§ 302.31 Initial and recommended decisions; certification of the record.

(a) Action by administrative law judge after hearing. Except where the DOT decisionmaker directs otherwise, after the taking of evidence and the receipt of briefs which may include proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, if any, the administrative law judge shall take the following action:

(1) Initial decision. If the proceeding does not involve foreign air transportation, the administrative law judge shall render an “initial decision.” Such decision shall encompass the administrative law judge’s decision on the merits of the proceeding and on all ancillary procedural issues remaining for disposition at the close of the hearing.

(2) Recommended decision. In cases where the action of the Department involves foreign air transportation and is subject to review by the President of the United States pursuant to section 41307 of the Statute, the administrative law judge shall render a “recommended decision.” Such decision shall encompass the administrative law judge’s decision on the merits of the proceeding and on all ancillary procedural issues remaining for disposition at the close of the hearing.

(b) Certification to the DOT decisionmaker for decision. At any time prior to the close of the hearing, the DOT decisionmaker may direct the administrative law judge to certify any question or the entire record in the proceeding to the DOT decisionmaker for decision. In cases where the record is thus certified, the administrative law judge shall not render a decision but shall make a recommendation to the DOT decisionmaker as required by section 8(a) of the Administrative Procedure Act (5 U.S.C. 558(a)) unless advised by the DOT decisionmaker that he or she intends to issue a tentative decision.

(c) Every initial or recommended decision issued shall state the names of the persons who are to be served with copies of it, the time within which exceptions to, or petitions for review of, such decision may be filed, and the time within which briefs in support of the exceptions may be filed. In addition, every such decision shall recite that it is made under delegated authority, and contain notice of the provisions of paragraph (d) of this section. In the event the administrative law judge certifies the record to the DOT decisionmaker without an initial or recommended decision, he or she shall notify the parties of the time within which to file with the DOT decisionmaker briefs which may include proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law.

(d) Unless a petition for discretionary review is filed pursuant to § 302.32, exceptions are filed pursuant to § 302.217, or the DOT decisionmaker issues an order to review upon his or her own initiative, the initial decision shall become effective as the final order of the Department thirty (30) days after service thereof; in the case of a recommended decision, that decision shall be transmitted to the President of the United States under 49 U.S.C. 41307. If a petition for discretionary review or exceptions are timely filed or action to review is taken by the DOT decisionmaker upon his or her own initiative, the effectiveness of the initial decision or the transmission of the recommended decision is stayed until the further order of the DOT decisionmaker.

§ 302.32 Petitions for discretionary review of initial or recommended decisions; review proceedings.

(a) Petitions for discretionary review. (1) Review by the DOT decisionmaker pursuant to this section is not a matter of right but is at the sole discretion of the DOT decisionmaker. Any party may file and serve a petition for discretionary review by the DOT decisionmaker of an initial decision or recommended decision within twenty-one (21) days after service thereof, unless the DOT decisionmaker sets a different period for filing.

(2) Petitions for discretionary review shall be filed only upon one or more of the following grounds:

(i) A finding of a material fact is erroneous;

(ii) A necessary legal conclusion is without governing precedent or is a departure from or contrary to law, the Department’s rules, or precedent;

(iii) A substantial and important question of law, policy or discretion is involved; or
(iv) A prejudicial procedural error has occurred.

(3) Each issue shall be separately numbered and plainly and concisely stated. Petitioners shall not restate the same point in repetitive discussions of an issue. Each issue shall be supported by detailed citations of the record when objections are based on the record, and by statutes, regulations or principal authorities relied upon. Any matters of fact or law not argued before the administrative law judge, but that the petitioner proposes to argue on brief to the DOT decisionmaker, shall be stated.

(4) Petitions for discretionary review shall be self-contained and shall not incorporate by reference any part of another document. Except by permission of the DOT decisionmaker, petitions shall not exceed twenty (20) pages including appendices and other papers physically attached to the petition.

(5) Requests for oral argument on petitions for discretionary review will not be entertained by the DOT decisionmaker.

(b) Answers. Within fifteen (15) days after service of a petition for discretionary review, any party may file and serve an answer of not more than fifteen (15) pages in support of or in opposition to the petition. If any party desires to answer more than one petition for discretionary review in the same proceeding, he or she shall do so in a single document of not more than twenty (20) pages.

(c) Orders declining review. The DOT decisionmaker's order declining to exercise the discretionary right of review will specify the date upon which the administrative law judge's decision shall become effective as the final decision of the Department. A petition for reconsideration of a Department order declining review will be entertained only when the order exercises, in part, the DOT decisionmaker's discretionary right of review, and such petition shall be limited to the single question of whether any issue designated for review and any issue not so designated are so inseparably interrelated that the former cannot be reviewed independently or that the latter cannot be made effective before the final decision of the Department in the review proceeding.

(d) Review proceedings. (1) The DOT decisionmaker may take review of an initial or recommended decision upon petition or on his or her own initiative or both. The DOT decisionmaker will issue a final order upon such review without further proceedings on any or all the issues where he or she finds that matters raised do not warrant further proceedings.

(2) Where the DOT decisionmaker desires further proceedings, he or she will issue an order for review that will:

(i) Specify the issues to which review will be limited. Only those issues specified in the order shall be argued on brief to the DOT decisionmaker, pursuant to §302.35, and considered by the DOT decisionmaker;

(ii) Specify the portions of the administrative law judge's decision, if any, that are to be stayed as well as the effective date of the remaining portions thereof; and

(iii) Designate the parties to the review proceeding.

§ 302.33 Tentative decision of the DOT decisionmaker.

(a) Except as provided in paragraph (b) of this section, whenever the administrative law judge certifies the record in a proceeding directly to the DOT decisionmaker without issuing an initial or recommended decision in the matter, the DOT decisionmaker shall, after consideration of any briefs submitted by the parties, prepare a tentative decision and serve it upon the parties. Every tentative decision of the DOT decisionmaker shall state the names of the persons who are to receive copies of it, the time within which exceptions to such decision and briefs, if any, in support of or in opposition to the exceptions may be filed, and the date when such decision will become final in the absence of exceptions thereto. If no exceptions are filed to the tentative decision of the DOT decisionmaker within the period fixed, it shall become final at the expiration of such period unless the DOT decisionmaker orders otherwise.

(b) The DOT decisionmaker may, in his or her discretion, omit a tentative decision in proceedings under subpart