

PART 614—NRCS APPEAL PROCEDURES

Sec.

- 614.1 General.
- 614.2 Definitions.
- 614.3 Decisions subject to informal appeal procedures.
- 614.4 Decisions not subject to appeal.
- 614.5 Reservation of authority.
- 614.6 Agency records and decision notices.
- 614.7 Preliminary technical determinations.
- 614.8 Final technical determinations.
- 614.9 Program decisions.
- 614.10 Appeals before the Farm Service Agency county committee.
- 614.11 Mediation.
- 614.12 Transcripts.
- 614.13 Appealability review.
- 614.14 Computation of time.
- 614.15 Implementation of final agency decisions.
- 614.16 Participation of third parties in NRCS proceedings.
- 614.17 Judicial review.

AUTHORITY: 5 U.S.C. 301; 7 U.S.C. 6932 and 6995; and 16 U.S.C. 3822(a).

SOURCE: 71 FR 28245, May 16, 2006, unless otherwise noted.

§ 614.1 General.

This part sets forth the informal appeal procedures under which a participant may appeal adverse technical determinations or program decisions made by officials of the Natural Resources Conservation Service (NRCS), an agency under the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA). These regulations reflect NRCS policy to resolve at the agency level, to the greatest extent possible, disputes arising from adverse technical determinations and program decisions made by NRCS. Once a decision is rendered final by NRCS, participants may appeal to the National Appeals Division (NAD) as provided for under 7 CFR part 11, or the FSA county committee pursuant to 7 CFR part 780 for decisions rendered under Title XII of the Food Security Act of 1985, as amended, 16 U.S.C. 3801 *et seq.* (Title XII).

§ 614.2 Definitions.

The following definitions are applicable for the purposes of this part:

- (a) *Agency* means NRCS and its personnel.
- (b) *Agency record* means all documents and materials, including docu-

ments submitted by the participant and those generated by NRCS, upon which the agency bases its program decision or technical determination. NRCS maintains the agency record and will, upon request, make available a copy of the agency record to the participant(s) involved in the dispute.

(c) *Appeal* means a written request by a participant asking for review (including mediation) of an adverse NRCS technical determination or program decision under this part. An appeal must set out the reason(s) for appeal and include any supporting documentation. An appeal is considered filed when it is received by the appropriate NRCS official as indicated in the decision notice.

(d) *Chief* means the Chief of NRCS or his or her designee.

(e) *Commodity Credit Corporation (CCC)* means a wholly owned Government corporation within USDA.

(f) *Conservation district* means any district or unit of State or local government developed under State law for the express purpose of developing and carrying out a local soil and water conservation program. Such district or unit of government may be referred to as a conservation district, soil and water conservation district, natural resource district, conservation committee, or similar name.

(g) *County committee* means a Farm Service Agency (FSA) county or area committee established in accordance with section 8(b) of the Soil Conservation and Domestic Allotment Act (16 U.S.C. 590h(b)).

(h) *Designated conservationist* means the NRCS official, usually the district conservationist, whom the State Conservationist designates to be responsible for the program or compliance requirement to which this part is applicable.

(i) *Final technical determination* means a decision by NRCS concerning the status and condition of the natural resources and cultural practices based on science and best professional judgment of natural resource professionals concerning soils, water, air, plants, and animals that has become final through the informal appeal process, the expiration of the time period to appeal, or waiver of the appeal process.

(j) *Hearing* means an informal appeal proceeding that affords a participant opportunity to present testimony and documentary evidence to show why an adverse program decision is in error and why the adverse decision should be reversed or modified.

(k) *Mediation* means a process in which a neutral third party, the mediator, meets with the disputing parties, usually the participant and the agency. Through mediation, the parties have the opportunity to work together with the assistance of the mediator to: Improve communications, understand the relevant issues, develop and explore alternatives, and reach a mutually satisfactory resolution.

(l) *Mediator* means a neutral third party who serves as an impartial facilitator between two or more disputants to assist them in resolving a dispute. The mediator does not take sides or render decisions on the merits of the dispute. The mediator assists the parties in identifying areas of agreement and encourages the parties to explore potential options toward resolution.

(m) *Participant* means any individual or entity who has applied for, or whose right to participate in or receive, a payment or other benefit in accordance with any program administered by NRCS to which the regulations in this part apply is affected by a decision of NRCS. The term does not include those individuals or entities excluded in the definition of participant published at 7 CFR 11.1.

(n) *Preliminary technical determination* means the initial written decision by NRCS on a technical matter concerning the status and condition of the natural resources and cultural practices based on science and best professional judgment of natural resources professionals concerning soils, water, air, plants and animals, which has not become final under this part.

(o) *Program decision* means a written decision by NRCS concerning eligibility for program benefits, program administration or program implementation and based upon applicable regulations and program instructions. Program decisions are issued as final decisions.

(p) *Qualified mediator* means a mediator who is accredited under State law

in those States that have a mediation program certified by the USDA pursuant to 7 CFR part 785, or, in those States that do not have a mediation program certified by the USDA, an individual who has attended a minimum of 40 hours of core mediator knowledge and skills training and, to remain in a qualified mediator status, completes a minimum of 20 hours of additional training or education during each 2-year period. Such training or education must be approved by USDA, by an accredited college or university, or by one of the following organizations: State Bar, a State mediation association, a State approved mediation program, or a society of dispute resolution professionals.

(q) *Reconsideration* means a subsequent consideration of a preliminary technical determination by the designated conservationist or the State Conservationist.

(r) *Secretary* means the Secretary of Agriculture.

(s) *State Conservationist* means the NRCS official, or his or her designee, in charge of NRCS operations within a State.

(t) *Title XII* means Title XII of the Food Security Act of 1985, as amended, 16 U.S.C. 3801 et seq.

(u) *Verbatim transcript* means the official, written record of proceedings of a hearing of an adverse program decision appealable under this part.

§ 614.3 Decisions subject to informal appeal procedures.

(a) This part applies to NRCS adverse program decisions and technical determinations made with respect to:

(1) Conservation programs and regulatory requirements authorized under Title XII, including:

- (i) Conservation Security Program;
- (ii) Conservation Reserve Program and the Conservation Reserve Enhancement Program;
- (iii) Environmental Quality Incentives Program;
- (iv) Farm and Ranch Lands Protection Program;
- (v) Grassland Reserve Program;
- (vi) Highly Erodible Land Conservation;
- (vii) Wetland Conservation;
- (viii) Wetlands Reserve Program;

§614.4

7 CFR Ch. VI (1–1–09 Edition)

(ix) Wildlife Habitat Incentives Program; and

(x) Conservation Innovation Grants.

(2) Non-Title XII conservation programs or provisions, including:

(i) Agriculture Management Assistance Program;

(ii) Emergency Watershed Protection Program;

(iii) Soil and Water Conservation Program;

(iv) Water Bank Program;

(v) Watershed Protection and Flood Prevention Program; and

(vi) Healthy Forest Reserve Program.

(3) Any other program to which this part is made applicable.

(b) With respect to matters identified in paragraph (a) of this section, participants may appeal adverse decisions concerning:

(1) Denial of participation in a program;

(2) Compliance with program requirements;

(3) Issuance of payments or other program benefits to a participant in a program;

(4) Technical determinations made under Title XII;

(5) Technical determinations or program decisions that affect a participant's eligibility for USDA program benefits;

(6) The failure of an official of NRCS to issue a technical determination or program decision subject to this part; and

(7) Incorrect application of general policies, statutory or regulatory requirements.

(c) Only a participant directly affected by a program decision or a technical determination made by NRCS may invoke the informal appeal procedures contained in this part.

(d) Appeals of adverse final technical determinations and program decisions subject to this part are also covered by the NAD rules of procedure, set forth at 7 CFR part 11, and by the FSA county committee appeals process, set forth at 7 CFR part 780, for informal appeals of Title XII decisions.

§614.4 Decisions not subject to appeal.

(a) Decisions that are not appealable under this part include:

(1) Any general program provision, program policy, or any statutory or regulatory requirement that is applicable to all similarly situated participants, such as:

(i) Program application ranking criteria;

(ii) Program application screening criteria

(iii) Published soil surveys; or

(iv) Conservation practice technical standards included in the local field office technical guide or the electronic FOTG (eFOTG).

(2) Mathematical or scientific formulas established under a statute or program regulation and a program decision or technical determination based solely on the application of those formulas;

(3) Decisions made pursuant to statutory provisions or implementing regulations that expressly make agency program decisions or technical determinations final;

(4) Decisions on equitable relief made by a State Conservationist or the Chief pursuant to Section 1613 of the Farm Security and Rural Investment Act of 2002, 7 U.S.C. 7996;

(5) Disapproval or denials of assistance due to lack of funding or lack of authority;

(6) Decisions that are based on technical information provided by another federal or State agency, *e.g.*, lists of endangered and threatened species; or

(7) Corrections by NRCS of errors in data entered on program contracts, easement documents, loan agreements, and other program documents.

(b) Complaints involving discrimination in program delivery are not appealable under this part and are handled under the existing USDA civil rights rules and regulations.

(c) Appeals related to contractual issues that are subject to the jurisdiction of the Agriculture Board of Contract Appeals are not appealable under the procedures within this part.

(d) Enforcement actions under conservation easement programs administered by NRCS.

§ 614.5 Reservation of authority.

The Secretary of Agriculture, the Chief of NRCS, if applicable, or a designee, reserve the right to make a determination at any time on any question arising under the programs covered under this part within their respective authority, including reversing or modifying in writing, with sufficient reason given therefore, any decision or technical determination made by an NRCS official.

§ 614.6 Agency records and decision notices.

(a) All NRCS decisions under this part are based upon an agency record. NRCS will supplement the agency record, as appropriate, during the informal appeals process.

(b) NRCS notifies participants of the agency's preliminary and final technical determinations and program decisions through decision notices. By certified mail return receipt requested, NRCS will send to the participant a decision notice within 10 working days of rendering a technical determination or program decision. In lieu of certified mail, NRCS may hand deliver notices to participants with written acknowledgment of delivery by the participant. Each decision notice contains the following:

- (1) The factual basis for the technical determination or program;
- (2) The regulatory, statutory, and/or policy basis for the technical determination or program decision; and
- (3) Information regarding any informal appeal rights available under this part; the process for requesting such appeal; and the procedure for requesting further review before the FSA county committee pursuant to 7 CFR 780 or NAD pursuant to 7 CFR part 11, if applicable.

§ 614.7 Preliminary technical determinations.

(a) A preliminary technical determination becomes final 30 days after the participant receives the decision, unless the participant files an appeal with the appropriate NRCS official as indicated in the decision notice requesting:

(1) Reconsideration with a field visit in accordance with paragraphs (b) and (c) of this section; or

(2) Mediation as set forth in § 614.11.

(b) If the participant requests reconsideration with a field visit, the designated conservationist, participant, and, at the option of the conservation district, a district representative will visit the subject site for the purpose of gathering additional information and discussing the facts relating to the preliminary technical determination. The participant may also provide any additional documentation to the designated conservationist. Within 15 days of the field visit, the designated conservationist, based upon the agency record as supplemented by the field visit and any participant submissions, will reconsider his or her preliminary technical determination. If the reconsidered determination is no longer adverse to the participant, the designated conservationist issues the reconsidered determination as a final technical determination. If the preliminary technical determination remains adverse, then the designated conservationist will forward the revised decision and agency record to the State Conservationist for a final determination pursuant to paragraph (c) of this section, unless further appeal is waived in writing by the participant in accordance with paragraph (d) of this section.

(c) The State Conservationist will issue a final technical determination to the participant as soon as is practicable after receiving the reconsideration and agency record from the designated conservationist. The technical determination issued by the State Conservationist becomes a final NRCS decision upon receipt by the participant. Receipt triggers the running of the 30 day appeal period to NAD, or, if applicable, to the FSA county committee.

(d) In order to address resource issues on the ground immediately, a participant may waive, in writing to the State Conservationist, appeal rights so that a preliminary technical decision becomes final before the expiration of the 30 day appeal period.

§ 614.8 Final technical determinations.

(a) Preliminary technical determinations become final and appealable:

§614.9

(1) 30 days after receipt of the preliminary technical decision by the participant unless the determination is appealed in a timely manner as provided for in this regulation.

(2) 30 calendar days after the beginning of a mediation session if a mutual agreement has not been reached by the parties; or

(3) Upon receipt by the participant of the final technical determination issued on reconsideration as provided above in §614.7(c).

(b) The participant may appeal the final technical determination to:

(1) The FSA county committee pursuant to 7 CFR part 780 if the determination is made under Title XII; or

(2) NAD pursuant to 7 CFR part 11.

§614.9 Program decisions.

(a) Program decisions are final upon receipt of the program decision notice by the participant. The participant has the following options for appeal of the program decision:

(1) An informal hearing before NRCS as provided for in paragraphs (b) through (d) of this section;

(2) Mediation as provided for at §614.11; or

(3) A hearing before NAD pursuant to 7 CFR part 11 or, if the program decision is made under Title XII, appeal before the FSA county committee pursuant to 7 CFR part 780.

(b) A program participant must file an appeal request for a hearing with the appropriate State Conservationist as indicated in the decision notice within 30 calendar days from the date the participant received the program decision.

(c) The State Conservationist may accept a hearing request that is untimely filed under paragraph (b) of this section if the State Conservationist determines that circumstances warrant such an action.

(d) The State Conservationist will hold a hearing no later than 30 days from the date that the appeal request was received. The State Conservationist will issue a written final NRCS decision no later than 30 days from the close of the hearing.

7 CFR Ch. VI (1–1–09 Edition)

§614.10 Appeals before the Farm Service Agency county committee.

(a) In accordance with 7 CFR part 780, a participant may appeal a final technical determination or a program decision to the FSA county committee for those decisions made under Title XII.

(b) When the FSA county committee hearing the appeal requests review of the technical determination by the applicable State Conservationist prior to issuing their decision, the State Conservationist will:

(1) Designate an appropriate NRCS official to gather any additional information necessary for review of the technical determination;

(2) Obtain additional oral and documentary evidence from any party with personal or expert knowledge about the facts under review;

(3) Conduct a field visit to review and obtain additional information concerning the technical determination; and

(4) After the actions set forth in paragraphs (b)(1) through (3) of this section are completed, provide the FSA county committee with a written technical determination in the form required by §614.6(b)(1) through (2) as well as a copy of the agency record.

§614.11 Mediation.

(a) A participant who wishes to pursue mediation must file request for mediation under this part with the NRCS official designated in the decision notice no later than 30 days after the date on which the decision notice was received. Participants in mediation may be required to pay fees established by the mediation program.

(b) A dispute will be mediated by a qualified mediator as defined at §614.2(p).

(c) The parties will have 30 days from the date of the first mediation session to reach a settlement agreement. The mediator will notify the State Conservationist whether the parties have reached an agreement.

(d) Settlement agreement reached during, or as a result of, the mediation process must be in writing, signed by all parties to the mediation, and comport with the statutory and regulatory provisions and policies governing the

program. In addition, the participant must waive all appeal rights as to the issues resolved by the settlement agreement.

(e) At the outset of mediation, the parties must agree to mediate in good faith. NRCS demonstrates good faith in the mediation process by, among other things:

(1) Designating an NRCS representative in the mediation;

(2) Making pertinent records available for review and discussion during the mediation; and

(3) To the extent the NRCS representative does not have authority to bind the agency, directing the NRCS representative to forward in a timely manner any written agreement proposed in mediation to the appropriate NRCS official for consideration.

(f) *Mediator impartiality.* (1) No person may serve as mediator in an adverse program dispute who has previously served as an advocate or representative for any party in the mediation.

(2) No person serving as mediator in an adverse program dispute may thereafter serve as an advocate for a participant in any other proceeding arising from or related to the mediated dispute, including, without limitation, representation of a mediation participant before an administrative appeals entity of USDA or any other Federal agency.

(g) *Confidentiality.* Mediation is a confidential process except for those limited exceptions permitted by the Administrative Dispute Resolution Act at 5 U.S.C. 574. All notes taken by participants (Mediator, Management Representative, Disputants, and Disputants' Representative) during the mediation must be destroyed. As a condition of participation, the participants and any interested parties joining the mediation must agree to the confidentiality of the mediation process. The parties to mediation, including the mediator, will not testify in administrative or judicial proceedings concerning the issues discussed in mediation, nor submit any report or record of the mediation discussions, other than the mediation agreement or the mediation report, except as required by law.

§ 614.12 Transcripts.

(a) No recordings shall be made of any hearing conducted under § 614.9. In order to obtain an official record of a hearing, a participant may obtain a verbatim transcript as provided in paragraph (b) of this section.

(b) Any party to an informal hearing appeal under § 614.9 may request that a verbatim transcript is made of the hearing proceedings and that such transcript is made the official record of the hearing. The party requesting a verbatim transcript must pay for the transcription service and provide a copy of the transcript to NRCS at no charge.

§ 614.13 Appealability review.

A participant may request a review of a decision denying an appeal based upon appealability by submitting a written request to the appropriate State Conservationist as indicated in the decision notice. This written request must be received by the State Conservationist within 30 calendar days from the date the participant received notice from NRCS that a decision was not appealable. The State Conservationist will render a decision on appealability within 30 days of receipt of the participant's review request. In the alternative, the participant may request review of the appealability decision by NAD pursuant to 7 CFR part 11.

§ 614.14 Computation of time.

(a) The word "days" as used in this part means calendar days, unless specifically stated otherwise.

(b) Deadlines for any action under this part, including deadlines for filing and decisions, which fall on a Saturday, Sunday, federal holiday or other day on which the relevant NRCS office is closed during normal business hours, will be extended to close of business the next working day.

§ 614.15 Implementation of final agency decisions.

No later than 30 days after an agency decision becomes a final administrative decision of USDA, NRCS will implement the decision.

§ 614.16**§ 614.16 Participation of third parties in NRCS proceedings.**

When an appeal is filed under this part, NRCS will notify any party third party whose interests may be affected of the right to participate as an appellant in the appeal. If the third party declines to participate then NRCS's de-

7 CFR Ch. VI (1-1-09 Edition)

cision will be binding as to that third party as if the party had participated.

§ 614.17 Judicial review.

A participant must receive a final determination from NAD pursuant to 7 CFR part 11 prior to seeking judicial review.