitions.
- 509.202 Commencement of proceedings and contents of notice.
- 509.203 Answer, consequences of failure to answer, and consent.
- 509.204 Hearing Procedure.

Subpart D—Exemptions under Section 19(e) of the FDIA

- 509.300 Scope.
- 509.301 Hearing procedures.

AUTHORITY: 5 U.S.C. 504, 554-557; 12 U.S.C. 1464, 1467, 1467a, 1468, 1817(j), 1818, 1820(k), 1829(e), 3349, 4717; 15 U.S.C. 78(l), 78o-5, 78u-2; 28 U.S.C. 2461 note; 31 U.S.C. 5321; 42 U.S.C. 4012a.

SOURCE: 56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, unless otherwise noted.

Subpart A—Uniform Rules of Practice and Procedure

§ 509.1 Scope.

This subpart prescribes Uniform Rules of practice and procedure applicable to adjudicatory proceedings as to which hearings on the record are provided for by the following statutory provisions:

§ 509.2

(a) Cease-and-desist proceedings under section 8(b) of the Federal Deposit Insurance Act (FDIA) (12 U.S.C. 1818(b));

(b) Removal and prohibition proceedings under section 8(e) of the FDIA (12 U.S.C. 1818(e));

(c) Change-in-control proceedings under section 7(j)(4) of the FDIA (12 U.S.C. 1817(j)(4)) to determine whether the Office should issue an order to approve or disapprove a person's proposed acquisition of an institution and/or institution holding company;

(d) Proceedings under section 15C(c)(2) of the Securities Exchange Act of 1934 (Exchange Act) (15 U.S.C. 78o-5), to impose sanctions upon any government securities broker or dealer or upon any person associated or seeking to become associated with a government securities broker or dealer for which the Office is the appropriate Office;

(e) Assessment of civil money penalties by the Office against institutions, institution-affiliated parties, and certain other persons for which it is the appropriate Office for any violation of:

(1) Section 5 of the Home Owners' Loan Act (HOLA) or any regulation or order issued thereunder, pursuant to 12 U.S.C. 1464 (d), (s) and (v);

(2) Section 9 of the HOLA or any regulation or order issued thereunder, pursuant to 12 U.S.C. 1467(d);

(3) Section 10 of the HOLA, pursuant to 12 U.S.C. 1467a (i) and (r);

(4) Any provisions of the Change in Bank Control Act, any regulation or order issued thereunder or certain unsafe or unsound practices or breaches of fiduciary duty, pursuant to 12 U.S.C. 1817(j)(16);

(5) Sections 22(h) and 23 of the Federal Reserve Act, or any regulation issued thereunder or certain unsafe or unsound practices or breaches of fiduciary duty, pursuant to 12 U.S.C. 1468;

(6) Certain provisions of the Exchange Act, pursuant to section 21B of the Exchange Act (15 U.S.C. 78u-2);

(7) Section 1120 of Financial Institutions Reform, Recovery and Enforcement Act of 1989 (12 U.S.C. 3349), or any order or regulation issued thereunder;

(8) The terms of any final or temporary order issued or enforceable pur-

12 CFR Ch. V (1-1-18 Edition)

suant to section 8 of the FDIA or of any written agreement executed by the Office, the terms of any conditions imposed in writing by the Office in connection with the grant of an application or request, certain unsafe or unsound practices or breaches of fiduciary duty, or any law or regulation not otherwise provided herein pursuant to 12 U.S.C. 1818(i)(2);

(9) Any provision of law referenced in section 102 of the Flood Disaster Protection Act of 1973 (42 U.S.C. 4012a(f)) or any order or regulation issued thereunder; and

(10) Any provision of law referenced in 31 U.S.C. 5321 or any order or regulation issued thereunder;

(f) Remedial action under section 102 of the Flood Disaster Protection Act of 1973 (42 U.S.C. 4012a(g));

(g) Proceedings under section 10(k) of the FDIA (12 U.S.C. 1820(k)) to impose penalties on senior examiners for violation of post-employment prohibitions; and

(h) This subpart also applies to all other adjudications required by statute to be determined on the record after opportunity for an agency hearing, unless otherwise specifically provided for in the Local Rules.

(i) Subpart D of this part governs hearings on denials of applications for case-by-case exemptions under 12 CFR part 585, which implements section 19(e) of the FDIA.

[56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, as amended at 56 FR 59866, Nov. 26, 1991; 61 FR 20353, May 6, 1996; 70 FR 69641, Nov. 17, 2005; 72 FR 25955, May 8, 2007]

§ 509.2 Rules of construction.

For purposes of this subpart:

(a) Any term in the singular includes the plural, and the plural includes the singular, if such use would be appropriate;

(b) Any use of a masculine, feminine, or neuter gender encompasses all three, if such use would be appropriate;

(c) The term *counsel* includes a non-attorney representative; and

(d) Unless the context requires otherwise, a party's counsel of record, if any, may, on behalf of that party, take any action required to be taken by the party.

§ 509.3 Definitions.

For purposes of this subpart, unless explicitly stated to the contrary:

(a) *Administrative law judge* means one who presides at an administrative hearing under authority set forth at 5 U.S.C. 556.

(b) *Adjudicatory proceeding* means a proceeding conducted pursuant to these rules and leading to the formulation of a final order other than a regulation.

(c) *Decisional employee* means any member of the Office's or administrative law judge's staff who has not engaged in an investigative or prosecutorial role in a proceeding and who may assist the Office or the administrative law judge, respectively, in preparing orders, recommended decisions, decisions, and other documents under the Uniform Rules.

(d) *Director* means the Director of the Office of Thrift Supervision or his or her designee.

(e) *Enforcement Counsel* means any individual who files a notice of appearance as counsel on behalf of the Office in an adjudicatory proceeding.

(f) *Final order* means an order issued by the Office with or without the consent of the affected institution or the institution-affiliated party, that has become final, without regard to the pendency of any petition for reconsideration or review.

(g) *Institution* includes any savings association as that term is defined in section 3(b) of the FDIA (12 U.S.C. 1813(b)), any savings and loan holding company or any subsidiary thereof whether wholly or partly owned (other than a bank) as those terms are defined in section 10(a) of the HOLA (12 U.S.C. 1467(a)).

(h) *Institution-affiliated party* means any institution-affiliated party as that term is defined in section 3(u) of the FDIA (12 U.S.C. 1813(u)).

(i) *Local Rules* means those rules found in subpart B of this part.

(j) *Office* means the Office of Thrift Supervision in the case of any savings association or any savings and loan holding company, and subsidiary (other than a bank or subsidiary of that bank) of a savings and loan holding company, any service corporation of a savings association, and any subsidiary of such

service corporation, whether wholly or partly owned.

(k) *Office of Financial Institution Adjudication* (OFIA) means the executive body charged with overseeing the administration of administrative enforcement proceedings for the Office of the Comptroller of the Currency, the Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve Board, the Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation, the National Credit Union Administration and the Office.

(l) *Party* means the Office and any person named as a party in any notice.

(m) *Person* means an individual, sole proprietor, partnership, corporation, unincorporated association, trust, joint venture, pool, syndicate, agency or other entity or organization, including an institution as defined in paragraph (g) of this section.

(n) *Respondent* means any party other than the Office.

(o) *Uniform Rules* means those rules in subpart A of this part.

(p) *Violation* includes any action (alone or with another or others) for or toward causing, bringing about, participating in, counseling, or aiding or abetting a violation.

§ 509.4 Authority of Director.

The Director may, at any time during the pendency of a proceeding perform, direct the performance of, or waive performance of, any act which could be done or ordered by the administrative law judge.

§ 509.5 Authority of the administrative law judge.

(a) *General rule.* All proceedings governed by this part shall be conducted in accordance with the provisions of chapter 5 of title 5 of the United States Code. The administrative law judge shall have all powers necessary to conduct a proceeding in a fair and impartial manner and to avoid unnecessary delay.

(b) *Powers.* The administrative law judge shall have all powers necessary to conduct the proceeding in accordance with paragraph (a) of this section, including the following powers:

- (1) To administer oaths and affirmations;
- (2) To issue subpoenas, subpoenas duces tecum, and protective orders, as

§ 509.6

authorized by this part, and to quash or modify any such subpoenas and orders;

(3) To receive relevant evidence and to rule upon the admission of evidence and offers of proof;

(4) To take or cause depositions to be taken as authorized by this subpart;

(5) To regulate the course of the hearing and the conduct of the parties and their counsel;

(6) To hold scheduling and/or pre-hearing conferences as set forth in § 509.31 of this subpart;

(7) To consider and rule upon all procedural and other motions appropriate in an adjudicatory proceeding, provided that only the Director shall have the power to grant any motion to dismiss the proceeding or to decide any other motion that results in a final determination of the merits of the proceeding;

(8) To prepare and present to the Director a recommended decision as provided herein;

(9) To recuse himself or herself by motion made by a party or on his or her own motion;

(10) To establish time, place and manner limitations on the attendance of the public and the media for any public hearing; and

(11) To do all other things necessary and appropriate to discharge the duties of a presiding officer.

§ 509.6 Appearance and practice in adjudicatory proceedings.

(a) *Appearance before an Office or an administrative law judge*—(1) *By attorneys.* Any member in good standing of the bar of the highest court of any state, commonwealth, possession, territory of the United States, or the District of Columbia may represent others before the Office if such attorney is not currently suspended or debarred from practice before the Office.

(2) *By non-attorneys.* An individual may appear on his or her own behalf; a member of a partnership may represent the partnership; a duly authorized officer, director, or employee of any government unit, agency, institution, corporation or authority may represent that unit, agency, institution, corporation or authority if such officer, director, or employee is not currently sus-

12 CFR Ch. V (1–1–18 Edition)

pending or debarred from practice before the Office.

(3) *Notice of appearance.* Any individual acting as counsel on behalf of a party, including the Director, shall file a notice of appearance with OFIA at or before the time that individual submits papers or otherwise appears on behalf of a party in the adjudicatory proceeding. The notice of appearance must include a written declaration that the individual is currently qualified as provided in paragraph (a)(1) or (a)(2) of this section and is authorized to represent the particular party. By filing a notice of appearance on behalf of a party in an adjudicatory proceeding, the counsel agrees and represents that he or she is authorized to accept service on behalf of the represented party and that, in the event of withdrawal from representation, he or she will, if required by the administrative law judge, continue to accept service until new counsel has filed a notice of appearance or until the represented party indicates that he or she will proceed on a *pro se* basis.

(b) *Sanctions.* Dilatory, obstructive, egregious, contemptuous or contumacious conduct at any phase of any adjudicatory proceeding may be grounds for exclusion or suspension of counsel from the proceeding.

[56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, as amended at 61 FR 20354, May 6, 1996]

§ 509.7 Good faith certification.

(a) *General requirement.* Every filing or submission of record following the issuance of a notice shall be signed by at least one counsel of record in his or her individual name and shall state that counsel's address and telephone number. A party who acts as his or her own counsel shall sign his or her individual name and state his or her address and telephone number on every filing or submission of record.

(b) *Effect of signature.* (1) The signature of counsel or a party shall constitute a certification that: the counsel or party has read the filing or submission of record; to the best of his or her knowledge, information, and belief formed after reasonable inquiry, the filing or submission of record is well-grounded in fact and is warranted by existing law or a good faith argument

for the extension, modification, or reversal of existing law; and the filing or submission of record is not made for any improper purpose, such as to harass or to cause unnecessary delay or needless increase in the cost of litigation.

(2) If a filing or submission of record is not signed, the administrative law judge shall strike the filing or submission of record, unless it is signed promptly after the omission is called to the attention of the pleader or movant.

(c) *Effect of making oral motion or argument.* The act of making any oral motion or oral argument by any counsel or party constitutes a certification that to the best of his or her knowledge, information, and belief formed after reasonable inquiry, his or her statements are well-grounded in fact and are warranted by existing law or a good faith argument for the extension, modification, or reversal of existing law, and are not made for any improper purpose, such as to harass or to cause unnecessary delay or needless increase in the cost of litigation.

§ 509.8 Conflicts of interest.

(a) *Conflict of interest in representation.* No person shall appear as counsel for another person in an adjudicatory proceeding if it reasonably appears that such representation may be materially limited by that counsel's responsibilities to a third person or by the counsel's own interests. The administrative law judge may take corrective measures at any stage of a proceeding to cure a conflict of interest in representation, including the issuance of an order limiting the scope of representation or disqualifying an individual from appearing in a representative capacity for the duration of the proceeding.

(b) *Certification and waiver.* If any person appearing as counsel represents two or more parties to an adjudicatory proceeding or also represents a non-party on a matter relevant to an issue in the proceeding, counsel must certify in writing at the time of filing the notice of appearance required by § 509.6(a):

(1) That the counsel has personally and fully discussed the possibility of

conflicts of interest with each such party and non-party; and

(2) That each such party and non-party waives any right it might otherwise have had to assert any known conflicts of interest or to assert any non-material conflicts of interest during the course of the proceeding.

[56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, as amended at 61 FR 20354, May 6, 1996]

§ 509.9 Ex parte communications.

(a) *Definition*—(1) *Ex parte communication* means any material oral or written communication relevant to the merits of an adjudicatory proceeding that was neither on the record nor on reasonable prior notice to all parties that takes place between:

(i) An interested person outside the Office (including such person's counsel); and

(ii) The administrative law judge handling that proceeding, the Director, or a decisional employee.

(2) *Exception.* A request for status of the proceeding does not constitute an *ex parte* communication.

(b) *Prohibition of ex parte communications.* From the time the notice is issued by the Director until the date that the Director issues the final decision pursuant to § 509.40(c) of this subpart:

(1) No interested person outside the Office shall make or knowingly cause to be made an *ex parte* communication to the Director, the administrative law judge, or a decisional employee; and

(2) The Director, administrative law judge, or decisional employee shall not make or knowingly cause to be made to any interested person outside the Office any *ex parte* communication.

(c) *Procedure upon occurrence of ex parte communication.* If an *ex parte* communication is received by the administrative law judge, the Director or other person identified in paragraph (a) of this section, that person shall cause all such written communications (or, if the communication is oral, a memorandum stating the substance of the communication) to be placed on the record of the proceeding and served on all parties. All other parties to the proceeding shall have an opportunity, within ten days of receipt of service of

§ 509.10

the *ex parte* communication to file responses thereto and to recommend any sanctions, in accordance with paragraph (d) of this section, that they believe to be appropriate under the circumstances.

(d) *Sanctions.* Any party or his or her counsel who makes a prohibited *ex parte* communication, or who encourages or solicits another to make any such communication, may be subject to any appropriate sanction or sanctions imposed by the Director or the administrative law judge including, but not limited to, exclusion from the proceedings and an adverse ruling on the issue which is the subject of the prohibited communication.

(e) *Separation-of-functions.* Except to the extent required for the disposition of *ex parte* matters as authorized by law, the administrative law judge may not consult a person or party on any matter relevant to the merits of the adjudication, unless on notice and opportunity for all parties to participate. An employee or agent engaged in the performance of investigative or prosecuting functions for the Office in a case may not, in that or a factually related case, participate or advise in the decision, recommended decision, or agency review of the recommended decision under § 509.40 of this subpart, except as witness or counsel in public proceedings.

[56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, as amended at 60 FR 28035, May 30, 1995]

§ 509.10 Filing of papers.

(a) *Filing.* Any papers required to be filed, excluding documents produced in response to a discovery request pursuant to §§ 509.25 and 509.26 of this subpart, shall be filed with the OFIA, except as otherwise provided.

(b) *Manner of filing.* Unless otherwise specified by the Director or the administrative law judge, filing may be accomplished by:

- (1) Personal service;
- (2) Delivering the papers to a reliable commercial courier service, overnight delivery service, or to the U.S. Post Office for Express Mail delivery;
- (3) Mailing the papers by first class, registered, or certified mail; or
- (4) Transmission by electronic media, only if expressly authorized, and upon

12 CFR Ch. V (1–18 Edition)

any conditions specified, by the Director or the administrative law judge. All papers filed by electronic media shall also concurrently be filed in accordance with paragraph (c) of this section as to form.

(c) *Formal requirements as to papers filed*—(1) *Form.* All papers filed must set forth the name, address, and telephone number of the counsel or party making the filing and must be accompanied by a certification setting forth when and how service has been made on all other parties. All papers filed must be double-spaced and printed or typewritten on 8½ × 11 inch paper, and must be clear and legible.

(2) *Signature.* All papers must be dated and signed as provided in § 509.7 of this subpart.

(3) *Caption.* All papers filed must include at the head thereof, or on a title page, the name of the Office and of the filing party, the title and docket number of the proceeding, and the subject of the particular paper.

(4) *Number of copies.* Unless otherwise specified by the Director, or the administrative law judge, an original and one copy of all documents and papers shall be filed, except that only one copy of transcripts of testimony and exhibits shall be filed.

§ 509.11 Service of papers.

(a) *By the parties.* Except as otherwise provided, a party filing papers shall serve a copy upon the counsel of record for all other parties to the proceeding so represented, and upon any party not so represented.

(b) *Method of service.* Except as provided in paragraphs (c)(2) and (d) of this section, a serving party shall use one or more of the following methods of service:

- (1) Personal service;
- (2) Delivering the papers to a reliable commercial courier service, overnight delivery service, or to the U.S. Post Office for Express Mail delivery;
- (3) Mailing the papers by first class, registered, or certified mail; or
- (4) Transmission by electronic media, only if the parties mutually agree. Any papers served by electronic media shall also concurrently be served in accordance with the requirements of § 509.10(c) of this subpart as to form.

(c) *By the Director or the administrative law judge.* (1) All papers required to be served by the Director or the administrative law judge upon a party who has appeared in the proceeding through a counsel of record, shall be served by any means specified in paragraph (b) of this section.

(2) If a party has not appeared in the proceeding in accordance with §509.6 of this subpart, the Director or the administrative law judge shall make service by any of the following methods:

(i) By personal service;

(ii) If the person to be served is an individual, by delivery to a person of suitable age and discretion at the physical location where the individual resides or works;

(iii) If the person to be served is a corporation or other association, by delivery to an officer, managing or general agent, or to any other agent authorized by appointment or by law to receive service and, if the agent is one authorized by statute to receive service and the statute so requires, by also mailing a copy to the party;

(iv) By registered or certified mail addressed to the person's last known address; or

(v) By any other method reasonably calculated to give actual notice.

(d) *Subpoenas.* Service of a subpoena may be made:

(1) By personal service;

(2) If the person to be served is an individual, by delivery to a person of suitable age and discretion at the physical location where the individual resides or works;

(3) By delivery to an agent, which in the case of a corporation or other association, is delivery to an officer, managing or general agent, or to any other agent authorized by appointment or by law to receive service and, if the agent is one authorized by statute to receive service and the statute so requires, by also mailing a copy to the party;

(4) By registered or certified mail addressed to the person's last known address; or

(5) By any other method reasonably calculated to give actual notice.

(e) *Area of service.* Service in any state, territory, possession of the United States, or the District of Co-

lumbia, on any person or company doing business in any state, territory, possession of the United States, or the District of Columbia, or on any person as otherwise provided by law, is effective without regard to the place where the hearing is held, provided that if service is made on a foreign bank in connection with an action or proceeding involving one or more of its branches or agencies located in any state, territory, possession of the United States, or the District of Columbia, service shall be made on at least one branch or agency so involved.

[56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, as amended at 61 FR 20354, May 6, 1996]

§ 509.12 Construction of time limits.

(a) *General rule.* In computing any period of time prescribed by this subpart, the date of the act or event that commences the designated period of time is not included. The last day so computed is included unless it is a Saturday, Sunday, or Federal holiday. When the last day is a Saturday, Sunday, or Federal holiday, the period runs until the end of the next day that is not a Saturday, Sunday, or Federal holiday. Intermediate Saturdays, Sundays, and Federal holidays are included in the computation of time. However, when the time period within which an act is to be performed is ten days or less, not including any additional time allowed for in paragraph (c) of this section, intermediate Saturdays, Sundays, and Federal holidays are not included.

(b) *When papers are deemed to be filed or served.* (1) Filing and service are deemed to be effective:

(i) In the case of personal service or same day commercial courier delivery, upon actual service;

(ii) In the case of overnight commercial delivery service, U.S. Express mail delivery, or first class, registered, or certified mail, upon deposit in or delivery to an appropriate point of collection; or

(iii) In the case of transmission by electronic media, as specified by the authority receiving the filing, in the case of filing, and as agreed among the parties, in the case of service.

(2) The effective filing and service dates specified in paragraph (b)(1) of

§ 509.13

this section may be modified by the Director or administrative law judge in the case of filing or by agreement of the parties in the case of service.

(c) *Calculation of time for service and filing of responsive papers.* Whenever a time limit is measured by a prescribed period from the service of any notice or paper, the applicable time limits are calculated as follows:

(1) If service is made by first class, registered, or certified mail, add three calendar days to the prescribed period;

(2) If service is made by express mail or overnight delivery service, add one calendar day to the prescribed period; or

(3) If service is made by electronic media transmission, add one calendar day to the prescribed period, unless otherwise determined by the Director or the administrative law judge in the case of filing, or by agreement among the parties in the case of service.

[56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, as amended at 61 FR 20354, May 6, 1996]

§ 509.13 Change of time limits.

Except as otherwise provided by law, the administrative law judge may, for good cause shown, extend the time limits prescribed by the Uniform Rules or any notice or order issued in the proceedings. After the referral of the case to the Director pursuant to § 509.38 of this subpart, the Director may grant extensions of the time limits for good cause shown. Extensions may be granted at the motion of a party or on the Director's or the administrative law judge's own motion after notice and opportunity to respond is afforded all non-moving parties.

§ 509.14 Witness fees and expenses.

Witnesses subpoenaed for testimony or deposition shall be paid the same fees for attendance and mileage as are paid in the United States district courts in proceedings in which the United States is a party, provided that, in the case of a discovery subpoena addressed to a party, no witness fees or mileage need be paid. Fees for witnesses shall be tendered in advance by the party requesting the subpoena, except that fees and mileage need not be tendered in advance where the Office is the party requesting the subpoena. The

12 CFR Ch. V (1-1-18 Edition)

Office shall not be required to pay any fees to, or expenses of, any witness not subpoenaed by the Office.

§ 509.15 Opportunity for informal settlement.

Any respondent may, at any time in the proceeding, unilaterally submit to Enforcement Counsel written offers or proposals for settlement of a proceeding, without prejudice to the rights of any of the parties. No such offer or proposal shall be made to any Office representative other than Enforcement Counsel. Submission of a written settlement offer does not provide a basis for adjourning or otherwise delaying all or any portion of a proceeding under this part. No settlement offer or proposal, or any subsequent negotiation or resolution, is admissible as evidence in any proceeding.

§ 509.16 Office's right to conduct examination.

Nothing contained in this subpart limits in any manner the right of the Office to conduct any examination, inspection, or visitation of any institution or institution-affiliated party, or the right of the Office to conduct or continue any form of investigation authorized by law.

§ 509.17 Collateral attacks on adjudicatory proceeding.

If an interlocutory appeal or collateral attack is brought in any court concerning all or any part of an adjudicatory proceeding, the challenged adjudicatory proceeding shall continue without regard to the pendency of that court proceeding. No default or other failure to act as directed in the adjudicatory proceeding within the times prescribed in this subpart shall be excused based on the pendency before any court of any interlocutory appeal or collateral attack.

§ 509.18 Commencement of proceeding and contents of notice.

(a) *Commencement of proceeding.* (1)(i) Except for change-in-control proceedings under section 7(j)(4) of the FDIA (12 U.S.C. 1817(j)(4)), a proceeding governed by this subpart is commenced by issuance of a notice by the Director.

(ii) The notice must be served by the Director upon the respondent and given to any other appropriate financial institution supervisory authority where required by law.

(iii) The notice must be filed with the OFIA.

(2) Change-in control proceedings under section 7(j)(4) of the FDIA (12 U.S.C. 1817(j)(4)) commence with the issuance of an order by the Director.

(b) *Contents of notice.* The notice must set forth:

(1) The legal authority for the proceeding and for the Office's jurisdiction over the proceeding;

(2) A statement of the matters of fact or law showing that the Office is entitled to relief;

(3) A proposed order or prayer for an order granting the requested relief;

(4) The time, place, and nature of the hearing as required by law or regulation;

(5) The time within which to file an answer as required by law or regulation;

(6) The time within which to request a hearing as required by law or regulation; and

(7) The answer and/or request for a hearing shall be filed with OFIA.

§ 509.19 Answer.

(a) *When.* Within 20 days of service of the notice, respondent shall file an answer as designated in the notice. In a civil money penalty proceeding, respondent shall also file a request for a hearing within 20 days of service of the notice.

(b) *Content of answer.* An answer must specifically respond to each paragraph or allegation of fact contained in the notice and must admit, deny, or state that the party lacks sufficient information to admit or deny each allegation of fact. A statement of lack of information has the effect of a denial. Denials must fairly meet the substance of each allegation of fact denied; general denials are not permitted. When a respondent denies part of an allegation, that part must be denied and the remainder specifically admitted. Any allegation of fact in the notice which is not denied in the answer must be deemed admitted for purposes of the proceeding. A respondent is not required to respond

to the portion of a notice that constitutes the prayer for relief or proposed order. The answer must set forth affirmative defenses, if any, asserted by the respondent.

(c) *Default*—(1) *Effect of failure to answer.* Failure of a respondent to file an answer required by this section within the time provided constitutes a waiver of his or her right to appear and contest the allegations in the notice. If no timely answer is filed, Enforcement Counsel may file a motion for entry of an order of default. Upon a finding that no good cause has been shown for the failure to file a timely answer, the administrative law judge shall file with the Director a recommended decision containing the findings and the relief sought in the notice. Any final order issued by the Director based upon a respondent's failure to answer is deemed to be an order issued upon consent.

(2) *Effect of failure to request a hearing in civil money penalty proceedings.* If respondent fails to request a hearing as required by law within the time provided, the notice of assessment constitutes a final and unappealable order.

[56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, as amended at 65 FR 78901, Dec. 18, 2000]

§ 509.20 Amended pleadings.

(a) *Amendments.* The notice or answer may be amended or supplemented at any stage of the proceeding. The respondent must answer an amended notice within the time remaining for the respondent's answer to the original notice, or within ten days after service of the amended notice, whichever period is longer, unless the Director or administrative law judge orders otherwise for good cause.

(b) *Amendments to conform to the evidence.* When issues not raised in the notice or answer are tried at the hearing by express or implied consent of the parties, they will be treated in all respects as if they had been raised in the notice or answer, and no formal amendments are required. If evidence is objected to at the hearing on the ground that it is not within the issues raised by the notice or answer, the administrative law judge may admit the evidence when admission is likely to assist in adjudicating the merits of the action and the objecting party fails to

§ 509.21

satisfy the administrative law judge that the admission of such evidence would unfairly prejudice that party's action or defense upon the merits. The administrative law judge may grant a continuance to enable the objecting party to meet such evidence.

[61 FR 20354, May 6, 1996]

§ 509.21 Failure to appear.

Failure of a respondent to appear in person at the hearing or by a duly authorized counsel constitutes a waiver of respondent's right to a hearing and is deemed an admission of the facts as alleged and consent to the relief sought in the notice. Without further proceedings or notice to the respondent, the administrative law judge shall file with the Director a recommended decision containing the findings and the relief sought in the notice.

§ 509.22 Consolidation and severance of actions.

(a) *Consolidation.* (1) On the motion of any party, or on the administrative law judge's own motion, the administrative law judge may consolidate, for some or all purposes, any two or more proceedings, if each such proceeding involves or arises out of the same transaction, occurrence or series of transactions or occurrences, or involves at least one common respondent or a material common question of law or fact, unless such consolidation would cause unreasonable delay or injustice.

(2) In the event of consolidation under paragraph (a)(1) of this section, appropriate adjustment to the pre-hearing schedule must be made to avoid unnecessary expense, inconvenience, or delay.

(b) *Severance.* The administrative law judge may, upon the motion of any party, sever the proceeding for separate resolution of the matter as to any respondent only if the administrative law judge finds that:

(1) Undue prejudice or injustice to the moving party would result from not severing the proceeding; and

(2) Such undue prejudice or injustice would outweigh the interests of judicial economy and expedition in the complete and final resolution of the proceeding.

12 CFR Ch. V (1-1-18 Edition)

§ 509.23 Motions.

(a) *In writing.* (1) Except as otherwise provided herein, an application or request for an order or ruling must be made by written motion.

(2) All written motions must state with particularity the relief sought and must be accompanied by a proposed order.

(3) No oral argument may be held on written motions except as otherwise directed by the administrative law judge. Written memoranda, briefs, affidavits or other relevant material or documents may be filed in support of or in opposition to a motion.

(b) *Oral motions.* A motion may be made orally on the record unless the administrative law judge directs that such motion be reduced to writing.

(c) *Filing of motions.* Motions must be filed with the administrative law judge, but upon the filing of the recommended decision, motions must be filed with the Director.

(d) *Responses.* (1) Except as otherwise provided herein, within ten days after service of any written motion, or within such other period of time as may be established by the administrative law judge or the Director, any party may file a written response to a motion. The administrative law judge shall not rule on any oral or written motion before each party has had an opportunity to file a response.

(2) The failure of a party to oppose a written motion or an oral motion made on the record is deemed a consent by that party to the entry of an order substantially in the form of the order accompanying the motion.

(e) *Dilatory motions.* Frivolous, dilatory or repetitive motions are prohibited. The filing of such motions may form the basis for sanctions.

(f) *Dispositive motions.* Dispositive motions are governed by §§ 509.29 and 509.30 of this subpart.

§ 509.24 Scope of document discovery.

(a) *Limits on discovery.* (1) Subject to the limitations set out in paragraphs (b), (c), and (d) of this section, a party to a proceeding under this subpart may obtain document discovery by serving a written request to produce documents. For purposes of a request to

produce documents, the term “documents” may be defined to include drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, recordings, data stored in electronic form, and other data compilations from which information can be obtained, or translated, if necessary, by the parties through detection devices into reasonably usable form, as well as written material of all kinds.

(2) Discovery by use of deposition is governed by § 509.102 of this part.

(3) Discovery by use of interrogatories is not permitted.

(b) *Relevance.* A party may obtain document discovery regarding any matter, not privileged, that has material relevance to the merits of the pending action. Any request to produce documents that calls for irrelevant material, that is unreasonable, oppressive, excessive in scope, unduly burdensome, or repetitive of previous requests, or that seeks to obtain privileged documents will be denied or modified. A request is unreasonable, oppressive, excessive in scope or unduly burdensome if, among other things, it fails to include justifiable limitations on the time period covered and the geographic locations to be searched, the time provided to respond in the request is inadequate, or the request calls for copies of documents to be delivered to the requesting party and fails to include the requestor’s written agreement to pay in advance for the copying, in accordance with § 509.25 of this subpart.

(c) *Privileged matter.* Privileged documents are not discoverable. Privileges include the attorney-client privilege, work-product privilege, any government’s or government agency’s deliberative-process privilege, and any other privileges the Constitution, any applicable act of Congress, or the principles of common law provide.

(d) *Time limits.* All discovery, including all responses to discovery requests, shall be completed at least 20 days prior to the date scheduled for the commencement of the hearing, except as provided in the Local Rules. No exceptions to this time limit shall be permitted, unless the administrative law judge finds on the record that good

cause exists for waiving the requirements of this paragraph.

[56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, as amended at 61 FR 20354, May 6, 1996]

§ 509.25 Request for document discovery from parties.

(a) *General rule.* Any party may serve on any other party a request to produce for inspection any discoverable documents that are in the possession, custody, or control of the party upon whom the request is served. The request must identify the documents to be produced either by individual item or by category, and must describe each item and category with reasonable particularity. Documents must be produced as they are kept in the usual course of business or must be organized to correspond with the categories in the request.

(b) *Production or copying.* The request must specify a reasonable time, place, and manner for production and performing any related acts. In lieu of inspecting the documents, the requesting party may specify that all or some of the responsive documents be copied and the copies delivered to the requesting party. If copying of fewer than 250 pages is requested, the party to whom the request is addressed shall bear the cost of copying and shipping charges. If a party requests 250 pages or more of copying, the requesting party shall pay for the copying and shipping charges. Copying charges are the current per-page copying rate imposed under 12 CFR 502.7 for requests under the Freedom of Information Act (5 U.S.C. 552). The party to whom the request is addressed may require payment in advance before producing the documents.

(c) *Obligation to update responses.* A party who has responded to a discovery request with a response that was complete when made is not required to supplement the response to include documents thereafter acquired, unless the responding party learns that:

(1) The response was materially incorrect when made; or

(2) The response, though correct when made, is no longer true and a failure to amend the response is, in substance, a knowing concealment.

(d) *Motions to limit discovery.* (1) Any party that objects to a discovery request may, within ten days of being served with such request, file a motion in accordance with the provisions of § 509.23 of this subpart to revoke or otherwise limit the request. If an objection is made to only a portion of an item or category in a request, the portion objected to shall be specified. Any objections not made in accordance with this paragraph and § 509.23 of this subpart are waived.

(2) The party who served the request that is the subject of a motion to revoke or limit may file a written response within five days of service of the motion. No other party may file a response.

(e) *Privilege.* At the time other documents are produced, the producing party must reasonably identify all documents withheld on the grounds of privilege and must produce a statement of the basis for the assertion of privilege. When similar documents that are protected by deliberative process, attorney-work-product, or attorney-client privilege are voluminous, these documents may be identified by category instead of by individual document. The administrative law judge retains discretion to determine when the identification by category is insufficient.

(f) *Motions to compel production.* (1) If a party withholds any documents as privileged or fails to comply fully with a discovery request, the requesting party may, within ten days of the assertion of privilege or of the time the failure to comply becomes known to the requesting party, file a motion in accordance with the provisions of § 509.23 of this subpart for the issuance of a subpoena compelling production.

(2) The party who asserted the privilege or failed to comply with the request may file a written response to a motion to compel within five days of service of the motion. No other party may file a response.

(g) *Ruling on motions.* After the time for filing responses pursuant to this section has expired, the administrative law judge shall rule promptly on all motions filed pursuant to this section. If the administrative law judge determines that a discovery request, or any

of its terms, calls for irrelevant material, is unreasonable, oppressive, excessive in scope, unduly burdensome, or repetitive of previous requests, or seeks to obtain privileged documents, he or she may deny or modify the request, and may issue appropriate protective orders, upon such conditions as justice may require. The pendency of a motion to strike or limit discovery or to compel production is not a basis for staying or continuing the proceeding, unless otherwise ordered by the administrative law judge. Notwithstanding any other provision in this part, the administrative law judge may not release, or order a party to produce, documents withheld on grounds of privilege if the party has stated to the administrative law judge its intention to file a timely motion for interlocutory review of the administrative law judge's order to produce the documents, and until the motion for interlocutory review has been decided.

(h) *Enforcing discovery subpoenas.* If the administrative law judge issues a subpoena compelling production of documents by a party, the subpoenaing party may, in the event of noncompliance and to the extent authorized by applicable law, apply to any appropriate United States district court for an order requiring compliance with the subpoena. A party's right to seek court enforcement of a subpoena shall not in any manner limit the sanctions that may be imposed by the administrative law judge against a party who fails to produce subpoenaed documents.

[56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, as amended at 61 FR 20355, May 6, 1996]

§ 509.26 Document subpoenas to non-parties.

(a) *General rules.* (1) Any party may apply to the administrative law judge for the issuance of a document discovery subpoena addressed to any person who is not a party to the proceeding. The application must contain a proposed document subpoena and a brief statement showing the general relevance and reasonableness of the scope of documents sought. The subpoenaing party shall specify a reasonable time, place, and manner for making production in response to the document subpoena.

(2) A party shall only apply for a document subpoena under this section within the time period during which such party could serve a discovery request under §509.24(d) of this subpart. The party obtaining the document subpoena is responsible for serving it on the subpoenaed person and for serving copies on all parties. Document subpoenas may be served in any state, territory, or possession of the United States, the District of Columbia, or as otherwise provided by law.

(3) The administrative law judge shall promptly issue any document subpoena requested pursuant to this section. If the administrative law judge determines that the application does not set forth a valid basis for the issuance of the subpoena, or that any of its terms are unreasonable, oppressive, excessive in scope, or unduly burdensome, he or she may refuse to issue the subpoena or may issue it in a modified form upon such conditions as may be consistent with the Uniform Rules.

(b) *Motion to quash or modify.* (1) Any person to whom a document subpoena is directed may file a motion to quash or modify such subpoena, accompanied by a statement of the basis for quashing or modifying the subpoena. The movant shall serve the motion on all parties, and any party may respond to such motion within ten days of service of the motion.

(2) Any motion to quash or modify a document subpoena must be filed on the same basis, including the assertion of privilege, upon which a party could object to a discovery request under §509.25(d) of this subpart, and during the same time limits during which such an objection could be filed.

(c) *Enforcing document subpoenas.* If a subpoenaed person fails to comply with any subpoena issued pursuant to this section or any order of the administrative law judge which directs compliance with all or any portion of a document subpoena, the subpoenaing party or any other aggrieved party may, to the extent authorized by applicable law, apply to an appropriate United States district court for an order requiring compliance with so much of the document subpoena as the administrative law judge has not quashed or modified. A party's right to seek court

enforcement of a document subpoena shall in no way limit the sanctions that may be imposed by the administrative law judge on a party who induces a failure to comply with subpoenas issued under this section.

§ 509.27 Deposition of witness unavailable for hearing.

(a) *General rules.* (1) If a witness will not be available for the hearing, a party may apply in accordance with the procedures set forth in paragraph (a)(2) of this section, to the administrative law judge for the issuance of a subpoena, including a subpoena duces tecum, requiring the attendance of the witness at a deposition. The administrative law judge may issue a deposition subpoena under this section upon showing that:

(i) The witness will be unable to attend or may be prevented from attending the hearing because of age, sickness or infirmity, or will otherwise be unavailable;

(ii) The witness' unavailability was not procured or caused by the subpoenaing party;

(iii) The testimony is reasonably expected to be material; and

(iv) Taking the deposition will not result in any undue burden to any other party and will not cause undue delay of the proceeding.

(2) The application must contain a proposed deposition subpoena and a brief statement of the reasons for the issuance of the subpoena. The subpoena must name the witness whose deposition is to be taken and specify the time and place for taking the deposition. A deposition subpoena may require the witness to be deposed at any place within the country in which that witness resides or has a regular place of employment or such other convenient place as the administrative law judge shall fix.

(3) Any requested subpoena that sets forth a valid basis for its issuance must be promptly issued, unless the administrative law judge on his or her own motion, requires a written response or requires attendance at a conference concerning whether the requested subpoena should be issued.

(4) The party obtaining a deposition subpoena is responsible for serving it

§ 509.28

on the witness and for serving copies on all parties. Unless the administrative law judge orders otherwise, no deposition under this section shall be taken on fewer than ten days' notice to the witness and all parties. Deposition subpoenas may be served in any state, territory, possession of the United States, or the District of Columbia, on any person or company doing business in any state, territory, possession of the United States, or the District of Columbia, or as otherwise permitted by law.

(b) Objections to deposition subpoenas.

(1) The witness and any party who has not had an opportunity to oppose a deposition subpoena issued under this section may file a motion with the administrative law judge to quash or modify the subpoena prior to the time for compliance specified in the subpoena, but not more than ten days after service of the subpoena.

(2) A statement of the basis for the motion to quash or modify a subpoena issued under this section must accompany the motion. The motion must be served on all parties.

(c) Procedure upon deposition. (1) Each witness testifying pursuant to a deposition subpoena must be duly sworn, and each party shall have the right to examine the witness. Objections to questions or documents must be in short form, stating the grounds for the objection. Failure to object to questions or documents is not deemed a waiver except where the ground for the objection might have been avoided if the objection had been timely presented. All questions, answers, and objections must be recorded.

(2) Any party may move before the administrative law judge for an order compelling the witness to answer any questions the witness has refused to answer or submit any evidence the witness has refused to submit during the deposition.

(3) The deposition must be subscribed by the witness, unless the parties and the witness, by stipulation, have waived the signing, or the witness is ill, cannot be found, or has refused to sign. If the deposition is not subscribed by the witness, the court reporter taking the deposition shall certify that

12 CFR Ch. V (1-1-18 Edition)

the transcript is a true and complete transcript of the deposition.

(d) Enforcing subpoenas. If a subpoenaed person fails to comply with any order of the administrative law judge which directs compliance with all or any portion of a deposition subpoena under paragraph (b) or (c)(2) of this section, the subpoenaing party or other aggrieved party may, to the extent authorized by applicable law, apply to an appropriate United States district court for an order requiring compliance with the portions of the subpoena that the administrative law judge has ordered enforced. A party's right to seek court enforcement of a deposition subpoena in no way limits the sanctions that may be imposed by the administrative law judge on a party who fails to comply with or procures a failure to comply with, a subpoena issued under this section.

§ 509.28 Interlocutory review.

(a) General rule. The Director may review a ruling of the administrative law judge prior to the certification of the record to the Director only in accordance with the procedures set forth in this section and § 509.23 of this subpart.

(b) Scope of review. The Director may exercise interlocutory review of a ruling of the administrative law judge if the Director finds that:

(1) The ruling involves a controlling question of law or policy as to which substantial grounds exist for a difference of opinion;

(2) Immediate review of the ruling may materially advance the ultimate termination of the proceeding;

(3) Subsequent modification of the ruling at the conclusion of the proceeding would be an inadequate remedy; or

(4) Subsequent modification of the ruling would cause unusual delay or expense.

(c) Procedure. Any request for interlocutory review shall be filed by a party with the administrative law judge within ten days of his or her ruling and shall otherwise comply with § 509.23 of this subpart. Any party may file a response to a request for interlocutory review in accordance with

§ 509.23(d) of this subpart. Upon the expiration of the time for filing all responses, the administrative law judge shall refer the matter to the Director for final disposition.

(d) *Suspension of proceeding.* Neither a request for interlocutory review nor any disposition of such a request by the Director under this section suspends or stays the proceeding unless otherwise ordered by the administrative law judge or the Director.

§ 509.29 Summary disposition.

(a) *In general.* The administrative law judge shall recommend that the Director issue a final order granting a motion for summary disposition if the undisputed pleaded facts, admissions, affidavits, stipulations, documentary evidence, matters as to which official notice may be taken, and any other evidentiary materials properly submitted in connection with a motion for summary disposition show that:

(1) There is no genuine issue as to any material fact; and

(2) The moving party is entitled to a decision in its favor as a matter of law.

(b) *Filing of motions and responses.* (1) Any party who believes that there is no genuine issue of material fact to be determined and that he or she is entitled to a decision as a matter of law may move at any time for summary disposition in its favor of all or any part of the proceeding. Any party, within 20 days after service of such a motion, or within such time period as allowed by the administrative law judge, may file a response to such motion.

(2) A motion for summary disposition must be accompanied by a statement of the material facts as to which the moving party contends there is no genuine issue. Such motion must be supported by documentary evidence, which may take the form of admissions in pleadings, stipulations, depositions, investigatory depositions, transcripts, affidavits and any other evidentiary materials that the moving party contends support his or her position. The motion must also be accompanied by a brief containing the points and authorities in support of the contention of the moving party. Any party opposing a motion for summary disposition must file a statement setting forth those

material facts as to which he or she contends a genuine dispute exists. Such opposition must be supported by evidence of the same type as that submitted with the motion for summary disposition and a brief containing the points and authorities in support of the contention that summary disposition would be inappropriate.

(c) *Hearing on motion.* At the request of any party or on his or her own motion, the administrative law judge may hear oral argument on the motion for summary disposition.

(d) *Decision on motion.* Following receipt of a motion for summary disposition and all responses thereto, the administrative law judge shall determine whether the moving party is entitled to summary disposition. If the administrative law judge determines that summary disposition is warranted, the administrative law judge shall submit a recommended decision to that effect to the Director. If the administrative law judge finds that no party is entitled to summary disposition, he or she shall make a ruling denying the motion.

§ 509.30 Partial summary disposition.

If the administrative law judge determines that a party is entitled to summary disposition as to certain claims only, he or she shall defer submitting a recommended decision as to those claims. A hearing on the remaining issues must be ordered. Those claims for which the administrative law judge has determined that summary disposition is warranted will be addressed in the recommended decision filed at the conclusion of the hearing.

§ 509.31 Scheduling and prehearing conferences.

(a) *Scheduling conference.* Within 30 days of service of the notice or order commencing a proceeding or such other time as parties may agree, the administrative law judge shall direct counsel for all parties to meet with him or her in person at a specified time and place prior to the hearing or to confer by telephone for the purpose of scheduling the course and conduct of the proceeding. This meeting or telephone

§ 509.32

conference is called a “scheduling conference.” The identification of potential witnesses, the time for and manner of discovery, and the exchange of any prehearing materials including witness lists, statements of issues, stipulations, exhibits and any other materials may also be determined at the scheduling conference.

(b) *Prehearing conferences.* The administrative law judge may, in addition to the scheduling conference, on his or her own motion or at the request of any party, direct counsel for the parties to meet with him or her (in person or by telephone) at a prehearing conference to address any or all of the following:

- (1) Simplification and clarification of the issues;
- (2) Stipulations, admissions of fact, and the contents, authenticity and admissibility into evidence of documents;
- (3) Matters of which official notice may be taken;
- (4) Limitation of the number of witnesses;
- (5) Summary disposition of any or all issues;
- (6) Resolution of discovery issues or disputes;
- (7) Amendments to pleadings; and
- (8) Such other matters as may aid in the orderly disposition of the proceeding.

(c) *Transcript.* The administrative law judge, in his or her discretion, may require that a scheduling or prehearing conference be recorded by a court reporter. A transcript of the conference and any materials filed, including orders, becomes part of the record of the proceeding. A party may obtain a copy of the transcript at its expense.

(d) *Scheduling or prehearing orders.* At or within a reasonable time following the conclusion of the scheduling conference or any prehearing conference, the administrative law judge shall serve on each party an order setting forth any agreements reached and any procedural determinations made.

[56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, as amended at 65 FR 78901, Dec. 18, 2000]

§ 509.32 Prehearing submissions.

(a) Within the time set by the administrative law judge, but in no case later than 14 days before the start of the

12 CFR Ch. V (1–1–18 Edition)

hearing, each party shall serve on every other party, his or her:

- (1) Prehearing statement;
- (2) Final list of witnesses to be called to testify at the hearing, including name and address of each witness and a short summary of the expected testimony of each witness;
- (3) List of the exhibits to be introduced at the hearing along with a copy of each exhibit; and
- (4) Stipulations of fact, if any.

(b) *Effect of failure to comply.* No witness may testify and no exhibits may be introduced at the hearing if such witness or exhibit is not listed in the prehearing submissions pursuant to paragraph (a) of this section, except for good cause shown.

§ 509.33 Public hearings.

(a) *General rule.* All hearings shall be open to the public, unless the Director, in the Director’s discretion, determines that holding an open hearing would be contrary to the public interest. Within 20 days of service of the notice or, in the case of change-in-control proceedings under section 7(j)(4) of the FDIA (12 U.S.C. 1817(j)(4)), within 20 days from service of the hearing order, any respondent may file with the Director a request for a private hearing, and any party may file a reply to such a request. A party must serve on the administrative law judge a copy of any request or reply the party files with the Director. The form of, and procedure for, these requests and replies are governed by § 509.23 of this subpart. A party’s failure to file a request or a reply constitutes a waiver of any objections regarding whether the hearing will be public or private.

(b) *Filing document under seal.* Enforcement Counsel, in his or her discretion, may file any document or part of a document under seal if disclosure of the document would be contrary to the public interest. The administrative law judge shall take all appropriate steps to preserve the confidentiality of such documents or parts thereof, including closing portions of the hearing to the public.

[56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, as amended at 61 FR 20355, May 6, 1996]

§ 509.34 Hearing subpoenas.

(a) *Issuance.* (1) Upon application of a party showing general relevance and reasonableness of scope of the testimony or other evidence sought, the administrative law judge may issue a subpoena or a subpoena duces tecum requiring the attendance of a witness at the hearing or the production of documentary or physical evidence at the hearing. The application for a hearing subpoena must also contain a proposed subpoena specifying the attendance of a witness or the production of evidence from any state, territory, or possession of the United States, the District of Columbia, or as otherwise provided by law at any designated place where the hearing is being conducted. The party making the application shall serve a copy of the application and the proposed subpoena on every other party.

(2) A party may apply for a hearing subpoena at any time before the commencement of a hearing. During a hearing, a party may make an application for a subpoena orally on the record before the administrative law judge.

(3) The administrative law judge shall promptly issue any hearing subpoena requested pursuant to this section. If the administrative law judge determines that the application does not set forth a valid basis for the issuance of the subpoena, or that any of its terms are unreasonable, oppressive, excessive in scope, or unduly burdensome, he or she may refuse to issue the subpoena or may issue it in a modified form upon any conditions consistent with this subpart. Upon issuance by the administrative law judge, the party making the application shall serve the subpoena on the person named in the subpoena and on each party.

(b) *Motion to quash or modify.* (1) Any person to whom a hearing subpoena is directed or any party may file a motion to quash or modify the subpoena, accompanied by a statement of the basis for quashing or modifying the subpoena. The movant must serve the motion on each party and on the person named in the subpoena. Any party may respond to the motion within ten days of service of the motion.

(2) Any motion to quash or modify a hearing subpoena must be filed prior to the time specified in the subpoena for compliance, but not more than ten days after the date of service of the subpoena upon the movant.

(c) *Enforcing subpoenas.* If a subpoenaed person fails to comply with any subpoena issued pursuant to this section or any order of the administrative law judge which directs compliance with all or any portion of a document subpoena, the subpoenaing party or any other aggrieved party may seek enforcement of the subpoena pursuant to section § 509.26(c) of this subpart.

[56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, as amended at 61 FR 20355, May 6, 1996]

§ 509.35 Conduct of hearings.

(a) *General rules.* (1) Hearings shall be conducted so as to provide a fair and expeditious presentation of the relevant disputed issues. Each party has the right to present its case or defense by oral and documentary evidence and to conduct such cross examination as may be required for full disclosure of the facts.

(2) *Order of hearing.* Enforcement Counsel shall present its case-in-chief first, unless otherwise ordered by the administrative law judge, or unless otherwise expressly specified by law or regulation. Enforcement Counsel shall be the first party to present an opening statement and a closing statement, and may make a rebuttal statement after the respondent's closing statement. If there are multiple respondents, respondents may agree among themselves as to their order of presentation of their cases, but if they do not agree the administrative law judge shall fix the order.

(3) *Examination of witnesses.* Only one counsel for each party may conduct an examination of a witness, except that in the case of extensive direct examination, the administrative law judge may permit more than one counsel for the party presenting the witness to conduct the examination. A party may have one counsel conduct the direct examination and another counsel conduct re-direct examination of a witness, or may have one counsel conduct the

§ 509.36

cross examination of a witness and another counsel conduct the re-cross examination of a witness.

(4) *Stipulations.* Unless the administrative law judge directs otherwise, all stipulations of fact and law previously agreed upon by the parties, and all documents, the admissibility of which have been previously stipulated, will be admitted into evidence upon commencement of the hearing.

(b) *Transcript.* The hearing must be recorded and transcribed. The reporter will make the transcript available to any party upon payment by that party to the reporter of the cost of the transcript. The administrative law judge may order the record corrected, either upon motion to correct, upon stipulation of the parties, or following notice to the parties upon the administrative law judge's own motion.

[56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, as amended at 61 FR 20356, May 6, 1996]

§ 509.36 Evidence.

(a) *Admissibility.* (1) Except as is otherwise set forth in this section, relevant, material, and reliable evidence that is not unduly repetitive is admissible to the fullest extent authorized by the APA and other applicable law.

(2) Evidence that would be admissible under the Federal Rules of Evidence is admissible in a proceeding conducted pursuant to this subpart.

(3) Evidence that would be inadmissible under the Federal Rules of Evidence may not be deemed or ruled to be inadmissible in a proceeding conducted pursuant to this subpart if such evidence is relevant, material, reliable and not unduly repetitive.

(b) *Official notice.* (1) Official notice may be taken of any material fact which may be judicially noticed by a United States district court and any material information in the official public records of any Federal or state government agency.

(2) All matters officially noticed by the administrative law judge or Director shall appear on the record.

(3) If official notice is requested or taken of any material fact, the parties, upon timely request, shall be afforded an opportunity to object.

(c) *Documents.* (1) A duplicate copy of a document is admissible to the same

12 CFR Ch. V (1-1-18 Edition)

extent as the original, unless a genuine issue is raised as to whether the copy is in some material respect not a true and legible copy of the original.

(2) Subject to the requirements of paragraph (a) of this section, any document, including a report of examination, supervisory activity, inspection or visitation, prepared by the appropriate Office or state regulatory agency, is admissible either with or without a sponsoring witness.

(3) Witnesses may use existing or newly created charts, exhibits, calendars, calculations, outlines or other graphic material to summarize, illustrate, or simplify the presentation of testimony. Such materials may, subject to the administrative law judge's discretion, be used with or without being admitted into evidence.

(d) *Objections.* (1) Objections to the admissibility of evidence must be timely made and rulings on all objections must appear on the record.

(2) When an objection to a question or line of questioning propounded to a witness is sustained, the examining counsel may make a specific proffer on the record of what he or she expected to prove by the expected testimony of the witness, either by representation of counsel or by direct interrogation of the witness.

(3) The administrative law judge shall retain rejected exhibits, adequately marked for identification, for the record, and transmit such exhibits to the Director.

(4) Failure to object to admission of evidence or to any ruling constitutes a waiver of the objection.

(e) *Stipulations.* The parties may stipulate as to any relevant matters of fact or the authentication of any relevant documents. Such stipulations must be received in evidence at a hearing, and are binding on the parties with respect to the matters therein stipulated.

(f) *Depositions of unavailable witnesses.* (1) If a witness is unavailable to testify at a hearing, and that witness has testified in a deposition to which all parties in a proceeding had notice and an opportunity to participate, a party may offer as evidence all or any part of the transcript of the deposition, including deposition exhibits, if any.

Office of Thrift Supervision, Treasury

§ 509.38

(2) Such deposition transcript is admissible to the same extent that testimony would have been admissible had that person testified at the hearing, provided that if a witness refused to answer proper questions during the depositions, the administrative law judge may, on that basis, limit the admissibility of the deposition in any manner that justice requires.

(3) Only those portions of a deposition received in evidence at the hearing constitute a part of the record.

§ 509.37 Post-hearing filings.

(a) *Proposed findings and conclusions and supporting briefs.* (1) Using the same method of service for each party, the administrative law judge shall serve notice upon each party, that the certified transcript, together with all hearing exhibits and exhibits introduced but not admitted into evidence at the hearing, has been filed. Any party may file with the administrative law judge proposed findings of fact, proposed conclusions of law, and a proposed order within 30 days following service of this notice by the administrative law judge or within such longer period as may be ordered by the administrative law judge.

(2) Proposed findings and conclusions must be supported by citation to any relevant authorities and by page references to any relevant portions of the record. A post-hearing brief may be filed in support of proposed findings and conclusions, either as part of the same document or in a separate document. Any party who fails to file timely with the administrative law judge any proposed finding or conclusion is deemed to have waived the right to raise in any subsequent filing or submission any issue not addressed in such party's proposed finding or conclusion.

(b) *Reply briefs.* Reply briefs may be filed within 15 days after the date on which the parties' proposed findings, conclusions, and order are due. Reply briefs must be strictly limited to responding to new matters, issues, or arguments raised in another party's papers. A party who has not filed proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law or a post-hearing brief may not file a reply brief.

(c) *Simultaneous filing required.* The administrative law judge shall not order the filing by any party of any brief or reply brief in advance of the other party's filing of its brief.

[56 FR 38306, Aug. 12, 1991, as amended at 61 FR 20356, May 6, 1996]

§ 509.38 Recommended decision and filing of record.

(a) *Filing of recommended decision and record.* Within 45 days after expiration of the time allowed for filing reply briefs under § 509.37(b) of this subpart, the administrative law judge shall file with and certify to the Director, for decision, the record of the proceeding. The record must include the administrative law judge's recommended decision, recommended findings of fact, recommended conclusions of law, and proposed order; all prehearing and hearing transcripts, exhibits, and rulings; and the motions, briefs, memoranda, and other supporting papers filed in connection with the hearing. The administrative law judge shall serve upon each party the recommended decision, findings, conclusions, and proposed order.

(b) *Filing of index.* At the same time the administrative law judge files with and certifies to the Director for final determination the record of the proceeding, the administrative law judge shall furnish to the Director a certified index of the entire record of the proceeding. The certified index shall include, at a minimum, an entry for each paper, document or motion filed with the administrative law judge in the proceeding, the date of the filing, and the identity of the filer. The certified index shall also include an exhibit index containing, at a minimum, an entry consisting of exhibit number and title or description for: Each exhibit introduced and admitted into evidence at the hearing; each exhibit introduced but not admitted into evidence at the hearing; each exhibit introduced and admitted into evidence after the completion of the hearing; and each exhibit introduced but not admitted into evidence after the completion of the hearing.

[61 FR 20356, May 6, 1996]

§ 509.39

§ 509.39 Exceptions to recommended decision.

(a) *Filing exceptions.* Within 30 days after service of the recommended decision, findings, conclusions, and proposed order under § 509.38 of this subpart, a party may file with the Director written exceptions to the administrative law judge's recommended decision, findings, conclusions or proposed order, to the admission or exclusion of evidence, or to the failure of the administrative law judge to make a ruling proposed by a party. A supporting brief may be filed at the time the exceptions are filed, either as part of the same document or in a separate document.

(b) *Effect of failure to file or raise exceptions.* (1) Failure of a party to file exceptions to those matters specified in paragraph (a) of this section within the time prescribed is deemed a waiver of objection thereto.

(2) No exception need be considered by the Director if the party taking exception had an opportunity to raise the same objection, issue, or argument before the administrative law judge and failed to do so.

(c) *Contents.* (1) All exceptions and briefs in support of such exceptions must be confined to the particular matters in, or omissions from, the administrative law judge's recommendations to which that party takes exception.

(2) All exceptions and briefs in support of exceptions must set forth page or paragraph references to the specific parts of the administrative law judge's recommendations to which exception is taken, the page or paragraph references to those portions of the record relied upon to support each exception, and the legal authority relied upon to support each exception.

§ 509.40 Review by the Director.

(a) *Notice of submission to the Director.* When the Director determines that the record in the proceeding is complete, the Director shall serve notice upon the parties that the proceeding has been submitted to the Director for final decision.

(b) *Oral argument before the Director.* Upon the initiative of the Director or on the written request of any party

12 CFR Ch. V (1-1-18 Edition)

filed with the Director within the time for filing exceptions, the Director may order and hear oral argument on the recommended findings, conclusions, decision, and order of the administrative law judge. A written request by a party must show good cause for oral argument and state reasons why arguments cannot be presented adequately in writing. A denial of a request for oral argument may be set forth in the Director's final decision. Oral argument before the Director must be on the record.

(c) *Director's final decision.* (1) Decisional employees may advise and assist the Director in the consideration and disposition of the case. The final decision of the Director will be based upon review of the entire record of the proceeding, except that the director may limit the issues to be reviewed to those findings and conclusions to which opposing arguments or exceptions have been filed by the parties.

(2) The Director shall render a final decision within 90 days after notification of the parties that the case has been submitted for final decision, or 90 days after oral argument, whichever is later, unless the Director orders that the action or any aspect thereof be remanded to the administrative law judge for further proceedings. Copies of the final decision and order of the Director shall be served upon each party to the proceeding, upon other persons required by statute, and, if directed by the Director or required by statute, upon any appropriate state or Federal supervisory authority.

§ 509.41 Stays pending judicial review.

The commencement of proceedings for judicial review of a final decision and order of the Office may not, unless specifically ordered by the Director or a reviewing court, operate as a stay of any order issued by the Director. The Director may, in its discretion, and on such terms as it finds just, stay the effectiveness of all or any part of its order pending a final decision on a petition for review of the order.